1	
2	X
3	THE CITY OF NEW YORK
4	DEPARTMENT OF SANITATION
5	PROPOSED RULE RELATING TO ENTITIES
6	ENGAGING IN CLEANING SERVICES
7	PUBLIC HEARING
8	X
9	
10	
11	
12	February 10, 2025 10:03 a.m.
13	Remotely via
14	Microsoft Teams
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	Julia M. Speros Court Reporter
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

2

1 2 A P P E A R A N C E S: 3 Madelynn Liguori, Esq. Director of Regulatory Compliance and 4 Enforcement Executive Agency Counsel 5 Department of Sanitation 6 7 8 TESTIMONY GIVEN BY THE FOLLOWING INDIVIDUALS: 9 Tom Harris, Times Square Alliance 10 Pedro Suarez, Third Avenue BID 11 Rob Byrnes, President, East Midtown Partnership 12 Dr. Camelia Tepelus, Executive Director, Morris Park Business Improvement District 13 Francesca Fernandez Bruce, Executive Director, 14 Grand Street BID Regina Myer, Downtown Brooklyn Partnership 15 Dirk McCall de Paloma, Executive Director, Sunnyside Shines Business Improvement District 16 17 Fred Cerullo, President/CEO, Grand Central Partnership 18 Matthew Bauer, President, Madison Avenue BID 19 Barbara Blair, Garment District Alliance 20 James Martin, Executive Director, ACE 21 Mark Dicus, Fifth Avenue BID 22 Layla Passman, Atlantic Avenue BID 23 24 25

3

1 2 TESTIMONY GIVEN BY THE FOLLOWING INDIVIDUALS: (Continued) 3 Ben Ackert, Senior Manager, Operations Planning 4 for the Downtown Alliance 5 Laura Rothrock, NYC BID Association 6 Patricia Maltezos, Planning and Development Director, Hudson Yards Hell s Kitchen Alliance 7 David Estrada, Executive Director, Sunset Park 5th Avenue BID 8 9 Jeffrey LeFrancois, Executive Director, Meatpacking District Management Association 10 Dan Scorse, Vice President of Operations, Hudson 11 Yards Hell s Kitchen Alliance 12 Corey Kunz, Senior VP, Hudson Square BID 13 Cordelia Persen, Executive Director, NoHo BID 14 Lauren Elvers Collins, Executive Director, Church-Flatbush Community Alliance 15 Kalvis Mikelsteins, VP, Planning and Operations, 16 Dumbo Improvement District 17 Cate Byrne on behalf of the Office of Council Member Aviles 18 Daniel Bernstein, Executive Director, 19 Columbus-Amsterdam Business Improvement District 20 James Ellis, Executive Director, North Flatbush Avenue BID 21 Albert Dalipi, Deputy Director, Fordham Road 22 Business Improvement District 23 24 25

4

1 2 TESTIMONY GIVEN BY THE FOLLOWING INDIVIDUALS: (Continued) 3 C. Virginia Fields, 125th Street Business 4 Improvement District 5 Tiera Mack, Executive Director of the Pitkin Avenue BID 6 Nate Reynolds, Clean Bushwick Initiative 7 Marta Schlitzer, Jackson Heights Beautification 8 Group Tree LC 9 Monica Blum, President, Lincoln Square BID 10 Catie Savage, Litter Legion 11 Allie Falco, Queens Trash 12 Noah Sheroff, Bayside Village BID 13 Claire Miflin, Center for Zero Waste Design 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

Г

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	MS. LIGUORI: Good morning and
3	welcome. My name is Madelynn Liguori.
4	I am the Director of Regulatory
5	Compliance and Enforcement and Executive
6	Agency Counsel for the Department of
7	Sanitation.
8	Thank you for attending the public
9	hearing this morning.
10	DSNY is conducting this remote
11	hearing in accordance with the
12	requirements of the City Administrative
13	Procedure Act. The purpose of this
14	hearing is to receive comments from the
15	public on DSNY's public rule relating to
16	commercial waste relating to entities
17	engaging in cleaning services.
18	This rule was published by DSNY in
19	The City Record on December 30, 2024,
20	with a scheduled hearing date of today,
21	February 10, 2025. Additionally, DSNY
22	mailed copies of the rule to all New
23	York City local-elected officials, the
24	City's 59 community boards, media and
25	interested parties, and published the

6

proposed rule on its website. 1 2 DSNY -- sorry. DSNY also engaged 3 with members of the regulated community 4 to discuss their operational concerns 5 regarding how they may be able to containerize waste. 6 7 Can I please ask everyone to mute 8 themselves? Thank you. 9 Section 16-120(e)(2) of the New York 10 City Administrative Code prohibits the 11 placement of households or commercial 12 refuse upon any sidewalk, street, public 13 place, wharf, pier, dock, bulkhead, 14 slip, navigable waterways or other 15 areas, whether publicly or privately 16 owned, except in accordance with the 17 rules of the Department relating to collection. 18 19 The purpose of this rule is to 20 clarify that any entity that performs or 21 causes others to perform cleaning 22 services, such as manual sweeping and 23 cleaning of sidewalks, public plazas, 24 streets, curbs, and gutters or emptying 25 of public litter baskets, for the

Γ

7

1	purposes of supporting local businesses
2	or communities, may not place any amount
3	of refuse or recycling within the
4	vicinity of any public litter basket or
5	at any other location described in
6	Section 16-120(e)(2) of the New York
7	City Administrative Code, except in
8	accordance with the rules of the
9	Department relating to collection.
10	The proposed rule also requires that
11	such materials be placed out for
12	collection by the Department in rigid
13	receptacles with tight-fitting lids. An
14	entity, for purposes of this rule, shall
15	mean any business improvement district,
16	merchants association, neighborhood
17	association, or other non-governmental
18	organization.
19	Any entity violating the prohibition
20	of placing any amount of refuse or
21	recycling out in bags for Department
22	collection within the vicinity of any
23	public litter basket, or for any other
24	reason at any other location described
25	in Section 16-120(e)(2) of the

Administrative Code, shall be subject to 1 2 the civil penalties for violations of Section 16-120(e)(2) of the 3 Administrative Code. 4 Bags of waste placed out on the 5 sidewalk attract rats and vermin. 6 These 7 changes align with the City's commitment 8 to cleaning up New York City streets and 9 reducing food sources for rents, and 10 aligns with the City's initiatives to 11 increase the use of containers for waste 12 storage and collection, creating 13 cleaner, more livable, and more vibrant 14 streets and neighborhoods across New 15 York City. 16 A court reporter is present today 17 and will record the hearing. You may 18 present an oral statement or submit 19 written comments concerning the rule. 20 We have been accepting written 21 comments on the proposed rule since it 22 was published. Today is the deadline for the submission of written comments. 23 24 Such comments may be emailed 25 directly to nycrules@dsny.nyc.gov by 5

9

1 p.m. today. 2 DSNY will make available a copy of all written comments received through 3 4 today, together with the hearing 5 transcript, for viewing on its website within the next few weeks. DSNY will 6 7 carefully consider all comments it receives today at the hearing and all 8 written comments it receives. 9 10 I will begin calling those of you 11 who wish to speak this morning in the 12 order in which you have signed up to 13 testify. 14 While the notice asks that persons 15 wishing to testify sign-up in advance of 16 this hearing, anyone wishing to testify 17 at this time may do so by indicating in 18 the chat area that you wish to testify 19 by indicating your name and affiliation, 20 if any. When you speak, please say your name and affiliation, and speak slowly 21 22 and clearly so that the court reporter 23 can understand and accurately record 24 your statement. 25 We also ask that you limit your

10

1 statement to three minutes since we have 2 many people that are signed-up to testify. If I ask you to finish up your 3 4 testimony, that means the three-minute 5 time period has ended. I'm going to begin by calling the 6 7 first person, Noah Sheroff from the Bayside Village BID. 8 9 Noah, are you on? 10 (No response.) 11 MS. LIGUORI: We are going to move 12 onto Andrew Yen from Clean Up Crown 13 Heights. 14 (No response.) 15 MS. LIGUORI: Andrew Yen from Clean 16 Up Crown Heights. 17 (No response.) 18 MS. LIGUORI: I will come back 19 around to these people after we finish 20 the list. 21 Okay. Mario Buonviaggio from Port Richmond Northshore Alliance. 22 23 (No response.) 24 MS. LIGUORI: Mario? 25 (No response.)

MS. LIGUORI: Okay. Alex Hunt from 1 2 The DOE Fund. UNKNOWN SPEAKER: The DOE Fund is 3 4 here, but not intending to testify 5 today. Good morning, everybody. 6 7 MS. LIGUORI: Okay. So, Mr. Hunt is not testifying then? 8 9 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: He's not -- no, 10 he's not testifying. MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 11 12 Okay -- okay. Tom Harris from the 13 Times Square Alliance. MR. HARRIS: Thank you very much. 14 My name is Tom Harris, President for 15 the Times Square Alliance. I want to 16 17 start by affirming our respect for the 18 men and women of the Department of 19 Sanitation who do a thankless job and I want to acknowledge them for their 20 21 dedication to the City. 22 I do want to comment specifically about these proposed rules, which create 23 an unfunded mandate for all BIDs to 24 25 containerize, and they impose monetary

1 fines for failing to comply. 2 In short, these rules show a lack of understanding of how BIDs work. 3 BIDs 4 are uniquely effective because each 5 district assesses its needs and dedicates resources accordingly. 6 Each 7 district and Board of Directors, not the 8 City or any City agency, determines 9 those needs. 10 BIDs supplement City services. They 11 don't replace them. While the 12 Department of Sanitation views these 13 rules as the City's next step in 14 containerization, the difference is, 15 other efforts were for commercial or 16 private garbage. 17 Garbage BIDs choose to collect 18 public garbage that is the 19 responsibility of the Department of 20 Sanitation. BIDs that are on the street 21 are there because the Department of Sanitation services do not meet the 22 23 City's demands. 24 The Alliance pioneered 25 containerization. We chose to do this

Г

1	because given the volume of our garbage
2	and our ability to remove it,
3	containerization makes Times Square
4	cleaner. We cannot support a policy
5	that issues a mandate that all business
6	improvement districts who pick up the
7	City's public garbage must comply or
8	risk monetary penalties.
9	Times Square pioneered and was able
10	to quickly adopt containerization
11	because we had the need, desire,
12	resources, and capacity to do so. The
13	vast majority of the 76 BIDs in the City
14	do not have that same ability, often
15	operating with minimal staff and with
16	budgets under one million dollars.
17	They are already stretched in their
18	efforts to keep their district clean,
19	safe, and desirable. These rules will
20	result in smaller BIDs, abandoning
21	sanitation services, and require the
22	Department of Sanitation to do more.
23	As for fines, the Alliance sweeps
24	streets, empties garbage cans,
25	containerizes that garbage, and

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	transports 100 percent of that public
2	garbage to sanitation garages. Our goal
3	is to have zero bags on the street and
4	99 percent of the time we achieve that
5	goal. The other one percent is often
6	because there was either more garbage
7	than normal or because someone dumped
8	garbage near our containers.
9	It is ridiculous to even consider
10	fining us for experiencing an unusually
11	heavy garbage day or for another entity
12	dumping at our locations.
13	We value our partnership with the
14	Department of Sanitation. True partners
15	compromise and work together to resolve
16	conflicts. They do not exert power
17	through punitive rules and mandates.
18	A clear acknowledgement of the
19	Department of Sanitation, valuing this
20	partnership, would be to rescind these
21	mandates and work with each BID to come
22	up with a shared vision for making each
23	neighborhood cleaner and bag-free.
24	Thank you.
25	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much,

1 Mr. Harris. 2 The next person we have is Pedro Suarez from the Third Avenue BID. 3 4 Mr. Suarez. 5 MR. SUAREZ: Yes, can everyone hear 6 me? 7 MS. LIGUORI: Yeah. MR. SUAREZ: Okay. Great. 8 9 My name is Pedro Suarez and I'm the 10 Executive Director of The Third Avenue 11 Business Improvement District, also known as "The Hub" in the South Bronx, 12 13 bordering the neighborhoods of Melrose 14 Mott Haven. I represent a community of 15 over 300 businesses over 18 block bases. As one of the oldest and most 16 17 heavily trafficked BIDs, our services 18 around supplemental sanitation represent 19 between 30 to 40 percent of our overall 20 annual budget. Our organization 21 provides supplemental sanitation 22 services that support the City's effort, 23 particularly the Department of 24 Sanitation, in keeping the district 25 clean.

1 Illegal dumping in the district has 2 put even more strain on our 3 organization's resources. 4 At the end of last year, we 5 conducted a walk-through of my district with the Council Member Rafael Salamanca 6 7 and former DSNY Commissioner Tisch to discuss the challenges around illegal 8 9 dumping and other quality of life 10 concerns, and the need for additional 11 DSNY cameras to conduct illegal dumping 12 investigations, which have only been 13 made more difficult through ghost plates 14 and difficult to catch these culprits. 15 I've met with containerization vendors such as CITIBIN and metroSTOR, 16 17 and the cost of implementing full 18 containerization would be approximately 19 20,000 to \$50,000 in our district. That 20 expense represents over 10 percent of 21 our annual City assessment. 22 We already have one set of eight containers and these containers have 23 often been --24 25 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: They just sent it

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 to me. 2 MR. SUAREZ: Sorry -- and these containers have often attracted unwanted 3 4 quality of life issues, including 5 homeless encampments, defecation, illegal dumping, and drug use. 6 7 We have to regularly report these issues to 211 and coordinate operations 8 with DSNY, NYPD, and DHS. We fear that 9 10 additional permanent containers would 11 provide similar challenges and we do not 12 have the storage space to have what they 13 call "rollie-bins". 14 I do not believe August 1, 2025 is a 15 realistic timeline for all BIDs to be 16 compliant with these rules, as we are in 17 the middle of our current fiscal year 18 and still have yet to plan our next 19 fiscal year, which requires Board input 20 and approval. 21 Additionally, BIDs only provide 22 supplemental sanitation, as stated, for 23 public waste that does not belong to 24 BIDs. As such, issuing fines to BIDs 25 providing public waste is not

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	appropriate.
2	We also recommend that DSNY work
3	with BIDs to establish set-out times and
4	DSNY collection schedules. BIDs should
5	not be receiving any fines outside of
6	established set-out times of DSNY
7	collection schedules and outside of our
8	normal operating hours. We are not 24/7
9	organizations.
10	I look forward to further
11	discussions with SBS, DSNY, DOT,
12	elected-officials in the Mayor's office
13	to create an implementation strategy
14	that is responsive to the needs of the
15	district and the people of the South
16	Bronx, but it cannot be August 1st.
17	Thank you.
18	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much,
19	Mr. Suarez.
20	Next person I have is Rob Byrnes,
21	the President of the East Midtown
22	Partnership.
23	Mr. Byrnes, are you on?
24	MR. BYRNES: I am. Thank you.
25	Good morning. As you noted, I'm Rob

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	Byrnes. I'm President of the East
2	Midtown Partnership, which is Manhattan
3	Business Improvement District, and I
4	want to thank you for the opportunity to
5	comment on the proposed rule.
6	Our BID was formed in 2002 to
7	specifically meet the cleanliness needs
8	of our community. Since then, we've
9	removed more than three million bags of
10	trash and recycling from district
11	streets. We spend almost two million
12	dollars a year it's almost half our
13	budget I should say about 1.5 million
14	dollars a year on sanitation.
15	The goals of DSNY are laudable, but
16	we're concerned that the accelerated
17	timeline will lead to flawed
18	implementation and dirtier streets
19	overall.
20	First, no BID president or executive
21	director has the power to unilaterally
22	design and place containers on the
23	streets, or to appropriate the tens or
24	hundreds we estimate hundreds of
25	thousands of dollars this project will

1 cost for us. We would need the 2 cooperation of our Board of Directors and other stakeholders. 3 4 And -- but, however, unilateral 5 action would be the only way to roll-out a major project of this type in just a 6 7 few months. Frankly, manufacturing alone will 8 9 take most of the time period between now 10 and August 1st, resulting in a rush 11 decision-making process and we also need 12 to do this in the middle of a fiscal 13 year. 14 When our BID adopted our FY 2025 15 budget last May, we had no idea an 16 expensive project like this was not only 17 going to be a mandate from City Hall, 18 but would also require us to find 19 funding for it in the middle of a budget 20 year. 21 If the implementation date were 22 moved to 2026, most BIDs would be able 23 to properly design, budget for, and 24 implement a waste containerization 25 program. In addition, at minimum, the

Г

1	City should allocate funding for small
2	BIDs and other smaller organizations,
3	which might otherwise have to end their
4	sanitation programs altogether due to
5	this new expense.
6	When it comes to BID waste
7	containerization program, we can do it
8	quickly and in a slip-shot manner or we
9	can do this thoughtfully and properly.
10	I look forward to a program that
11	continue that works for everyone and
12	proves to the nation that New York City
13	continues to lead the way in innovative
14	public improvement.
15	I have additional remarks in my
16	written testimony. Thank you very much
17	for this opportunity.
18	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much,
19	Mr. Byrnes.
20	The next up we have is Dr. Camelia
21	Tepelus, the Executive Director of the
22	Morris Park Business Improvement
23	District.
24	MS. TEPELUS: Good morning,
25	Madelynn. Good morning, everybody.

Γ

1	Let me just start by giving a huge
2	shout-out of thanks to the hard working
3	people of DSNY that clear Morris Park
4	Avenue. Absolutely wonderful from
5	from Saturday to Sunday. Kudos to
6	Vincent Allard, our Superintendent, and
7	to Frank Lettera for trying to figure
8	this out together with us.
9	I just want to say, this was a
10	mandate that we all agree with in
11	principle. Nobody wants to see plastic
12	bags at the corner of our streets.
13	However, this is also a mandate that
14	tells us, "Make the trash disappear by
15	magic". Nothing happens by magic. Does
16	cleaning in your own home happen by
17	magic no. Somebody neatly puts the
18	trash together and somebody takes it
19	away someplace. It's not magic.
20	It is it is careful planning,
21	coordination, analysis, and finally,
22	execution that costs money.
23	It is critical to remember that even
24	though we BIDs are privately-funded by
25	commercial property owners, at the end

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Γ

1	of the day and just like our friends
2	at DSNY we are providing a public
3	service; a service ensuring that
4	commercial corridors create a positive
5	pedestrian shopping experience and bring
6	taxpayers' money to the budget of our
7	beloved City.
8	We are now paralyzed knowing that we
9	will not afford to transport the trash
10	ourselves, which is, one, the mandate of
11	your agency of DSNY; and, second,
12	would be both unaffordable and cause us
13	to cut other critical programs
14	beautification, community events,
15	holiday lights, etcetera that make
16	our City the vibrant city that we have.
17	At the moment, what we are doing is
18	basically stacking our existing trash
19	cans, like, literally like this
20	(indicating), as much as possible, and
21	hope that this will be sufficient due to
22	the awful traffic in the cold weather.
23	But come summer, we will need a
24	procedure and a process agreed with
25	DSNY, and especially with DOT.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 I mean, if you want to compare us 2 with something, do not compare us with individual businesses. I have 21 3 4 blocks. I have 80 corners. I mean, you 5 need to provide me with -- if you want me to compare BID public trash with an 6 7 entity, compare me with a large apartment building or with a school --8 9 and you do provide these type of 10 wonderful containers that could -- I 11 mean, you -- I don't know if you see 12 (indicating) -- you know what I mean --13 the large Empire bins, which by 14 agreement with DSNY and DOT, we could 15 place at some point and instruct our 16 staff to place there the excessive 17 trash. 18 This mandate is feasible, but this 19 regulation is poorly written. It's over-simplifying and it's showing --20 21 also, may I say -- a certain level of 22 disrespect to the work we are doing to 23 support the City, to collect taxpayers' 24 funding that comes to create this 25 wonderful this -- wonderful place where

1 we're living. 2 Finally, we are here to support cleanness in the City, alongside working 3 4 with DSNY in smart, data-driven ways to make this reality possible. No more 5 plastic bags in New York City commercial 6 7 corridors. We are optimistic that, 8 together, we can devise a strategy that 9 is optimally applicable to each 10 commercial corridors' needs. 11 Please allow at least one more year 12 until August 2026 to improve this rule and to give us sufficient time to 13 14 articulate -- along with your 15 operational teams -- DSNY mechanisms for implementation to the desired aim of 16 17 this regulation that we fully support. 18 But we feel that, along with the 19 DSNY, we can be smarter -- smarter about cleaning our commercial corridors from 20 21 plastic bags. 22 So, once again, I thank you all and I genuinely beg for the understanding of 23 24 -- how to say -- of the partnership that 25 we have going on that make this City the

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

capital of the world. 1 2 Thank you. 3 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. Next we have is Francesca Fernandez 4 5 Bruce, the Executive Director of the Grand Street BID. 6 7 MS. BRUCE: Hi. Good morning. Ι 8 hope everyone can hear me. Thank you so 9 much for taking the time to listen 10 today. 11 Yes, my name is Francesca Bruce and 12 I direct the Grand Street BID, which 13 serves an LMI community in East Williamsburg, really, at the frontier of 14 15 some of the most powerful pressures of 16 redevelopment, and displacement, and 17 shifting policy in the City. 18 And this means that we're constantly 19 juggling priorities on a completely 20 maxed-out budget, which we can't raise 21 without adding to these pressures on our 22 neighbors -- on our mom-and-pops and small businesses -- and on families 23 trying to afford a place to live and we 24 25 also can't raise it within the timeframe

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	allotted.
2	Further, we have a budget of around
3	350,000, nearly a third of which already
4	goes to clearing a never-ending flow of
5	public litter and choking debris on the
6	street that does not, in fact, come from
7	the BID, but supplements the DSNY's own
8	work.
9	And so when we received this
10	ruling which, by the way, solves
11	nothing in our district since our
12	problems are not predominantly rats, but
13	structural our hearts really sank.
14	DSNY implies that we need to sort of
15	pull our own weight, but we're really
16	doing the job of the agency collecting
17	public trash that they can't keep up
18	with so that our community can thrive,
19	and the rule pretends to be agnostic
20	about solutions, but instead is sort of
21	willfully deaf to the lack of solutions.
22	The supposed affordable wheelie-bins
23	are really just a straw-man. They're
24	both inadequate to the task at hand and
25	truly impossible to implement.

Г

1	Meanwhile, the CITIBINs, the only other
2	option DSNY has really shared with us,
3	could nearly double our sanitation costs
4	in the first year, including
5	installation and maintenance of
6	equipment and protections. This is not
7	accounting for any issues around
8	procurement or otherwise.
9	So, we really simply can't afford to
10	comply with this policy presently,
11	putting us in an impossible situation.
12	We are either to stop providing the
13	supplementary service that allows our
14	corridor to be marginally functional for
15	living and working, or slash nearly
16	every other supportive program in our
17	budget.
18	This unfunded and imminent mandate
19	will cripple our organization, and our
20	corridor, and our community, and
21	something really, truly has to give.
22	So, I urge you, please, to consider
23	alternatives presented by my colleagues
24	so that we can continue our service to
25	our community in these really

29

1 challenging times. 2 Thank you so much. 3 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 4 The next we have to testify is 5 Regina Meyer from the Downtown Brooklyn Partnership. 6 7 (No response.) MS. LIGUORI: Okay. Dirk McCall de 8 Paloma, the Executive Director --9 10 MS. MYER: Hello --11 MS. LIGUORI: Hello? MS. MYER: Hello? 12 MS. LIGUORI: Yeah --13 14 MS. MYER: I'm here -- I'm here. 15 MS. LIGUORI: Oh, Regina -- Oh, Ms. 16 Myer -- okay. 17 MS. MYER: Yes, I'm sorry. 18 MS. LIGUORI: Okay. 19 MS. MYER: Okay. Hi. I'm Regina Meyer, President of the Downtown 20 21 Brooklyn Partnership. I truly 22 appreciate this opportunity to testify. 23 The Downtown Brooklyn Partnership 24 manages three business improvement 25 districts that cover the entirety of

30

1	
1	Downtown Brooklyn, including some of the
2	City's most highly trafficked traffic
3	commercial quarters, such as Fulton Mall
4	and popular attractions, like Barclays
5	Center, the Brooklyn Paramount, and the
6	Brooklyn cultural district.
7	The neighborhood is home to 65,000
8	residents, 35,000 university students,
9	and 85,000
10	UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Regina, you're
11	cutting out from me.
12	MS. MYER: I'm
13	UNKNOWN SPEAKER: You're cutting out
14	for me. I'm not able to hear you
15	anymore.
16	UNKNOWN SPEAKER: I can hear you
17	just fine.
18	MS. LIGUORI: I believe we all can
19	hear her. Maybe it's maybe you might
20	want to just redo your audio.
21	MS. MYER: Can you hear me hello?
22	MS. LIGUORI: Yes yes, you are
23	clear.
24	MS. MYER: Okay okay.
25	Okay. Thank you.

1 To stay on top of the enormous waste 2 that is a byproduct of our busy streets, DBP operates two dedicated tricks --3 4 trucks and crews that manage the 5 collections from 11 staging locations, 167 Bigbelly solar trash units, and 41 6 7 street cans. 8 Each day these crews transport 550 9 bags of 22,000 gallons of street trash 10 from Downtown Brooklyn directly to DSNY 11 at their depot in Gowanus. We undertake 12 this enormous amount of work to fill the 13 gaps of DSNY's services. We truly 14 appreciate that they are doing as much 15 as they can, but we recognize that we 16 must perform this supplemental service. 17 While DBP supports the moves toward 18 containerization, the proposed rule as 19 written would push the expense of compliance and threatens fines on BIDs 20 21 and neighborhood associations who are 22 providing public services at little or 23 no cost to the City. 24 Additionally, the requirement to 25 containerize trash runs against the fact

32

1	that we do not have site control or
2	storage facilities and we don't have the
3	ability to approve or occupy sidewalks
4	or parking lanes for trash containers,
5	24/7.
6	In the meantime, the Partnership has
7	made significant strides in starting to
8	containerize trash, implementing
9	curbside containers at a few locations
10	through DSNY's wise Clean Curbs grant.
11	Recently, we secured approval for an
12	additional site and are collaborating
13	with DSNY to enhance service levels,
14	optimizing the efficiency of our
15	supplemental sanitation efforts in
16	Downtown Brooklyn.
17	We want to help continue to help
18	keeping the City clean and keeping our
19	streets beautiful, but we should not be
20	penalized for doing the work that
21	that DSNY doesn't have the capacity to
22	do.
23	We urge Sanitation to continue to
24	work with the BIDs as partners so we can
25	achieve solutions to make neighborhoods

1 cleaner and bag free. 2 Thank you. MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 3 4 The next to testify is Dirk McCall de Paloma, the Executive Director of the 5 Sunnyside Shines Business Improvement 6 7 District. She will be followed by Fred 8 9 Cerullo, the President and CEO of the 10 Grand Central Partnership, or if he's 11 not available, Ryan Pukos. 12 MR. McCALL DE PALOMA: Hi. Thank 13 you for this opportunity to comment on 14 the proposed rule. My name is Dirk 15 McCall de Paloma and I'm the Executive 16 Director of the Sunnyside Shines 17 Business Improvement District in Queens. 18 This is an incredibly important 19 topic and I think we're all in agreement 20 that containerization is a good 21 approach, and one that will be helpful 22 as we combat rats and keep our commercial corridors clean. I do want 23 24 to express alarm and dismay, however, at the timeline and how this is going to 25

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

impact smaller BIDs across the City. 1 2 Sunnyside Shines covers 11 blocks north and south of Queens Boulevard, 3 4 from 38th Street to 50th Street, and the first six blocks of Green Point Avenue, 5 as well as the first block of Roosevelt 6 7 Avenue. Our assessment is only 360,000 annually. We're not one of the smallest 8 9 BIDs, but neither are we well financed. 10 We work hard to identify additional 11 funding streams to augment our 12 assessment and allow us to do work to 13 serve our commercial corridors and 14 communities. Like the majority of BIDs 15 in the City, we contract out our street sanitation work. We work with 16 17 Streetplus, and have since our formation 18 of 2008, and our street team clean are 19 very good at sweeping up and emptying 20 the trash cans along Queens Boulevard 21 and Green Point Avenue. 22 We work hard to keep our sidewalks and street-bed litter free and to 23 24 prevent our merchants from being fined 25 for trash.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Γ

1	Our corridors are very restaurant
2	and food/drink venue heavy and our trash
3	cans fill up very quickly. We have to
4	pay quick attention to them and often
5	have to empty them twice a day.
б	We estimate that containerization
7	would cost us over 50,000; money that's
8	not currently in our budget. This is a
9	great goal, but there's no mechanism for
10	the City to help fund the purchase of
11	CITIBIN containers or metroSTOR
12	containers, and no proposal on how we're
13	supposed to increase the number of our
14	sanitation crew to move that bagged
15	trash to other locations.
16	We're not opposed to finding a way
17	to make this work, but we need funding
18	streams that allow us to implement these
19	plans while continuing our other work.
20	We are very successful in getting
21	money from the City of the State, but
22	even if we're successful in getting this
23	funding, the budget money will not even
24	be contracted by August, let alone in
25	September, when the fines are scheduled

1 to begin. 2 If the implementation were able to be delayed by a year to late 2026, most 3 4 of us would probably likely be able to 5 find some support to find ways to start implementing this. 6 7 But like many unfunded mandates, the goals are laudatory, but goals that are 8 9 laudatory without any ability to pay for 10 them is really problematic and we urge 11 DSNY to delay this. 12 Thank you. 13 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 14 Our next to speak is Fred Cerullo, 15 the President and CEO of the Grand Central Partnership, and if he's not 16 17 here, Ryan Pukos --18 MR. CERULLO: Thank you. 19 MS. LIGUORI: -- okay. Great. 20 Thank you. 21 MR. CERULLO: Hi -- thank you. This is Fred Cerullo. 22 As an organization that dedicates 23 24 over 80,000 staff-hours annually to 25 sanitation and collects and prepares

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	almost 200,000 bags of municipal waste
2	generated by the public, the Grand
3	Central Partnership clearly understands
4	the impact that garbage disposal has on
5	quality of life in our communities.
6	As a consequence, GCP has also made
7	significant investments in operations
8	and technology to reduce the time trash
9	bags remain on the curb awaiting the
10	Department of Sanitation pick-up.
11	GCP strongly supports the goals of
12	containerization. In fact, we worked
13	years ago with stakeholders to develop a
14	similar plan, albeit unsuccessful at the
15	time, to remove public trash bags from
16	the sidewalks and store them in
17	centralized containers on private
18	property.
19	However, this proposed rule is
20	highly problematic, and, frankly,
21	insulting for several reasons.
22	First, to reiterate, this is not our
23	private waste. It is the municipal
24	waste generated by the public. GCP
25	simply sweeps it, bags it, and prepares

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 it for eventual pick-up by DSNY, or a 2 private carter we privately fund, to 3 support New York's strongest, preventing 4 overflowing garbage receptacles and 5 dirty streets. Treating entities like GCP as 6 7 illegal dumpers is a slap in the face to 8 all BIDs and the long-standing 9 partnership we have had with the City in 10 supplementing core services that it 11 cannot fully provide itself. 12 Since the 1980s, BIDs have partnered with the City to fill critical gaps in 13 14 City services and bring sanitation 15 standards to an acceptable level. ТΟ 16 impose financial penalties on BIDs for 17 simply providing services that DSNY is 18 ultimately responsible for is 19 outrageous. 20 Another critical issue is the 21 one-size fits all approach to the rule 22 process. Each BID has its own unique 23 character, with different types of 24 building density, foot traffic, and 25 waste generation. A rigid rule that

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	does not account for these differences
2	is likely to be difficult to implement
3	and will have unintended consequences.
4	Finally, the most complicated hurdle
5	that GCP and other BIDs have to overcome
6	involves actually siting of these
7	containers. Our desire to comply with
8	detailed regulations issued by two City
9	agencies governing the size and
10	materials of containers in the
11	permissible locations that can be
12	installed have not aligned with our
13	ability to find suitable locations that
14	do not obstruct and block commercial and
15	retail businesses in our community
16	and even if GCP and other BIDs located
17	private but readily accessible locations
18	for the containers, it's unclear whether
19	DSNY would service them.
20	Enforcement of the recently launched
21	business containerization program has
22	been inconsistent. More time and
23	resources should be dedicated to fully
24	implementing and evaluating these
25	initiatives, instead of penalizing BIDs

Г

1	for stepping in to provide crucial
2	sanitation services and we urge DSNY to
3	focus on refining existing programs and
4	learning from those experiences and
5	continuing to collaborate with BIDs.
6	In conclusion, while
7	containerization has merit, the way this
8	policy has been rolled out has been
9	horrendous. Any rule penalizing BIDs
10	for doing this work should be stopped
11	and we implore DSNY to reconsider its
12	approach and work with us to find
13	solutions that balance the needs of our
14	neighborhoods with the City's goals
15	without penalty to their partners.
16	Thank you.
17	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you, Mr.
18	Cerullo.
19	Next up is Matthew Bauer and just
20	so everyone knows, I am putting in the
21	next five speakers. The next five
22	speakers are already listed in the
23	comment section in the chat section.
24	Matthew Bauer, the President of the
25	Madison Avenue BID.

1 MR. BAUER: Good morning, everyone. 2 I'm Matthew Bauer, President of the Madison Avenue BID. I'm also the 3 4 treasurer of the New York City BID Association. 5 I just want to lend our support, of 6 7 course, to the BIS Association's testimony, which is being delivered 8 9 separately. 10 We also share thanks to the men and 11 women of the Department of Sanitation 12 for their terrific work, and we, of 13 course, share everyone's goals for 14 removing bags on the street. 15 With that said, I think, you know, 16 one of the really big losers in this 17 proposed rule would be the businesses 18 and property owners that are at the 19 corners of our districts. You know, folks are constantly 20 21 dumping trash -- sometimes properly, 22 sometimes improperly -- at these cans. 23 They overflow and it's our work to try 24 to neaten them up and make it look 25 suitable for customers -- for the

42

-	
1	community at the corners.
2	There's absolutely no way that this
3	enforcement of, you know, dumping or
4	where a pick-up can be constantly
5	happening throughout the day. So, if
6	we're not doing this work, and if we're
7	not, we're going to see bags
8	overflowing. You're going to see debris
9	on the sidewalks and potentially
10	businesses on the corners will
11	unfortunately may have to be result
12	in fines for the sidewalk debris all
13	because of dumping that may happen from
14	elsewhere that businesses have no fault
15	at.
16	So, therefore, we really do want to
17	encourage DSNY to reconsider this
18	rule-making in continuing with the work
19	in partnership with business improvement
20	districts to make sure that our corners
21	are as clean and as beautiful as they
22	can be.
23	Thank you so much.
24	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you.
25	The next up to testify, Barbara

1 Blair or Jerry Scupp from the Garment 2 District Alliance. MS. BLAIR: Yes, hello. Good 3 4 morning. I'm Barbara Blair, President 5 of the Garment District Alliance, a BID in Midtown Manhattan. 6 7 I'm responding to DSNY regarding -regarding containerization rules that 8 9 will negatively impact BIDs and 10 undermine our collaborative 11 relationship. 12 The Garment District supports the 13 City's effort to reduce unsightly and unsanitary garbage on our sidewalks and 14 15 rat mitigation. The new rules proposed 16 by DSNY are prejudicial in that they unfairly target BID districts with a 17 18 burdensome cost to do the City's work, 19 while non-BID areas are unaffected. 20 This ploy smacks of opportunism and 21 the lack of respect for the intended 22 purpose of a public/private partnership. 23 The Garment District voluntarily 24 provides supplementary neighborhood sanitation services to the City's 25

1	existing municipal DSNY service. It is
2	clearly stated in our contract with the
3	City that the City cannot reduce
4	services in BID districts unless it's
5	being reduced citywide.
6	It's an affront to require the BID
7	businesses and property owners to
8	privately pay for standard DSNY
9	containers that are otherwise provided
10	throughout the rest of the City. A BID
11	may opt, at its own cost, to provide
12	non-standard waste receptacles, but we
13	cannot pay for City receptacles or face
14	penalties for not providing them.
15	The GDA objects to undertaking
16	responsibility for mapping locations of
17	the proposed shared containers, but we
18	welcome working with DSNY on the siting.
19	We strenuously object to the
20	proposal that we would face fines for
21	leaving bags of garbage on street
22	corners for DSNY collection. The
23	contents of the bags that we place on
24	corners are publicly generated street
25	litter that GDA sweeps up at the

Γ

1	discretion of our Board to improve the
2	neighborhood.
3	In meetings with DSNY, we have been
4	assured that they do not or you do not
5	intend to egregiously impose fines. If
6	that is the case, then please remove
7	that potential sanction from the rules.
8	Like all BIDs, we want clean
9	streets. We currently spend
10	five-and-a-half million dollars a year
11	on sanitation, supplying labor,
12	equipment, and bags to have public waste
13	removed from the City's waste
14	receptacles and carted away.
15	The neighborhood benefits, but so
16	does the City, and the tens of thousands
17	of commuters and tourists who are
18	passing through daily. This service is
19	provided at the discretion of the Board
20	of Directors which understands and
21	values the importance of cleanliness.
22	To turn this voluntary contribution
23	towards making a City better our City
24	better into a punishable requirement
25	is unconscionable and a contract

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 violation. 2 Thank you for the opportunity to testify. 3 4 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. And someone just asked in the 5 comments, if you would like to testify, 6 7 you may indicate so in the chat. You will be added to the list. 8 9 The next person to testify is James 10 Martin, the Executive Director of ACE. 11 MR. MARTIN: Good morning. My name 12 is Jim Martin. I'm the Executive Director of ACE New York. 13 14 I'd just like to quickly acknowledge 15 the men and women who staff our City BIDs and supplemental sanitation 16 17 providers like ACE. These are the folks 18 that are doing this work every day and I 19 commend them for that work. 20 As you know, ACE partners with the 21 City Council each year to provide 22 supplemental sanitation services in over 40 council districts across the five 23 24 boroughs. We remove in excess of one 25 million full garbage bags a year from

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 City streets. 2 I testify today to express our 3 strong opposition to the proposed policy 4 prohibiting supplemental service 5 providers, like ACE, from placing collected garbage bags next to DSNY 6 7 public waste receptacles so that DSNY trucks can collect them. 8 9 This policy part of our City's 10 containerization initiative will 11 significantly impact ACE's ability to 12 provide essential supplemental 13 sanitation services in our great city. 14 After consulting with DSNY, we have 15 learned that the proposed policy will require ACE, a nonprofit, to adopt one 16 17 or two expensive solutions to adhere or 18 receive punitive fines beginning August 19 1st. 20 Our options will be to either 21 purchase and install permanent trash 22 containers -- CITIBINs -- to store full 23 garbage bags for DSNY removal or to 24 purchase garbage trucks -- a fleet of 25 them -- to remove bags from the street

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	because these containers and garbage
2	trucks would be ACE's responsibility
3	or the responsibility of the City
4	Council, the folks who fund ACE every
5	year for supplemental sanitation
б	services in their district.
7	An analysis has revealed that in
8	order to comply with this policy, ACE, a
9	nonprofit, would need to purchase and
10	install in excess of 230 containers at
11	an estimated cost between four and five
12	million dollars all over the City, in
13	all five boroughs.
14	We estimate the cost of purchasing,
15	ensuring, and staffing a fleet of
16	garbage trucks to service all ACE
17	routes, seven days a week, 352 days a
18	year, would exceed four-and-a-half
19	million dollars.
20	ACE is unable to afford these
21	expenses, and should these expenses be
22	passed on to our City Council partners,
23	the expense would basically eliminate
24	any ACE sanitation allocations,
25	resulting in the elimination of ACE

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 sanitation services in most, if not all, 2 council districts that we currently 3 serve. 4 Ultimately, the burden of this 5 policy may result in ACE closing its doors after 33 years of service to New 6 7 York City, both as a workforce 8 development program and a very well 9 regarded supplemental sanitation 10 provider -- meaning, 165 men and women 11 who staff our sanitation crews will lose 12 their jobs. 13 These men and women have overcome 14 homelessness, incarceration, and 15 addiction, and the job that this 16 partnership has created has given them a 17 lifeline to help them begin their 18 journey towards economic independence. 19 In closing, the extraordinary 20 financial burden and additional 21 responsibilities that come with 22 containerization will severely impede 23 ACE's ability to do the supplemental 24 sanitation work that we have long done 25 in partnership with the City Council.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 Make no mistake, this policy is an 2 existential threat to our organization, 3 the men and women that we serve, and 4 will result in more trash on City 5 streets, not less. ACE is truly grateful for our 6 7 long-standing partnership with DSNY and the City Council. We share great pride 8 in the work that we have done over the 9 10 last 10 years and we hope to do more. 11 I urge the Department of Sanitation 12 to not allow containerization to put an 13 end to our good work. Thank you. 14 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 15 The next up is Mark Dicus from the Fifth Avenue BID. 16 17 MR. DICUS: Hi. Good morning. Мy 18 name is Mark Dicus. I'm the Vice 19 President of Operations and Planning at 20 the Fifth Avenue Association. 21 Thank you for holding this hearing 22 today on the proposed DSNY rules that 23 would require BIDs starting on August 1, 24 2025 to place public litter bags of 25 garbage in rigid containers to be

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	collected by Department of Sanitation or
2	a private carting company.
3	The Fifth Avenue Association
4	currently handles over 40,000 bags of
5	garbage per year that come from our
б	public litter baskets.
7	We share the City's goal of getting
8	bags off the street and we are eager to
9	work in partnership with Sanitation to
10	achieve that goal. However,
11	implementing these changes are
12	significant and call for the investment
13	of tens of thousands of dollars of
14	materials and staff time to implement.
15	Since the Council hearing in
16	November on this topic, Association
17	staff have begun preparing for the end
18	of the decades' long practice of placing
19	bags of public litter basket waste next
20	to public trash receptacles for
21	collection.
22	We start started collecting and
23	mapping bag count data. We've
24	considered a variety of different
25	solutions ranging from different

1 container options to changes to our 2 collection operation. 3 We started to think about how many 4 and the size containers needed, 5 potential locations where we might be able to site them in the public space; 6 7 considered operational changes that would be needed, and estimated -- beyond 8 9 estimating the cost to implement these 10 changes. 11 Last week, we had a very productive 12 meeting with Department of Sanitation to 13 learn how the agency is able to help 14 BIDs implement these changes and come 15 into compliance with these proposed rules. 16 17 But we share this goal. We need the 18 City's continued partnership to 19 implement these changes to achieve these 20 important shared goals. To accelerate 21 compliance, here's how the City --22 here's how the City could help: 23 To accelerate compliance, the City 24 should provide funds to bring down the 25 cost -- or make these no cost -- to

Г

1	purchase containers for small and medium
2	sized BIDs and work with BIDs to
3	implement lower cost solutions.
4	The City needs to provide more
5	assistance when it comes to siting
6	containers in their district. The
7	siting guidelines are currently too
8	rigid. They need to be more flexible on
9	where containers can be sited in the
10	public realm.
11	For example, the guidelines for the
12	Clean Curbs program prohibit siting of a
13	container in lane used as travel lanes,
14	for example, curb lanes that are used as
15	parking and travel lanes using no
16	standing parking regulations at
17	different times of day. In our
18	district, no standing parking lane
19	regulations remove several blocks as
20	potential container sites.
21	In meeting with the City, we learned
22	that there may be some flexibility with
23	this guideline, which would be
24	enormously useful.
25	We also need the partnership of DOT

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

to clarify the approval process and 1 2 streamline it so that sites are approved 3 in a timely manner. 4 August 1st is less than six months 5 away and the final rule has not yet been adopted. Six months is an insufficient 6 7 amount of time to plan and implement these transformational, important 8 9 changes. 10 Please push out the deadline by a 11 year or two to give BIDs sufficient lead 12 time to plan for and implement solutions 13 that comply with these requirements. 14 This would take pressure off both BIDs 15 and the City to implement solutions that are rushed and incomplete to achieve 16 17 this important shared goal. 18 Thank you for considering this 19 testimony. 20 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 21 Next is Layla Passman from the Atlantic Avenue BID. 22 MS. PASSMAN: Hello. I'm Layla 23 24 Passman. I'm the Community Engagement 25 Coordinator for the Atlantic Avenue BID.

1 The Atlantic Avenue BID represents 2 over 300 businesses along Atlantic Avenue and the side streets in the 3 4 Brooklyn neighborhoods of Brooklyn 5 Heights, Cobble Hill, Boerum Hill, and Downtown Brooklyn. 6 7 We urge the committee not to adopt this text amendment, as it puts the 8 9 function of all BIDs in peril. Business 10 improvement districts are independent 11 non-profits that report to Board of 12 Directors. 13 The Atlantic Avenue BID has an 14 annual budget of \$390,000, a third of 15 which goes to a sanitation contractor 16 who provides services and supplement to 17 DSNY. Our contractor does the work that 18 DSNY cannot do because the agency has 19 limited capacity and funding. 20 If we were -- if we were to use our 21 budget to comply with this text 22 amendment, we would have to cut from all of our other services. This would mean 23 24 no lights during the holidays, no open 25 streets programs, and little support for

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	our small businesses, all so that our
2	trash bags will be filled with the
3	public trash and not be subjected to
4	fines.
5	As a result, our organization may
6	need to stop sanitation services
7	altogether, falling out of line with our
8	mission and causing trash to take over
9	our corridor. Our organization simply
10	does not have the funds to execute and
11	maintain this compliance.
12	In addition to the strain on the
13	BIDs' capacity, this mandate would be
14	logistically impossible for our
15	organization. The proposed rules do not
16	specify how to containerize the trash
17	and which bins we're supposed to use.
18	In addition, siting these bins would
19	cause major issues. Not only do we not
20	have the funds to purchase the bins for
21	the corridor, but we also don't have the
22	place for the bins and they're the
23	bins that we do have are constantly
24	being stolen and they need to be
25	replaced very often.

1 So, even if the fining penalty were 2 eliminated, the burden of compliance would weigh too heavily on our 3 4 organizations. BIDs -- BIDS have been strong 5 partners of the City and have helped 6 7 make New York a desirable place to live, 8 work, and shop, and to penalize BIDs for 9 doing the work that DSNY cannot do is a 10 betrayal of the fruitful relationship 11 between BIDs and the City of New York. 12 If the goal of this amendment is to 13 curb rat populations on our City 14 streets, let's work together to 15 accomplish it by designating set-out times and using the new residential 16 17 containers. 18 Thank you. 19 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you. 20 Next we have is Ben Ackert, the 21 Senior Manager, Operations Planning for the Downtown Alliance. 22 MR. ACKERT: Hi -- here. 23 Good morning, chiefs and Sanitation 24 25 Department staff. I'm Ben Ackert,

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Senior Manager in Operations at the 1 2 Downtown Alliance. The Downtown Alliance BID is roughly 3 4 the area south of Brooklyn Bridge to the 5 Battery from West Street to the East River. The district is the City's 6 7 second largest central business district. 8 9 Today, it is home to nearly 90 10 million square feet of commercial real 11 estate, over 230,000 private sector 12 employees, 67,000 residents, nearly 13 1,100 storefront businesses, and over 9 14 million visitors annually. 15 Given these sizable figures, the district generates significant waste 16 17 daily. In fiscal year '24 we collected 18 over 1,000 tons of trash and over 324 19 tons of recyclables. Between the 178 20 Bigbelly trash compactors and the trash 21 cleaned up by our street sweepers, our 22 sanitation crew is managing nearly 600 23 bags a day. 24 The Alliance has long advocated for 25 the City to better manage its waste and

believes containerization is a positive 1 2 step forward in this effort. 3 In 2022, we were asked by then 4 Commissioner Tisch to pilot the 5 containerization of public trash in partnership with the Department. 6 By 7 November of 2023, we sited six CITIBIN 8 containers, with DOT approval, and began 9 to operate our trash collection fully 10 containerized in collaboration with 11 DSNY. 12 Since then, DSNY has provided 13 pick-up service to the bins three times 14 a day. This level of collection service 15 has been essential for us to be able to do our work and be successful. If this 16 17 schedule were to be disrupted for any 18 reason, it would lead to serious 19 operational challenges that would make 20 it nearly impossible for the program to 21 function properly. 22 We do not have control over where 23 the bins are currently placed, nor can 24 approve new spots. Siting locations for 25 the current six containers was an

1 arduous task. 2 As you know, Lower Manhattan is a narrow street grid that regularly 3 4 undergoes construction work and 5 development projects. That led us to lose a site at one point and made it 6 7 quite challenging to find a new approved location. 8 9 Despite the Department being very 10 helpful in this process, we know it 11 might not be possible to find new 12 locations. We are concerned that if 13 this were to happen again, the Alliance 14 would face punitive and operational 15 problems. For the Alliance, trash 16 17 containerization can only function 18 properly and effectively with robust 19 cooperation and continued partnership 20 with the Sanitation Department -- and 21 that's the end of my statement. 22 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 23 Next person is Laura Rothrock from 24 the NYC BID Association. 25 MS. ROTHROCK: Good morning. My

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	name is Laura Rothrock and I'm
2	testifying today on behalf of the NYC
3	BID Association and I'm also the
4	Executive Director of the Long Island
5	City BID.
6	The BID Association represents all
7	of the City 76 BIDs, many of whom you've
8	heard from today.
9	We want to be clear at the outset
10	that we share the City's goal of getting
11	bags off the street, reducing the number
12	of rats, and containerizing garbage to
13	the greatest extent feasible, but we
14	oppose this proposed rule as draconian
15	and inflexible.
16	For over 40 years, BIDs have been
17	trusted partners to NYC and DSNY,
18	providing services, including
19	supplemental sanitation, to districts
20	that have been inadequately served by
21	the City due to scarce resources. This
22	includes the bagging and relining of
23	overflowing trash cans, which cannot be
24	emptied at a fast enough rate by DSNY.
25	BIDs collect and replace over 10,000

Г

1	trash bags on an average day. While
2	some larger BIDs are able to haul those
3	bags to sanitation warehouses or are
4	moving towards containerization
5	voluntarily, most medium-sized and small
6	BIDs set those bags on the sidewalk for
7	DSNY pick-up.
8	Unfortunately, DSNY is now moving
9	ahead with the unfunded mandate being
10	considered at this hearing. While BIDs
11	are already partners in getting trash
12	off the street, these changes to our
13	operations would be financially
14	impossible for many BIDs.
15	There's also the complexity of
16	siting containers, which DOT and local
17	stakeholders with DOT and local
18	stakeholders. We remain deeply
19	concerned that an August 1st
20	implementation is still too soon for
21	many BIDs to operationalize these
22	changes.
23	The larger BIDs that have
24	voluntarily moved towards
25	containerization have needed years to do

Г

1	so and it has been quite complex, as
2	you've heard today.
3	As for the proposed rule itself, it
4	gives no guidance on what types of
5	containers will be allowed, aside from
6	the 55 gallon bins, which will be wholly
7	inadequate and there's some confusion
8	about why there's a mention of those 55
9	gallon containers at all.
10	The proposed rule also does not
11	provide for any flexibility whatsoever.
12	If the ultimate goal is to reduce
13	rats a goal which we share why not
14	limit the times and hours that bags can
15	be left out for pick-up in close
16	coordination with DSNY. Wouldn't this
17	achieve the goal without the draconian
18	rule being considered today?
19	We ask DSNY to consider adding
20	flexibility to this rule so that more
21	BIDs can realistically comply.
22	Without additional flexibility and
23	financial support, there's a real
24	possibility that many BIDs will have no
25	choice but to cease supplemental

Г

1	sanitation services altogether. In that
2	case, the City may not have nicely
3	tied-up bags on the street. It would
4	have overflowing trash cans along key
5	corridors across the City.
6	We remain committed to partnership
7	with DSNY and the City of New York, but
8	have found DSNY to have a lack of
9	understanding when it comes to how
10	quickly and easily we can operationalize
11	their goals.
12	This rule is particularly insulting
13	to partners that have worked to keep the
14	City clean, a job that DSNY cannot do
15	alone. If the City wants to get bags
16	off the street, they need to support
17	organizations financially and
18	operationally that do this work and not
19	introduce punitive measures which will
20	discourage and fine the very
21	organizations on the front-lines of
22	cleaning up New York City.
23	Thank you.
24	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
25	Next we have is Patricia Maltezos,

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 the Planning and Development Director of 2 the Hudson Yards Hell's kitchen Alliance. 3 4 MS. MALTEZOS: Good morning. My 5 name is Patricia Maltezos, the Planning and Development Director at the Hudson 6 7 Yards Hell's Kitchen Alliance, a BID in West Midtown. 8 The Hudson Yards Hell's Kitchen 9 10 Alliance stands with our fellow NYC BID 11 partners in our frustration over DSNY's 12 process and attitude on containerization 13 laws as it applies to BIDs. 14 We have always considered ourselves 15 partners with the City. We all endeavor to improve our various districts in both 16 17 physical and programmatic ways that are 18 specifically tailored to our 19 neighborhoods. 20 We support small businesses 21 throughout the five boroughs, plant 22 trees, create public art, organize free public events, and much more. 23 24 Supplemental sanitation is the most 25 important part of that program. Our

communities thrive thanks to clean 1 2 sidewalks. Users of our neighborhoods often 3 4 mistakenly think that the City takes care of the sidewalk trash, but it is 5 the BIDs who do this work every day. 6 7 This new law, with its current expediated (sic) timeline, is not built 8 9 for partnership. While HYHK supports 10 the idea of containerizing trash, we 11 cannot do this in the dark. 12 The lack of process so far has 13 forced BIDs to make decisions quickly, 14 without the time to consider future 15 ramifications on operations, budget, 16 staffing, and street-scape. At this 17 point, we are being forced to comply 18 with the program with no monetary 19 resources and very little written 20 quidance. 21 HYHK staff have been working to pilot a container in one location with 22 23 the hope of expanding the program 24 throughout the district. We applied for 25 one container in July and had that

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	approved six months later.
2	How can DSNY expect all BIDs to
3	containerize by August if it takes six
4	months to get one location? It takes
5	time to work through the staffing
б	issues, plan for fluctuations in trash
7	volume, understand complex on the ground
8	realities, and balance all of the needs
9	of other amenities in the public space.
10	DSNY is punishing us for the work we
11	do. BIDs clean up public trash not
12	trash that we create trash that the
13	public creates and throws on the
14	sidewalk.
15	We request a reset so that BIDS and
16	DSNY can move forward again as partners.
17	Thank you.
18	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you.
19	Next up is David Estrada, the
20	Executive Director of the Sunset Park
21	5th Avenue BID.
22	MR. ESTRADA: Hello yes, thank
23	you.
24	My name is David Estrada. I'm the
25	Executive Director of the Sunset Park

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

68

1	BID.
2	I'd like to echo the comments that
3	were made by previous BID members, but I
4	do want to point out a couple of other
5	things.
6	I serve Sunset Park, a 26-block
7	stretch of 5th Avenue in Brooklyn
8	between 38th and 64th Street. We have
9	an inordinate amount of illegal dumping
10	and this is totally out of our
11	control and even and even with
12	containers on the street, we would need
13	much more
14	MS. LIGUORI: Mr. Estrada, you cut
15	out.
16	(No response.)
17	MS. LIGUORI: Mr. Estrada?
18	(No response.)
19	MS. LIGUORI: Okay. We are going to
20	move to the next speaker and we'll come
21	back to Mr. Estrada in a few minutes.
22	The next is Jeffrey LeFrancois, the
23	Executive Director of the Meatpacking
24	District Management Association.
25	MR. LeFRANCOIS: Thank you and good

Γ

1	morning. My name is Jeffrey LeFrancois,
2	Executive Director of the Meatpacking
3	District Management Association.
4	We're the BID charged with
5	maintaining New York City's premier
б	cultural district for 50,000 plus daily
7	visitors, workers, and residents on
8	Manhattan's Lower West Side.
9	Our sanitation team supplements
10	DSNY's work by servicing over 100 waste
11	receptacles, sweeping 92 block bases,
12	and setting up to up to 400 public bags
13	of trash for DSNY collection every day.
14	As a result of this hard work, over 60
15	percent of public survey respondents
16	cite cleanliness as a key positive
17	feature of the neighborhood.
18	While the BID believes trash
19	containerization is a positive step in
20	New York street-scape revolution, this
21	rule shows an inadequate understanding
22	of BID operations, lacks interagency
23	coordination, and is a short-sighted
24	approach to containerization.
25	It is troubling that DSNY proposed

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

,

1 this rule without any engagement with 2 BIDs or input from City agencies that will have intersecting jurisdiction with 3 4 this program. 5 The rule is punitive and places a significant undue operational burden on 6 7 DSNY partners without providing any policy, permitting, and financial 8 9 support necessary to transition to 10 containerizing waste. 11 DSNY must address the following 12 issues with curb containerization 13 program before any penalizing rule is 14 adopted: 15 Provide a list of DSNY approved containerization products; allow for 16 17 bags to remain on-street for short 18 periods to facilitate centralization of 19 trash management by BID staff; ensure 20 procurement can adhere to a standard 21 policy or develop a procurement 22 exception with SBS; reduce the 23 administrative burden for BIDs applying to participate in the Clean Curbs 24 25 program; and establish a clear process

for additional agency review to ensure 1 2 other agencies do not hold up 3 applications. 4 The meatpacking district is not 5 objecting to this rule capriciously, but instead due to substantive concerns 6 7 related to effective implementation. DSNY should focus its efforts on 8 9 demonstrating a viable containerization 10 pilot and supporting the transition and 11 waste collection by identifying 12 container locations and buying the 13 products. DSNY should also support BIDs with 14 15 funds to acquire containers or procure 16 containers directly to support this 17 program. 18 The supplemental cleaning services 19 that BIDs provide are exactly that --20 supplemental to DSNY's work. The trash 21 collection comes -- the trash collected 22 comes from people of New York and 23 visitors walking our streets, shopping, 24 dining, and making a living in our city. 25 If DSNY wishes to implement this policy,

Г

1	it should consider, at a deep respect,
2	the partners that help keep our streets
3	clean.
4	Meatpacking BID looks forward to
5	being a part of the process that best
6	addresses the needs of the City to
7	containerize our trash. This rule will
8	certainly not achieve that.
9	Thank you.
10	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
11	The Next we have is Dan Scorse, the
12	Vice President of Operations for the
13	Hudson Yards Hell's Kitchen Alliance.
14	MR. SCORSE: Good morning. Thank
15	you.
16	My name is Daniel Scorse, Vice
17	President of Operations, the Hudson
18	Yards Hell's Kitchen Alliance, also
19	known as HYHK. Thank you for allowing
20	me to speak today.
21	BIDs partner with many City
22	agencies, such as DOT, Sanitation, NYPD,
23	and Parks, among others. A year ago, if
24	you had asked me which of these agencies
25	we had the best relationship with, I

would have said Sanitation. We both 1 2 want the same thing -- clean streets -and we've helped each other achieve that 3 4 goal for years. Unfortunately, this rule threatens 5 that partnership and may, ironically, 6 7 result in dirtier streets. HYHK supports getting bags off the 8 street and we feel that containerization 9 10 is the answer. In fact, HYHK 11 containerized some public space trash 10 12 years ago and it has been great. 13 However, due to funding and siting restrictions, we have not containerized 14 15 all the trash we handle. 16 As my colleague mentioned, it took 17 sanitation six months to approve one 18 container location. We may need 20 containers for full coverage. 19 20 When a restaurant containerizes its 21 trash, it does it for one location. 22 When a residential building containerizes, it's for one location. 23 24 BIDs, on the other hand, cover vast 25 swaths of the City, including the

1 busiest parts. It's a tremendous 2 undertaking. 3 If any other agency were rolling out 4 a change this dramatic, it would be an 5 iterative process with planning meetings, pilot programs, and phase 6 7 implementation. Although Sanitation likes the idea of a BID containerization 8 9 pilot program, they claim to have no 10 time or money for it. What's the rush? 11 I encourage Sanitation to take a 12 deep breath and rethink this important 13 program. 14 Thank you. 15 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you. 16 Next up we have is Corey Kunz, the 17 Senior VP of the Hudson Square BID. 18 MR. KUNZ: Hi. Good morning. I'm 19 Corey Kunz, the Senior Vice President at the Hudson Square Business Improvement 20 21 District. Since 2009, HS BID has overseen the 22 transformation of Manhattan's former 23 24 printing district into a thriving 25 creative hub. The area we manage is

Γ

1	generally bounded by parks and streets
2	in the north, 6th Avenue in the east,
3	Canal Street in the south, and West
4	Street in the west.
5	While we understand and support the
6	public policy to get bags off the
7	street, and have actively participated
8	in the Clean Curbs program to reduce
9	bags in our district, we are concerned
10	with the financial and operational
11	burdens this rule will put on will
12	put on BIDs.
13	BIDs are independent nonprofit
14	organizations that report to a Board of
15	Directors. Each individual BID's
16	services and budgets are written into a
17	legislatively approved district plan
18	that takes multiple years to alter.
19	In our case, our district plan does
20	not include supplemental sanitation in
21	its list of core services provided to
22	the community. We implemented
23	supplemental sanitation services in key
24	neighborhood corridors during the
25	COVID-19 pandemic to keep our district

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 attractive and welcoming as we were 2 trying to lure office workers and visitors back to the neighborhood. 3 4 This program has continued under the explicit direction of our Board of 5 Directors and could be halted at their 6 7 discretion. We estimate that the cost of 8 compliance with this rule to be over 9 10 \$150,000 in start-up costs alone, with 11 significant annual operational costs not 12 anticipated in our 10-year budget 13 projections. The financial penalties for violation, \$400 after the third 14 15 offense in one year, are a significant cost and burden for a nonprofit to 16 17 absorb. 18 In addition, it is wholly 19 inappropriate to issue fines to City 20 partners that provide supplemental 21 services and have existing contracts with the City. 22 The timing of this requirement is 23 24 particularly concerning, as our central 25 business district is finally recovering

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1	from the economic decline caused by
2	COVID-19. Pedestrian traffic is
3	currently increasing as we welcome new
4	major office tenants to the district.
5	With more foot traffic also comes more
6	public garbage.
7	While we support and appreciate the
8	importance the important goal of
9	containerization, it is unfair to burden
10	BIDs with the full cost and penalty of
11	containerizing public trash in our
12	commercial district.
13	As always, we are ready to help move
14	the City towards the goals of
15	containerization, but we must convey our
16	deep concern with this rule.
17	Thank you.
18	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
19	The next up I have is Cordelia
20	Persen, the Executive Director of the
21	NOHO BID.
22	MS. PERSEN: Hi. My name is
23	Cordelia Persen. I'm the Executive
24	Director of the NoHo bid, like she just
25	said.

Г

1	My BID was formed 27 years ago to
2	clean up NoHo and we've been doing
3	supplemental sanitation ever since.
4	The NoHo BID believes in
5	containerization in principle, and over
6	the past few years we have spent time
7	and financial resources implementing
8	containerization in parts of our
9	district for public corner can waste.
10	What we're concerned about is being
11	forced by DSNY to fully comply with
12	containerization requirements in such a
13	short time with no financial assistance
14	from the City. We are one of the
15	smallest BIDs in Manhattan and manage a
16	significant amount of trash that ends up
17	on our busy streets, from corner trash
18	to illegal dumping, to individuals
19	ripping up properly set-out garbage.
20	There's never a short supply of garbage
21	to deal with.
22	We've been slowly containerizing and
23	have been adding two CITIBINs per fiscal
24	year since FY '22. However, we still
25	have a ways to go before all our trash

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

is containerized. 1 Even now to deal with all the corner 2 3 can trash, the BID would likely have to 4 spend more than \$60,000 or 10 percent of 5 our annual budget. BIDs were formed to do supplemental 6 7 sanitation, which means bagging up 8 pedestrian garbage on -- from corner 9 cans to prevent overflow and help DSNY 10 with their overall goal of keeping trash 11 off the street. Since it's the City 12 garbage and a City initiative, I feel 13 like the City should be providing 14 funding to implement the program. 15 Unless we get more funding, my Board 16 of Directors has voted to pull corner 17 cans from areas that we don't have enough capacity in whichever CITIBINs we 18 19 get sited by the deadline. Another problem in the program is 20 21 that in the first round of the Clean 22 Curbs pilot -- the first time we put stuff out -- DSNY handled notification 23 24 for property owners. In this last 25 version -- or the latest version, BIDs

are supposed to do the notification 1 2 ourselves. Since this is a City program and 3 this -- we -- I believe the City should 4 5 do the notification versus making BIDs have a contentious conversation with 6 7 property owners we represent when we have limited control over siting 8 locations. 9 10 On that note, siting and placement 11 is definitely a challenge in my 12 district, and to make this program work, I believe DSNY and DOT will need to be 13 14 more flexible and responsive to each 15 district's individual street-scape. 16 Lastly, my BID has learned a lot about what locations work and how to 17 18 best roll-out the program in our 19 district because we had time to 20 implement it a little bit over time and 21 make sure we were placing the correct 22 locations where the correct capacities. 23 I think setting up an August 1st deadline for all containerization will 24 25 lead to a program that -- not -- that is

Г

1	not being implemented in the best way
2	possible for DSNY. I recommend it being
3	implemented over a longer time period.
4	Thank you.
5	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
6	The next we have is Lauren Elvers
7	Collins, the Executive Director of the
8	Church-Flatbush Community Alliance.
9	MS. ELVERS COLLINS: Hi. Thank you.
10	Good morning. This is yes Lauren
11	Elvers Collins, the ED at the
12	Church-Flatbush Community Alliance.
13	We serve small businesses and
14	properties on more than one-and-a-half
15	miles of Flatbush Brooklyn. Garbage is
16	a huge problem, as it is for many of us,
17	but forcing partners like BIDs to spend
18	their own funds to take over keeping
19	bags of public trash off the street
20	part of a service that the City should
21	be providing will take needed
22	services away from our community.
23	We definitely appreciate the hard
24	work that DSNY does every day toward
25	keeping our City clean and we're glad to

Γ

1	supplement that effort and really
2	shout-out to AK-14, which is such a
3	great garage. They really support us.
4	Several years ago, we were part of
5	DSNY's Clean Curbs pilot program under
6	which the City paid for three containers
7	for us, which our three-person
8	supplemental crew fills every day with
9	bags of public trash that we gather from
10	litter baskets.
11	We already spend about \$255,000 a
12	year on supplemental sanitation, which
13	is 42 percent of our annual assessment.
14	That's a very big chunk of the money
15	that we have plus an estimated 30
16	percent of staff time of our
17	three-person staff is dedicated to
18	addressing sanitation issues and
19	collaborating with Sanitation officials,
20	our property and business members, and
21	the community to try to make a cleaner
22	neighborhood.
23	The rest of our efforts go into
24	creating free community events,
25	promotion and marketing for our
I	

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	businesses, small business support, and
2	safety and quality of life programs.
3	If DSNY were to implement this rule,
4	we'd be faced with several possible
5	options. Storing bags in large
6	on-street containers has been mentioned
7	by other people on the call hauling
8	bags and ending service.
9	The first two of the options are
10	cost prohibitive for us. For us, adding
11	four new containers that we would need
12	would cost over \$40,000, plus the cost
13	of ongoing maintenance, which would
14	force us to drop some community events
15	and services.
16	This is four containers for us
17	would be a minimum. It would still mean
18	fewer times that our guys could go up
19	and down the street because they will be
20	bringing things to the to the
21	containers.
22	And as a side note, we've had
23	multiple conversations with the two
24	primary container services, CITIBIN and
25	metroSTOR and we also have several

years of experience using and 1 2 understanding the real life capacity of these containers. And, respectfully, 3 4 the cost of the containers that has 5 sometimes been mentioned by DSNY is simply not accurate and understates what 6 7 actually would be needed for us to do what's being asked. 8 The final idea that would come out 9 10 of the rule of ending service would 11 definitely damage the quality of life in 12 our neighborhood. 13 Instead of imposing this rule, what 14 we would love to see is DSNY adding 15 pick-up times to the commercial 16 corridors that need it and working with 17 each BID directly to find a solution 18 that the BID -- that that BID can 19 achieve without forcing us to remove 20 services which our community -- our 21 communities rely on. 22 If containerization is required, 23 BIDs should be provided with containers 24 at no cost to us, and siting should be 25 made much easier than what we're

1 possibly looking at now. 2 Penalizing BIDs and similar groups who are already dedicating money and 3 4 time to do the City's job of keeping our streets clean is unfair and ignores the 5 negative impact this would have on our 6 7 communities. We urge DSNY to put this proposed 8 rule aside and to instead work with each 9 10 of us as partners to find a solution 11 that's feasible for each BID. Thank you so much. 12 13 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you. 14 The Next we have is Kalvis 15 Mikelsteins, the VP of Planning and Operations for the Dumbo Improvement 16 17 District. 18 MR. MIKELSTEINS: Thank you. Good 19 morning, everyone. My name is Kalvis 20 Mikelsteins from the Dumbo BID. Thank 21 you for the opportunity to testify on behalf of our BID. 22 We provide essential sanitation 23 24 services, including bagging public 25 trash, to keep streets clean for

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

residents, workers, and visitors. 1 2 I want to state upfront that we are in alignment with the goal of the DSNY 3 4 of beautifying our streets through the 5 removal of trash. However, the proposed Sanitation rule raises significant 6 7 concerns for our organization, as well as other BIDs. We seek a constructive 8 9 dialog to address these issues while 10 achieving our shared goals. 11 BIDs are independent non-profits 12 with budgets and contracts outlined in 13 district plans and through agreements 14 with NYC Small Business Services. Since 15 we cannot adjust assessments without a 16 lengthy process, many BIDs struggle to 17 adapt to new financial burdens, such as those imposed by this rule. 18 19 While the rule claims to minimize 20 compliance costs, it fails to consider 21 the true financial impact. BIDs were not consulted about the costs of 22 23 compliance, which could reach hundreds 24 of thousands of dollars in start-up 25 expenses alone, potentially diverting

Г

1	funds from other essential services.
2	Moreover, siting these bins will be
3	a lengthy effort with the Department, as
4	well as NYC DOT who govern the curb.
5	For containerization to move forward, we
6	need there to be dedicated staff and
7	guaranteed guaranteed approval
8	timelines for the siting.
9	The rule also includes fines for
10	BIDs, which already provide supplemental
11	sanitation services for the City. These
12	fines are intended for noncompliance,
13	but the trash being bagged is public
14	waste; not BID specific. Imposing fines
15	on BIDs efforts to fill a gap left by
16	the City feels unjust.
17	Despite amendments clarifying that
18	individuals won't be fined, BIDs will
19	still bear the compliance burden, which
20	could lead to confusion, inefficiency,
21	and costly penalties.
22	Further, the rule lacks clarity on
23	the types of containers BIDs should use
24	for trash bagging. While DSNY suggests
25	wheelie-bins and large containers, the

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	rule only references containers up to 55
2	gallons, causing uncertainty.
3	We recommend exploring designated
4	time periods for trash and recycling
5	placement and coordinating with DSNY on
6	pick-up schedules to minimize rat
7	attraction. This could align with
8	residential containerization efforts,
9	providing a cost effective solution.
10	We understand the importance of
11	maintaining clean streets and tackling
12	sanitation challenges, but the proposed
13	rule change doesn't account for BIDs'
14	limitations, nor does it offer any
15	workable solutions.
16	We ask you to consider the financial
17	impact, practicality of compliance, and
18	the broader consequences for BIDs. We
19	remain committed to collaborating with
20	DSNY and other stakeholders to develop a
21	fair, realistic, and sustainable
22	solution.
23	Thank you for your attention to
24	these issues. We look forward to
25	further discussions to ensure that the

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1 new sanitation requirements are 2 equitable and feasible. 3 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 4 The next we have is Cate Byrne on behalf of the Office of Council Member 5 Aviles. 6 7 MS. BYRNE: Thank you so much. Good morning, everyone. Thank you 8 9 so much all DSNY staff for taking the 10 time to hear our concerns today about 11 proposed amendments to DSNY's 12 containerization policies. We really 13 appreciate your attention this morning. 14 I will be reading on behalf of 15 Council Member Alexa Aviles who 16 represents District 38 in Brooklyn. As a local-elected official for 17 18 District 38, I recognize the importance 19 of tackling litter and rat 20 overpopulation, both of which could be 21 mitigated through proper containerization. However, the 22 Administration's proposed requirement 23 24 that all entities use containers for 25 collection services will be detrimental

Г

1	and will, therefore, harm the sanitation
2	efforts within our community.
3	DSNY's proposed amendment seeks to
4	resolve a significant problem in our
5	City, but does not take into account the
6	needs of nonprofit stakeholders.
7	We do look forward to working with
8	the City and Council on a solution to
9	containerization that does not put the
10	majority of the financial burden on our
11	non-profits, as you believe, what would
12	happen with this amendment.
13	I will leave out some of the more
14	more of the details and statistics that
15	are included in the written submitted
16	testimony in the interest of time.
17	But, we respectfully request DSNY
18	consider the negative impacts of this
19	amendment on hardworking non-profits,
20	merchant associations, and neighborhood
21	efforts that make it possible for us to
22	keep our streets clean.
23	Without a clear explanation and
24	solution for how BIDs and other partners
25	will be expected to comply with this

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	rule without it significantly cutting
2	into their financial capacity, the
3	proposed benefits of these
4	containerization policies are slim
5	compared to the financial damage these
б	regulations do induce.
7	We are happy to engage in continued
8	conversations with DSNY, DOT, LPC, and
9	PDC about long-term solutions to
10	containerization that do not financially
11	harm non-profits who are already at
12	limited capacities.
13	Thank you for attention to the
14	Department matter and we have submitted
15	a longer written testimony.
16	Thank you.
17	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
18	Next we have is Daniel Bernstein,
19	the Executive Director of the
20	Columbus-Amsterdam Business Improvement
21	District.
22	MR. BERNSTEIN: Yes thank you. I
23	appreciate it.
24	Hello, everybody. My name is Daniel
25	Bernstein. I've been the Executive

I'm currently the Executive Director of 1 2 the Columbus-Amsterdam BID. I want to, first of all, thank DSNY 3 4 for allowing me to testify and for their 5 hard work daily keeping New York City 6 clean. 7 New York City BIDs vary greatly in size and budget. Our BID, which is a 8 9 local community development nonprofit, 10 has been in operation since 1987 and our 11 boundaries cover both Columbus and --12 sorry -- Amsterdam Avenues from West 13 96th Street to West 110th Street, the 14 Bloomingdale neighborhood of Manhattan. 15 We provide programs and services that are aimed at making our 16 17 neighborhood cleaner, safer, and more 18 prosperous. Our sanitation team is 19 comprised of six part-time employees, 20 three of which are deployed daily, to 21 sweep the streets and change the trash liners in the bin. 22 23 I have worked in New York City BIDs 24 for almost 30 years and BID sanitation 25 services are essential to New York City

Г

1	neighborhoods because, as we all know,
2	Department of Sanitation and the City
3	cannot clean the sidewalks on its own.
4	Local community development
5	organizations, like BIDs, throughout New
6	York City, pick-up the major slack of
7	New York City and its agencies to make
8	the City a more attractive place for
9	visitors and residents alike.
10	These new rules will force many
11	community groups, like us, to
12	significantly alter and/or suspend our
13	existing sanitation services due to the
14	overwhelming financial constraints this
15	rule is causing. This will result in
16	overflowing trash receptacles, dirty
17	sidewalks, and dumping.
18	The City is planning to fine
19	organizations like us for doing their
20	job, bagging public trash not BID'er
21	commercial trash public trash. This
22	does not make any sense, as it is the
23	work of groups like ours that make the
24	City look great daily.
25	We urge DSNY and the City to revisit

94

these rules and implementation dates so 1 2 that we can work together to make New York City cleaner. 3 4 Thank you. 5 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. Next we have is James Ellis, the 6 7 Executive Director of the North Flatbush 8 Avenue BID. 9 MR. ELLIS: Hi. Thank you. Ι 10 Appreciate the time this morning -- the 11 opportunity to share this testimony 12 today. 13 My name is James Ellis and I serve 14 as the Executive Director for the North 15 Flatbush Avenue Business Improvement 16 District, an organization serving Park 17 Slope and Prospect Heights in Brooklyn 18 since 1986. 19 While my testimony may echo 20 sentiments and realities expressed by my 21 colleagues, I feel compelled to voice 22 our deep concerns about the proposed DSNY containerization mandate. 23 As one of the 76 BIDs in New York 24 25 City, and as a nearly 40-year-old

Г

1	organization providing essential
2	supplemental services in our
3	neighborhoods, we have long prided
4	ourselves on being a trusted partner to
5	the City, its administrators, and
6	agencies. However, this recent mandate
7	has left us profoundly disappointed with
8	the City's approach to partnership and
9	collaboration.
10	The BID model was created as
11	created more than 40 years ago, speaks
12	to partnership with supplemental
13	services. This DSNY initiative is
14	contrary to the language and intent of
15	the original legislation. It removes
16	the spirit of shared stewardship and
17	governmental cooperation that the BIDs
18	agreed to be a part of. Together, we
19	can improve everyday life in New York
20	City.
21	The lack of substantive consultation
22	with BIDs before implementing this
23	mandate reveals a troubling disconnect
24	between policy-making and operational
25	reality. This top-down approach fails

Г

1	to recognize several critical issues.
2	The financial feasibility:
3	Despite DSNY's certification that
4	this rule minimizes compliance costs for
5	the discrete regulated community, the
6	reality is starkly different. As
7	independent non-profits reporting to
8	Boards, our services and budgets are
9	carefully outlined in our district plans
10	and SBS contracts. This mandate could
11	require tens of thousands of dollars in
12	start-up costs with significant annual
13	maintenance expenses that our already
14	strained budgets cannot accommodate.
15	Importantly, we cannot simply
16	increase our assessments without
17	undertaking a laborious legislative
18	process.
19	Adding to it operational challenges:
20	The rule lacks clarity on acceptable
21	container types, alternating between
22	references to wheelie-bins and large
23	on-street containers while only
24	specifying a 55-gallon limit.
25	There are significant siting issues

Γ

1	for container placement in our dense and
2	urban environment, and specifically
3	along North Flatbush Avenue, which
4	currently hosts curbside regulations to
5	accommodate rush hour traffic demands.
6	Siting requirements and approvals
7	must be vetted through Department of
8	Transportation, proven to be a time
9	consuming process with little
10	flexibility, and, additionally, we are
11	shouldered with the task of explaining
12	these demands to impacted stakeholders.
13	Their disapproval of these demands may
14	then be unfairly aimed in our
15	organization.
16	The unintended consequences also
17	include efforts that might force some
18	BIDs to discontinue their public trash
19	collection service entirely, leading to
20	overflowing litter, increased street
21	debris, higher rat activity, and
22	degraded quality of life.
23	This punitive approach is
24	particularly troubling, that we face
25	fines for providing a public service.

The trash we collect has not been 1 2 generated or commercial waste. It is 3 public trash. While the rule was modified to 4 5 provide -- to protect individual workers from fines, our organizations still bear 6 7 the burden of compliance and potential penalties. This punitive approach also 8 does not address the countless 9 10 commercial corridors who do not have 11 local stewardship as similar to BIDs. 12 We urge the -- we urge today to 13 consider alternative approaches. Aliqn 14 this program with the forthcoming large 15 residential containerization roll-out to 16 ensure consistency and efficiency: 17 Establish designated periods during 18 which bags can remain on the street with 19 written DSNY agreements; create a grant 20 program to help BIDs purchase and maintain compliant containers. 21 22 Develop clear guidelines for 23 container placement to coordinate with 24 all City agencies and provide exceptions 25 for BIDs based on operational

1 constraints and district 2 characteristics. The North Flatbush Avenue BID has 3 4 discussed this mandate and currently 5 does not see a financial operation -financial or operational pathway to an 6 7 August 1st compliance deadline as it currently stands. As a long-standing 8 9 partner in maintaining clean streets, we 10 ask that -- to recognize the BIDs are 11 not the problem, but rather part of the 12 solution. 13 We share the goal of a cleaner, more 14 sustainable New York City. This 15 mandate, as currently structured, threatens to undermine the very services 16 17 that help achieve that goal. 18 We remain committed to work with 19 everyone, including DSNY, to develop 20 practical solutions to serve our 21 communities effectively while advancing 22 the City sanitation goals. 23 Thank you for your consideration. 24 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 25 The next is Albert Dalipi, the

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	Deputy Director of the Fordham Road
2	Business Improvement District.
3	MR. DALIPI: Hi, everyone. So, my
4	name is Albert Dalipi. I'm here
5	testifying on behalf of the Chairman,
6	David Rose.
7	Fordham Road is the busiest
8	commercial district in the Bronx and
9	home to home to over 300 businesses
10	and 80 commercial buildings.
11	Our position on the agency rule is
12	simple. The rule and policy should be
13	scrapped altogether, especially given
14	how reckless this was rolled-out and how
15	it undermines more than 40 years of
16	public/private partnerships.
17	BIDs throughout New York City, as
18	part of our contractual obligation and
19	mission, have performed supplemental
20	City services to assist City
21	responsibilities in growing our
22	neighborhoods and keeping them clean.
23	We fill in the gaps in the essential
24	services the City attempts to provide;
25	one example being that BIDs provide the

liners for the trash cans at the BID's 1 2 expense and when the cans are filled, they're left on the sidewalk for DSNY to 3 4 collect. 5 Requiring BIDs to containerize all garbage 24/7, 365 is a drastic policy 6 7 shift that is punitive for numerous 8 reasons. 9 Firstly, BIDs are funded through an 10 additional tax assessment on each 11 property based on frontage, commercial 12 square footage, and assessed valuation, which can vary widely with each BID's 13 14 district plans. In Fordham's case, the 15 BID's assessment is the sole source of 16 our BID sanitation expense line. 17 BIDs are tasked with providing supplemental sanitation services. 18 What 19 DSNY is wrongly asking us to do is 20 essentially now assume primary 21 responsibility of managing all public 22 trash, from bagging to containerization, 23 which goes against the very contract 24 that BIDs have with the City. 25 More than 33 percent of the Fordham

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

102

1	BID budget is dedicated to supplemental
2	sanitation services. In other BIDs,
3	that percentage is higher. The BID
4	manages an average of 12,000 trash
5	cans sorry 12,000 trash bags per
6	quarter, making containerization under
7	the new mandate impossible.
8	Finding containers is also
9	difficult, on Fordham Road particularly,
10	as there's a bus lane that runs along
11	the curb, leaving the sidewalks as the
12	only alternative. However, our
13	sidewalks are already crowded and
14	containerizing 12,000 trash bags will
15	require some a substantial number of
16	BIDs.
17	Rising operational costs due to new
18	insurance requirements, inflation,
19	minimum wage increases, and other
20	expenses further strain the BID
21	sanitation budget. In the interest of
22	fiscal responsibility, Fordham BID would
23	require significant additional resources
24	and funding to comply.
25	Fordham BID doesn't have the budget

Γ

1	for this proposed mandate that still
2	seems to lack clear guidelines that
3	still seems to lack clear guidelines.
4	Secondly, several Fordham
5	brick-and-mortar businesses have
б	informed the BID of fines they received
7	from DSNY for trash on the sidewalk when
8	the trash was actually left by some
9	street vendors in front of their shop,
10	who, in some instances, would not have
11	been there in the first place since
12	Fordham is a restricted street.
13	The City will be making all BIDs
14	responsible for trash outside the scope
15	of our contract.
16	In addition, recent news reports of
17	DSNY only writing about 10 tickets a day
18	for illegal street vending citywide are
19	also equally troubling, as there's a
20	correlation between the number of
21	vendors, amount of enforcement, and the
22	businesses of Fordham Road wrongly
23	receiving tickets for illegal dumping.
24	Thirdly, Fordham Road is a curbside
25	bus lane with limited public space

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

making sitting -- making placement and compliance extremely difficult and this rule shamefully assumes a one size fits all approach, especially when on many City blocks -- especially when on many City blocks, street pits, hydrants, benches, public art, food, and street vendors, and other public infrastructure all put a strain on the public realm. In conclusion, the rule does not provide the necessary guidelines for funding or coordination BIDs will need in order to ensure the clock -- in order to ensure around the clock containerization. There are major siting issues we will have to work through with DOT -public safety issues involving limited public space, and, of course, the conflicts this rule creates with how BIDs have operated for more than four decades.

23The new rule will significantly24change the way trash is managed, and,25quite bluntly -- and quite bluntly is an

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

105

existential threat to all to the future 1 2 of all BIDs. 3 Thank you. 4 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 5 The next we have is C. Virginia Fields, 125th Street Business 6 7 Improvement District. MS. FIELDS: Hello. Okay -- I'm 8 9 sorry. I was -- I was off for a second. 10 Good morning. 11 First of all, let me say, as a 12 member of the Board, I'm pleased to be 13 able to join this discussion, and to say 14 that the BID fully supports the City's 15 efforts in terms of, you know, 16 controlling trash, rat infestation, as well as all of the other issues that 17 18 have been addressed. 19 So, let me start by simply saying 20 that we fully agree with the comments 21 that have been made, and instead of 22 going over all of them, that we'd like 23 to just make several recommendations. We encourage the DSNY to consider 24 25 some of what has been mentioned -- but

I

106

1	for example, alternative compliance
2	options to consider alternative trash
3	management solutions as designated waste
4	consolidation zones, financial support
5	mechanisms for DSNY to reopen a grant
6	program or subsidy fund to assist the
7	BIDs in purchasing and maintaining
8	containers; agreements that include a
9	minimum contract term guaranteed, such
10	as purchasing and maintaining
11	containers, fair enforcement policies
12	which we heard a lot about this
13	morning fines that to be used only
14	for waste directly managed by the BID
15	with DSNY assuming responsibility for
16	illegal dumping enforcement and we
17	strongly encourage collaboration and
18	transparency that DSNY will establish
19	a working group with big representatives
20	to develop practical solutions that meet
21	the City sanitation goals without
22	overburdening the very organizations
23	that help keep neighborhoods clean.
24	So, in conclusion, the 125th Street
25	Business Improvement District, which I

Г

1	am speaking on behalf of as a member of
2	the Board, remains fully committed to
3	working with DSNY to find an equitable
4	path forward that benefits the City's
5	need for cleaner streets with the
6	realities faces by BIDs that jeopardize
7	our ability to function primarily
8	those that you have heard with relation
9	to financial concerns, as well as
10	implementation steps that would have to
11	be taken.
12	So, we appreciate your attention to
13	this critical matter and we certainly,
14	along with all of the BIDs, welcome
15	further discussions with the Department
16	of Sanitation.
17	Thank you so much and we look
18	forward to continuing to work with you
19	to address this critical problem and
20	needs within the City. Thank you.
21	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
22	Next up we have Tiera Mack, the
23	Executive Director of the Pitkin Avenue
24	BID.
25	MS. MACK: Hi. I'm Tiera Mack and I

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

am a current CITIBIN user that is opposed to a mandatory containerization for BIDs in commercial corridors. Again, the Pitkin Avenue BID has an assessment of \$225,000. We cover 32 block bases and currently hold 52 litter baskets over 64 corners. In FY '24, our operating budget was \$380,000. We spent \$145,000 on sanitation, which was almost 40 percent of our budget. The Pitkin Avenue BID has been using containers since 2022 when we were

awarded approximately \$28,000 for containers and supplies to maintain the containers under the DSNY and SBS Neighborhood Challenge grant.

This grant was initially advertised as a pilot to test the reality of commercial corridor containerization, but DSNY failed to monitor this pilot's process and subsequent failures or successes.

23DSNY has not collected any data24points from me, or have they met with me25as a BID leader who uses containers,

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

just for basic feedback. 1 2 We currently have 13 modules over three locations. They hold 65 50-gallon 3 4 bags. In FY '24, we put out 39,000 bags 5 for collection. A third of them were containerized. We spent \$20,000 6 7 containerizing those bags and labor 8 costs. 9 To containerize all of the bags in 10 2024, we would have had to spend an 11 additional 25 to \$40,000 and labor costs 12 are growing. Plus, we would need 13 another four to six containers. 14 With the proper DSNY sanitation 15 pick-up schedule, we could lower that labor cost, but this will require DSNY 16 17 to be a true and trusted partner with us 18 and actually monitor us as a BID in this 19 program. 20 In 2023, when litter baskets began 21 to disappear from the corridor, never to 22 be replaced, we attempted to purchase BasketPlus from CITIBIN, which is a 23 basic -- basic litter basket with the 24 25 container as a (indiscernible).

Г

1	The clean team would have been able
2	to containerize five bags at every
3	corner that the litter basket is at.
4	DSNY denied our request and said that
5	only the baskets they are servicing are
6	(indiscernible). While easier for DSNY
7	staff to lift, they are expensive and
8	less durable, and once they break, they
9	are not being replaced. Pitkin BID is
10	currently missing 12 litter baskets.
11	Is my time up oh, okay.
12	MS. LIGUORI: (Indiscernible.)
13	MS. MACK: Okay. Though commercial
14	corridor containeration (sic) has many,
15	many benefits, there are so many
16	limitations, such as improper disposal
17	and illegal dumping, which, again,
18	counteracts the attention of this
19	program.
20	We are asking DSNY to create and
21	provide a real solution to those issues.
22	We are asking DSNY to provide us with
23	schedule goals and let's work together
24	as BIDs and City agencies to actually
25	understand when our pick-up is going to

Г

111

1	happen.
2	I would also ask DSNY if
3	containerization is going to be our way
4	moving forward, can we reconsider
5	BasketPlus as a litter basket option.
6	In addition to that, I'm also asking
7	DSNY to think about pay equity for our
8	staff because we are paying people much
9	lower wages, not because we want to, but
10	because that is the way that vendor and
11	sanitation contracts have worked. So,
12	they're making way less than DSNY staff,
13	but doing a lot of DSNY's work.
14	Again, the cost of this is
15	astronomical and we are really in fights
16	over public space, which we know, as
17	City agencies, BIDs, and residents of
18	New York City, our public spaces are
19	what we need to move the City forward
20	and to cover them all with containers, I
21	think it's a bit it's just a bit a
22	bit of a disservice for the residents of
23	this City.
24	Thank you.
25	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.

Next, we have is Nate Reynolds from 1 2 the -- yeah, Nate Reynolds from the Clean Bushwick Initiative. 3 4 MR. REYNOLDS: Hi. My name is Nate 5 Reynolds and I'm providing testimony on behalf of the Clean Bushwick Initiative, 6 7 or CBI, and we kindly request that you 8 withdraw the proposed rule. 9 CBI is a community organization 10 based in Bushwick, Brooklyn that works 11 to improve the cleanliness and 12 sustainability of our neighborhood 13 through organized volunteer clean-ups. 14 In 2024, the CBI hosted 15 clean-ups 15 throughout Bushwick engaging over 250 volunteers and removing over 3,600 16 17 pounds of trash off the street. We 18 organize community clean-ups because we 19 have the same goals as DSNY -- cleaner 20 streets. However, this proposed rule 21 would effectively outlaw the community 22 clean-ups that help us to clean those 23 streets. 24 Currently, Section 16-120 prohibits 25 the placement of household or commercial

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

refuse in or around a public litter 1 2 basket. Ostensibly, the proposed rule 3 seeks to clarify that community clean-up 4 organizations also may not place trash 5 within the vicinity of any public litter basket. 6 7 The notion that Section 16-120 needs 8 clarity is misguided and appears to rely 9 on a fundamental misunderstanding of 10 what clean-up organizations like CBI do. 11 We do not create trash; we remove it. 12 CBI collects litter already in the 13 streets and places it near public receptacles, making it easier for DSNY 14 15 to collect and dispose of. The actual 16 effect of this proposed rule would be to 17 make it illegal for community 18 organizations to organize clean-ups and 19 collect trash because we would have 20 nowhere to put it. 21 We are not creating new trash. We 22 are collecting the trash that already 23 exists, and to call this illegal 24 dumping, would have devastating impacts. 25 CBI focuses its efforts in Bushwick,

Г

1	which has been designated a
2	disadvantaged community by the New York
3	State Climate Justice Working Group and
4	large parts of the neighborhood are
5	included in a rat migration zone.
6	The neighborhood already lacks
7	adequate trash bins, enforcement, and
8	resources for waste management. This
9	rule would hurt underserved communities
10	like ours the most, where residents rely
11	on local efforts to keep the streets
12	clean.
13	DSNY cannot manage all the waste on
14	its own, so community groups fill the
15	gaps. If groups like ours can't
16	operate, the trash in our neighborhoods
17	will pile up and the impact would go
18	beyond just street cleanliness.
19	The CBI maintains a number of rain
20	gardens in Bushwick that are necessary
21	to absorb storm-water, reduce flooding,
22	and filter pollutants. Our clean-ups
23	regularly focus on cleaning trash from
24	the rain gardens and surrounding streets
25	to ensure that the gardens are able to

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	function properly. Without a way to
2	dispose of this waste, maintaining the
3	rain gardens becomes much harder and
4	which would lead to more flooding and
5	pollutants.
6	If the goal of Section 16-120, and
7	DSNY more broadly, is to prevent litter
8	and reduce trash on the streets, this
9	proposed rule must be rejected.
10	Thank you.
11	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you.
12	Next up we have Marta Schlitzer from
13	the Jackson Heights Beautification Group
14	Tree LC.
15	MS. SCHLITZER: Hi. Thank you so
16	much. Thanks, Nate, for starting out
17	our community's people talking about
18	this.
19	I'm with the Jackson Heights
20	Beautification group, and our specialty
21	is the Tree LC, which takes care of our
22	commercial corridors, street trees and
23	their beds, and expands them and plants
24	trees.
25	Jackson Heights Beautification Group

116

has been a not-for-profit entity in our 1 2 neighborhood for over 35 years now. 3 Much to what Nate spoke of, we are a 4 community entity trying to keep our 5 streets and tree beds clean. We do this every single Saturday morning. We would 6 7 love to just take care of the trees, but a lot of trash comes with that and we'd 8 love to thank DSNY. Our local trash 9 10 pick-up guys are fabulous. 11 Our -- we also have a large ACE 12 group out taking care of the litter 13 baskets on our commercial corridor. We 14 do also have our 82nd Street BID 15 community. So, we have a lot of 16 resources in our neighborhood. We do 17 supplement a lot, as our volunteers help 18 out to keep things clean. 19 So, you did include not-for-profit 20 and community organizations in your 21 proposal, so that has freaked us out. 22 As Nate said, everywhere is being 23 affected by trash. 24 In our community in particular, 25 which is why I wanted to give testimony,

Γ

117

1	we do have a large swath of our
2	community to the eastern side, which has
3	a lot of landlords who are telling their
4	packed-in tenants, in what are basically
5	SRO buildings you know, triple-family
6	homes and whatnot these landlords are
7	telling their tenants, who they are
8	getting good money from, to not put
9	their residential trash in the trash on
10	their property.
11	So, we constantly see residential
12	trash large and small going into
13	our street bins. This has caused the
14	DSNY to need to make the decision to
15	remove some of those bins in the worst
16	places.
17	While those areas where those bins
18	were are being able to be maintained
19	cleanly, reasonably we do put in a
20	lot of 311 requests we do find that
21	trash going to other places in the
22	neighborhood. The primary place is rain
23	gardens, which is devastating.
24	We have started reporting that and
25	working with the DEP on that trash

Г

1	removal. We do have some great
2	merchants who support us and will take
3	our trash bags and put them with their
4	trash, but we do use the street bins a
5	lot.
6	We do help out ACE. We do consider
7	not overfilling those bins and putting
8	the bags neatly, and actually taking
9	some of the trash out, neatly putting it
10	in bags so that the trash doesn't
11	overflow.
12	But I did want to bring up this big
13	problem specifically to our
14	neighborhood lots of other BID
15	districts have spoken about how each
16	area is very different from one another,
17	and while this is a commercial area that
18	is not part of a BID district and is
19	serviced by our ACE from our community
20	council district, it is surrounded by
21	huge residential areas, and this
22	residential trash is a huge problem and
23	we'd love DSNY's support on figuring out
24	how to get to these landlords, who are
25	making tons and tons of money on

Г

1	illegally stuffing their properties full
2	of humans and not being responsible for
3	their trash and residents don't
4	know they don't understand. It ends
5	up in the litter baskets.
6	Thank you so much for your time.
7	I'll put the details of my testimony in
8	an email to you.
9	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
10	Next up we have is Monica Blum, the
11	President of the Lincoln Square BID.
12	MS. BLUM: Thank you very much. I'm
13	pleased to be here to testify on behalf
14	of the Lincoln Square BID.
15	We have an almost 30-year
16	partnership with DSNY. We
17	enthusiastically supported every single
18	initiative that Sanitation rolled out,
19	including this one.
20	While I appreciate their efforts to
21	seek our feedback, I'm really dismayed.
22	I'm horrified actually by the punitive
23	nature of these rules.
24	On a certain level, the fines sound
25	to me like an OMB idea. I've seen this

Г

1	before. I can't believe that DSNY is
2	threatening to fine and punish business
3	improvement districts and other partners
4	for helping Sanitation do its job.
5	As per our district plan approved by
6	the City Council, and our contract with
7	SBS, we supplement City sanitation
8	services across 84 block faces. The
9	language is clear. We supplement what
10	DSNY does. We don't replace City
11	services. This is public trash.
12	Approximately, 40 percent of our budget
13	goes to sanitation.
14	The former Sanitation Commissioner
15	said the goal was to bring BIDs in line
16	with other businesses and residential
17	buildings. Herein lies a major flaw in
18	the reasoning behind these rules.
19	We are not retail businesses or
20	residential buildings. We are private
21	nonprofit organizations and we are a
22	critical public private partnership that
23	helps DSNY keep the City clean. These
24	rules run counter to the reason business
25	improvement districts were created in

the first place and undermine our core 1 2 missions. 3 In 2022, we were among the first to 4 apply for DSNY's pilot program through 5 the Clean Curbs initiative and installed two five-module CITIBIN units with site 6 7 approval from DOT. 8 At that time, DSNY reimbursed us for 9 the cost of our two CITIBINs. Our goal 10 was totally in sync with the City's, 11 getting piles of bags of public trash 12 off the corners and sidewalks. We were 13 pleased with our first two CITIBINs. 14 Unfortunately, the program was 15 totally suspended until last spring when we immediately applied to install 16 additional CITIBINs. We now have a 17 total of six five-unit modules, which 18 19 DSNY services daily. We need two more, 20 but finding locations has been extremely 21 challenging. 22 I respectfully request that DSNY 23 rethink and rescind these punitive rules 24 and work with us to come up with a plan 25 that recognizes that business

1 improvement districts are trusted and 2 necessary partners. 3 If the rules are to be implemented, 4 we are recommending that they codify a number of situations and conditions that 5 should not be left to agency discretion. 6 7 I mean, there have been a lot of Sanitation Commissioners. Leaders 8 9 change and will change again. 10 First of all, eliminate all fines 11 that -- that punish anyone. We think 12 it's inappropriate and counterproductive 13 to fine BIDs for helping the City do its 14 job. 15 The rules are silent on extenuating 16 or exigent circumstances and must 17 include language that addresses missed 18 pick-ups, holidays, parades, visiting 19 presidents, snow -- like now -- and 20 allow for the placement of bags either 21 in front of containers or in front of 22 cans for those who use them. 23 The rules should apply to government 24 agencies, as well as everyone else --25 MTA, film companies. You should see

Г

1	what we what garbage is piled up when
2	there's a filming over three days and
3	the MTA places piles of bags right along
4	Central Park West along the Trump Hotel,
5	and when they eventually get to pick
6	them up, there are also Transit Police
7	bags. They are sitting out in garbage
8	bags. They all draw lots of rats.
9	The rules must ensure that DOT works
10	with DSNY, BIDs, and SBS to find
11	locations. It's impossible to find
12	locations. We tried to move one little
13	standing only sign that was used for
14	police parking and DOT couldn't do it.
15	So, we had to put a CITIBIN several
16	blocks away, which really taxes the
17	workers.
18	Finally, the rule should apply
19	should include a funding program that
20	would help cover costs for all BIDs.
21	I'm not a small BID. I'm not a large
22	BID. I'm a medium BID. 52 percent of
23	my neighborhood is residential. This is
24	taxing our budget. We we may show a
25	loss this year because we are budgeting

for all sorts of supplies and equipment 1 2 to keep our CITIBINs clean. 3 Our City -- our businesses and 4 property owners are very pleased with 5 the absence of bags on the sidewalks. 6 We really appreciate the support of 7 Chief Lettera -- I saw him there 8 earlier -- and Superintendent Quinn and his staff. They're really trying to 9 10 help us. 11 Currently, we have worked out an 12 informal system that we place the bags 13 when they're -- when there's no pick-up 14 in front of our CITIBINs, but we can't 15 rely on that and I don't think anyone else can. 16 17 This rule imposes an unfunded 18 mandate that punishes and penalizes 19 private nonprofit organizations for 20 providing supplemental services that 21 help DSNY keep the City clean. That's 22 why we were created. This violates the 23 spirit of collaboration and undermines 24 the very foundation that supports our 25 organizations.

Г

125

,

1	Thank you.
2	P.S., my husband I've been
3	married 44 years was Deputy
4	Commissioner for Waste Management at
5	Sanitation. That garage on 57th Street,
6	I went to that opening. I am a
7	sanitation junkie and I'm still
8	horrified.
9	Thank you.
10	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you.
11	The next up is Catie Savage from
12	Litter Legion.
13	(No response.)
14	MS. LIGUORI: Catie?
15	MS. SAVAGE: I just realized I
16	wasn't not un-muted. Sorry.
17	Hi. My name is Catie Savage,
18	founder of the Litter Legion, a
19	volunteer community group based in the
20	Hell's Kitchen neighborhood of
21	Manhattan.
22	I want to start by saying that we
23	recognize the often thankless work of
24	the uniformed men and women of the
25	Department of Sanitation tasked with

1 keeping our City clean and are grateful 2 for their dedication, particularly in the winter, when their jobs get even 3 harder. 4 In 2020 when the City of New York 5 implemented severe budget cuts to 6 7 Department of Sanitation -- particularly in relation to litter basket 8 9 collection -- the Litter Legion was 10 formed to organize volunteers to help 11 keep our community clean. 12 At that time, we not only collected 13 loose litter from the sidewalks and 14 curbs, but also emptied overflowing 15 public litter baskets that stayed overflowing for days. Five years later, 16 17 we continue to organize volunteers to 18 keep our curbs and sidewalks clean and 19 have collected over 13,000 pounds of 20 litter. 21 We have heard from many 22 representatives from business 23 improvement districts that would be 24 impacted by this rule, but as written, 25 it also includes volunteer groups, like

Г

1	the Litter Legion, and dozens of other
2	groups around the City that clean in
3	areas that are not serviced by BIDs or
4	other supplemental sanitation services.
5	To require that these groups
6	purchase, store, and maintain rigid
7	receptacles with tight-fitting lids in
8	order to have their bags of litter
9	collected under threat of fines is
10	frankly outrageous.
11	Despite assurances from leaders
12	within the Department that this rule
13	would not be applied to our
14	organization, the language very clearly
15	includes us. One such leader
16	characterized the purpose of this rule
17	as stopping the practice of abandoned
18	bags being left at public litter
19	baskets.
20	I would argue that the bags placed
21	here by volunteer organizations,
22	non-profits, and BIDs are not abandoned;
23	Rather, they are left at a location most
24	convenient for Sanitation workers to
25	collect without disrupting their regular

1	routes.
2	We ask for a complete rejection of
3	this proposed rule as written and ask
4	that DSNY engage with all the
5	stakeholders who have spoken today on
б	any future proposals that impact our
7	organizations.
8	Thank you.
9	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
10	Next up is Allie Falco from Queens
11	Trash.
12	MS. FALCO: Hello, everybody.
13	Thanks, Catie, for speaking. Catie has
14	been really great about organizing our
15	community clean-up groups together.
16	We're all united in this opposition to
17	this new rule.
18	So, my name is Allie Falco. I'm the
19	founder of the community clean-up group,
20	Queens Trash.
21	I'd like to first thank all the
22	workers of both DSNY and its nonprofit,
23	the Sanitation Foundation, and for you,
24	Madelynn, for sitting through two hours
25	of comments here, and for, you know,

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

129

efforts throughout the City. 1 2 I'm a concerned New Yorker using my 3 own money to supply and host community 4 clean-up and beautification efforts 5 across Queens and Manhattan. This rule, 6 as written, puts an undue hardship on my 7 work and the work of many other 8 volunteer community groups who are 9 helping to clean-up their neighborhoods 10 in their free time, by threatening 11 penalties for dropping bags of public 12 litter next to public containers --13 which I'm assuming in these situations 14 are too full to accept more trash. 15 There's currently a system in place by the Sanitation Foundation -- who does 16 17 great work, by the way -- that allows us to notify DSNY weeks -- two weeks in 18 19 advance of how many garbage bags we will 20 be dropping for collection. Ιt 21 schedules a garbage truck and multiple 22 DSNY workers to pick up these bags at a designated location. 23 24 While this system may work for large 25 planned community clean-ups, it's not

Г

130

1	often efficient to send out a team of
2	DSNY workers for a small to moderate
3	amount of trash that is collected on a
4	daily or weekly basis when routes and
5	clean-up demand are ever-changing.
6	I, along with other volunteer
7	clean-up groups, asked DSNY to consider
8	the following actions:
9	One, a complete rejection of this
10	proposed rule as written.
11	Two, an updated language to
12	specifically exclude volunteer community
13	groups.
14	And, three, a revised system to
15	allow volunteer groups to interface with
16	DSNY or with the Sanitation Foundation
17	in real-time to alert them of clean-up
18	activities resulting in bags being left
19	at public litter baskets for collection,
20	rather than the current system of
21	filling out documents at least two weeks
22	in advance with information that we may
23	not have available at the time.
24	In addition, I'd like to sincerely
25	thank the BIDs that have spoken today,

131

and the representatives, and the -- what 1 2 do we have -- we used to have 120 people in this meeting. Now, we have 98. 3 4 I'd like to thank everyone that's 5 here today for getting involved in the decisions that are affecting their 6 7 communities. I encourage you all to continue speaking up for what you 8 9 believe is right on a daily basis. 10 I would also like to encourage the 11 DSNY to host future meetings on a more 12 accessible platform, such as Zoom. 13 Microsoft Teams is a hard program to 14 access if you do not have a Microsoft 15 account, which is usually something that 16 the general public does not have 17 without, like, an office job. 18 I believe we would have had more 19 people present here today if it was not 20 hosted on Teams. 21 But, thank you, Madelynn. Thank you 22 all for allowing us to speak. 23 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you so much. Ι 24 appreciate it. Next up is Noah Sheroff from the 25

132

Bayside Village BID. 1 2 MR. SHEROFF: Hello. Thank you for allowing me the opportunity to testify. 3 4 I apologize for missing the first round. 5 Thank you to Allie, who just mentioned the issue with Microsoft 6 Teams. It's exactly what I was 7 experiencing and had to call in. 8 9 I wanted to first point out, as many 10 others have, a huge thank you DSNY. Ι 11 think they did a phenomenal job with the 12 snow cleaning operations as -- and -- or 13 -- very often reliable. A special shout 14 out to Antonio Whitaker and Queens 15 Sanitation, garage 11. A lot of what I am about to say has 16 17 been said before, but, yes, we are a 18 small BID. Again, not the smallest 19 business improvement district here in Bayside, Queens; practically just a 20 21 stone's throw away from the Long Island 22 border -- and this proposal -- this 23 policy will deeply impact us, not only 24 from a budget perspective, but also was 25 mentioned from siting concerns and

133

potentially a large public backlash from 1 2 a very vocal community. I -- in addition to that, as has 3 4 also been brought up before, there -- we 5 have one cleaner -- one cleaner -- and still this is taking up about, I want to 6 7 say, a third -- just over a third of our 8 budget to have this one rock star from 9 Streetplus, who was here six days a 10 week, sweeping, cleaning up graffiti, 11 changing hands, making sure Bayside, 12 Queens looks tremendous -- and I'm also 13 concerned that this will put an undue 14 hardship on that one worker to meet 15 these requirements in addition to just 16 potentially increasing the cost for our 17 business improvement district. And I too would like to echo 18 19 concerns that perhaps there is a way for 20 each BID to connect with DSNY as has been done to try and find out a more 21 22 personalized solution for the BIDs, as each community will be affected in a 23 24 different way. 25 Thank you so much.

1 MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much. 2 Next we have Andrew Yen from Cleanup 3 Crown Heights. 4 (No response.) 5 MS. LIGUORI: Okay. Mario Buonviaggio from the Port Richmond North 6 7 Shore Alliance. 8 (No response.) 9 MS. LIGUORI: David Estrada, the 10 Executive Director of the Sunset Park 11 Fifth Avenue BID. He was cut off 12 earlier. 13 (No response.) 14 MS. LIGUORI: Okay. One more time, 15 Andrew Yen from Cleanup Crown Heights. 16 (No response.) 17 MS. LIGUORI: Mario Buonviaggio from 18 Port Richmond North Shore Alliance. 19 (No response.) 20 MS. LIGUORI: David Estrada, 21 Executive Director of the Sunset Park, 22 Fifth Avenue BID. 23 (No response.) 24 MS. LIGUORI: Okay. Is anyone out 25 there that wishes to testify? You can

use the "raise hand" function at this 1 2 point. MS. MIFLIN: (Indicating.) 3 4 MS. LIGUORI: Claire Miflin from the 5 Center for Zero Waste Design. MS. MIFLIN: Yeah, I'd like to 6 7 testify. Thank you so much. I haven't 8 got my formal testimony ready. I will 9 be sending it in later today. 10 But we're a nonprofit that has been 11 advocating for better waste 12 containerization since we released the 13 zero waste design guidelines back in 2017 and we recently released this 14 15 report on containerization that really looked at how the Department of 16 Sanitation could do containerization in 17 18 a way that made it better for labor, 19 better for street-scapes, better for 20 Sanitation workers, and better for 21 BIDs -- and I think there has not been 22 enough consideration about how 23 BID-managed and other community 24 group-managed waste should be 25 containerized -- and this rush to just

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

1	put it in 55 gallon bins is not the best
2	use of our curbside space.
3	We could do stuff that is way more
4	space efficient than 55-gallon bins and
5	I'm already concerned about the number
б	of two-wheel bins on sidewalks from the
7	containerization rules for both one to
8	nine unit buildings and commercial
9	buildings. We see that it really takes
10	a lot of space on the sidewalk and
11	pedestrians can't make their way down.
12	It's not good for storefront businesses
13	to have their storefronts with lines of
14	bins in front and I think there's many
15	ways that containerization could be
16	done.
17	I mean, what the there's more
18	suggesting and what's really out there
19	are these enclosures by CITIBIN or
20	metroSTOR, which are very expensive.
21	Now, the Empire bin they're using may be
22	a better solution, for example, for some
23	of the BIDs that have a lot of waste.
24	It would be take up way less curbside
25	space.

1	So, I think DSNY should be trying
2	some different options with different
3	BIDs. Maybe some BIDs I've heard have
4	access to, say, a commercial loading
5	dock and it needn't be on the street at
б	all.
7	There's many different situations
8	for many different BIDs, some other
9	ones, it could just be there for a few
10	hours and doesn't need to be
11	containerized at all that I think
12	this is definitely not something that
13	can be put on the BIDs to figure out.
14	DSNY needs to work on some
15	solutions. They need to pilot them,
16	evaluate them, and then work with the
17	BIDs and other entities to figure out
18	what can work for them cause, as we've
19	heard time and time again, these are
20	groups that are working really, really
21	hard to help DSNY with litter bin waste
22	and I really think we should be working
23	with them. There should be stakeholder
24	engagement to make it to make it
25	work.

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

Г

138

1	So, thank you so much for the time,
2	Madelynn, and just to end, I really do
3	respect everything the uniformed DSNY
4	people do to help keep our City clean.
5	It's not in any way an attack on them.
6	It's just a suggestion that we plan for
7	something that works for everybody.
8	I appreciate the time to testify.
9	MS. LIGUORI: Thank you very much.
10	Okay. Last call for Andrew Yen from
11	Cleanup Crown Heights.
12	(No response.)
13	MS. LIGUORI: Mario Buonviaggio from
14	Port Richmond North Shore Alliance.
15	(No response.)
16	MS. LIGUORI: And David Estrada, the
17	Executive Director of the Sunset Park
18	Fifth Avenue BID.
19	(No response.)
20	MS. LIGUORI: If anyone else wishes
21	to testify, you may use the "raise hand"
22	function.
23	(No response.)
24	MS. LIGUORI: Okay. Seeing none,
25	I'm going to call this hearing to a

1	close.
2	Thank you, everyone, for testifying
3	today. The Department will consider all
4	comments it receives.
5	If you would still like to if you
6	would still like to submit written
7	comments, you may do so until close of
8	business today at nycrules@dsny.nyc.gov
9	or you may use the NYC Rules website and
10	post directly there.
11	Thank you, everyone, for coming and
12	I hope that you have a wonderful day.
13	(Time noted: 12:02 p.m.)
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1 2 CERTIFICATE 3 4 STATE OF NEW YORK) 5 :SS 6 COUNTY OF NASSAU) 7 8 I, Julia M. Speros, a Notary Public 9 within and for the State of New York, do hereby 10 certify: 11 I reported the proceedings in the 12 within-entitled matter, and that the within 13 transcript is a true record of such proceedings 14 to the best of my ability. 15 I further certify that I am not 16 related to any of the parties to this action by 17 blood or marriage; and that I am in no way 18 interested in the outcome of this matter. 19 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto 20 set my hand this 10th day of February, 2025. 21 22 23 Julia M. Speros 24 25

LH REPORTING SERVICES, INC. 718-526-7100

February 10, 2025 141		
\$145000 108:9	50th 34:4	accessible 39:17 131:12
\$150000 76:10	55gallon 96:24 136:4	accommodate 96:14 97:5
\$20000 109:6	57th 125:5	accomplish 57:15
\$225000 108:5	5th 3:8 67:21 68:7	accordance 5:11 6:16 7:8
\$255000 82:11	64th 68:8	accordingly 12:6
\$28000 108:13	6th 75:2	account 39:1 88:13 90:5
\$380000 108:8	82nd 116:14	131:15 (4)
\$390000 55:14	96th 92:13	accounting 28:7
\$400 76:14	abandoned 127:17,22	accurate 84:6
\$40000 83:12 109:11	abandoning 13:20	accurately 9:23
\$50000 16:19	ability 13:2,14 32:3 36:9 39:13 47:11 49:23 107:7	ace 2:20 46:10,13,17,20 47:5,16 48:4,8,16,20,24,25 49:5 50:6 116:11 118:6,19 (18)
\$60000 79:4	140:14 (9)	ace's 47:11 48:2 49:23
'22 78:24	able 6:5 13:9 20:22 30:14 36:2,4 52:6,13 59:15 62:2	achieve 14:4 32:25 51:10
'24 58:17 108:7 109:4	105:13 110:1 114:25 117:18 (14)	52:19 54:16 63:17 72:8 73:3 84:19 99:17 (10)
10th 140:20	about 11:23 19:13 25:19	achieving 86:10
10year 76:12	27:20 52:3 63:8 78:10 80:17 82:11 86:22 89:10 91:9 94:22	ackert 3:3 57:20,23,25 (4)
110th 92:13	103:17 106:12 111:7 115:17 118:15 128:14 132:16 133:6	acknowledge 11:20 46:14
125th 4:125 105:6 106:24	135:22 136:5 (23)	acknowledgement 14:18
16120e2 6:9 7:6,25 8:3 (4)	absence 124:5	acquire 71:15
1980s 38:12	absolutely 22:4 42:2	across 8:14 34:1 46:23 64:5
1st 18:16 20:10 47:19 54:4 62:19 80:23 99:7 (7)	absorb 76:17 114:21	120:8 129:5 (6)
26block 68:6	accelerate 52:20,23	act 5:13
30year 119:15	accelerated 19:16	action 20:5 140:16
38th 34:4 68:8	accept 129:14	actions 130:8
40yearold 94:25	acceptable 38:15 96:20	actively 75:7
50gallon 109:3	accepting 8:20	activities 130:18
Juganun 107.3	access 131:14 137:4	activity 97:21

to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services			
	February 10, 2025	142	
actual 113:15	advance 9:15 129:19 130:22	agreements 86:13 98:19 106:8	
actually 39:6 84:7 103:8 109:18 110:24 118:8 119:22	advancing 99:21	ahead 62:9	
(7)	advertised 108:17 advocated 58:24	aim 25:16	
adapt 86:17 added 46:8	advocated 38:24 advocating 135:11	aimed 92:16 97:14	
addiction 49:15	affected 116:23 133:23	ak14 82:2	
adding 26:21 63:19 78:23	affecting 131:6	alarm 33:24	
83:10 84:14 96:19 (6)	affiliation 9:19,21	albeit 37:14	
addition 20:25 56:12,18 76:18 103:16 111:6 130:24	affirming 11:17	albert 3:21 99:25 100:4	
133:3,15 (9)	afford 23:9 26:24 28:9 48:20	alert 130:17	
additional 16:10 17:10 21:15 32:12 34:10 49:20 63:22 71:1	(4) affordable 27:22	alex 11:1 alexa 89:15	
101:10 102:23 109:11 121:17 (12)	affront 44:6	align 8:7 88:7 98:13	
additionally 5:21 17:21 31:24 97:10 (4)	after 10:19 47:14 49:6 76:14	aligned 39:12	
address 70:11 86:9 98:9 107:19 (4)	(4) again 25:22 60:13 67:16	alignment 86:3	
addressed 105:18	108:4 110:17 111:14 122:9 132:18 137:19 (9)	aligns 8:10	
addresses 72:6 122:17	against 31:25 101:23	alike 93:9	
addressing 82:18	agencies 39:9 70:2 71:2	allard 22:6	
adequate 114:7	72:22,24 93:7 95:6 98:24 110:24 111:17 122:24 (11)	alliance 2:9,19 3:4,6,11,14 10:22 11:13,16 12:24 13:23 43:2,5 57:22 58:2,3,24	
adhere 47:17 70:20	agency 2:4 5:6 12:8 23:11 27:16 52:13 55:18 71:1 74:3	60:13,16 65:3,7,10 72:13,18 81:8,12 134:7,18 138:14 (29)	
adjust 86:15	100:11 122:6 (11)	allie 4:11 128:10,18 132:5 (4)	
administration's 89:23	agnostic 27:19	allocate 21:1	
administrative 5:12 6:10 7:7 8:1,4 70:23 (6)	ago 37:13 72:23 73:12 78:1 82:4 95:11 (6)	allocations 48:24	
administrators 95:5	agree 22:10 105:20	allotted 27:1	
adopt 13:10 47:16 55:7	agreed 23:24 95:18	allow 25:11 34:12 35:18 50:12 70:16 122:20 130:15 (7)	
adopted 20:14 54:6 70:14	agreement 24:14 33:19	allowed 63:5	

to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services			
	February 10, 2025	143	
allowing 72:19 92:4 131:22 132:3 (4)	amendments 87:17 89:11	applying 70:23	
allows 28:13 129:17	amenities 67:9 among 72:23 121:3	appreciate 29:22 31:14 77:7 81:23 89:13 91:23 94:10 107:12 119:20 124:6 131:24	
almost 19:11,12 37:1 92:24 108:9 119:15 (6)	amount 7:2,20 31:12 54:7	138:8 (12)	
alone 20:8 35:24 64:15 76:10 86:25 (5)	68:9 78:16 103:21 130:3 (8) amsterdam 92:12	approach 33:21 38:21 40:12 69:24 95:8,25 97:23 98:8 104:4 (9)	
along 25:14,18 34:20 55:2	analysis 22:21 48:7	approaches 98:13	
64:4 97:3 102:10 107:14 123:3,4 130:6 (11)	andor 93:12	appropriate 18:1 19:23	
alongside 25:3	andrew 10:12,15 134:2,15 138:10 (5)	approval 17:20 32:11 54:1 59:8 87:7 121:7 (6)	
already 13:17 16:22 27:3 40:22 62:11 82:11 85:3 87:10 91:11 96:13 102:13 113:12,22	annual 15:20 16:21 55:14 76:11 79:5 82:13 96:12 (7)	approvals 97:6	
114:6 136:5 (15)	annually 34:8 36:24 58:14	approve 32:3 59:24 73:17	
also 6:2 7:10 9:25 15:11 18:2 20:11,18 22:13 24:21 26:25 37:6 41:3,10 53:25 56:21 61:3	another 14:11 38:20 79:20 109:13 118:16 (5)	approved 54:2 60:7 67:1 70:15 75:17 120:5 (6)	
62:15 63:10 71:14 72:18 77:5 83:25 87:9 97:16 98:8 102:8 103:19 111:2,6 113:4	answer 73:10	approximately 16:18 108:13 120:12	
116:11,14 123:6 126:14,25 131:10 132:24 133:4,12 (39)	anticipated 76:12	arduous 60:1	
alter 75:18 93:12	antonio 132:14 anymore 30:15	are 10:2,9,11 12:4,20,21 13:17 17:16 18:8,23 19:15 22:24 23:2,8,17 24:22 25:2,7	
alternating 96:21	anyone 9:16 122:11 124:15	27:12,23 28:12 30:22 31:14,21 32:12 34:9,18 35:1,20,25	
alternative 98:13 102:12 106:1,2 (4)	134:24 138:20 (5)	36:8,8 40:22 41:18,20 42:21 43:16,19 44:9,24 45:17	
alternatives 28:23	apartment 24:8 apologize 132:4	46:17,18 51:8,11 53:7,14 54:2,16 55:10 56:23 59:23 60:12 62:2,3,11 65:17 66:17	
although 74:7	appears 113:8	68:19 71:19 75:9,13,16 76:15 77:13 78:14 80:1 83:9 85:3	
altogether 21:4 56:7 64:1 100:13 (4)	applicable 25:9	86:2,11 87:12 89:1 90:15 91:4,7,11 92:16,20,25 96:8,25 97:10 99:10 101:2 0 17 102:12	
always 65:14 77:13	applications 71:3	97:10 99:10 101:2,9,17 102:13 103:18 104:16 109:12 110:5,5,7,9,15,20,22	
am 10 5:4 18:24 40:20 107:1 108:1 125:6 132:16 140:15,17	applied 66:24 121:16 127:13	110:3,3,7,9,13,20,22 111:8,15,18 113:21,22 114:4,20,25 116:3,10	
(10)	applies 65:13	117:3,4,6,7,18 118:24 120:19,20,21 122:1,3,4,15	
amendment 55:8,22 57:12 90:3,12,19 (6)	apply 121:4 122:23 123:18	123:6,7,25 124:4 126:1 127:3,22,23 129:8,14 130:5	

to Entitles	Engaging in Cleaning S	
	February 10, 2025	144
131:6 132:17 136:19,20 137:19,20 (138)	assumes 104:3	avenues 92:12
area 9:18 58:4 74:25	assuming 106:15 129:13	average 62:1 102:4
118:16,17 (5)	assurances 127:11	aviles 3:17 89:6,15
areas 6:15 43:19 79:17 117:17 118:21 127:3 (6)	assured 45:4	awaiting 37:9
argue 127:20	astronomical 111:15	awarded 108:13
around 10:19 15:18 16:8 27:2	atlantic 2:22 54:22,25	away 22:19 45:14 54:5 81:22 123:16 132:21 (6)
28:7 104:14 113:1 127:2 (8)	55:1,2,13 (6)	
art 65:22 104:7	attack 138:5	awful 23:22
articulate 25:14	attempted 109:22	back 10:18 68:21 76:3 135:13 (4)
aside 63:5 85:9	attempts 100:24	backlash 133:1
ask 6:7 9:25 10:3 63:19 88:16	attending 5:8	bag 33:1 51:23
99:10 111:2 128:2,3 (9)	attention 35:4 88:23 89:13	bagfree 14:23
asked 46:5 59:3 72:24 84:8	91:13 107:12 110:18 (6)	
130:7 (5)	attitude 65:12	bagged 35:14 87:13
asking 101:19 110:20,22 111:6 (4)	attract 8:6	bagging 61:22 79:7 85:24 87:24 93:20 101:22 (6)
	attracted 17:3	
asks 9:14	attraction 88:7	bags 7:21 8:5 14:3 19:9 22:12 25:6,21 31:9 37:1,9,15,25
assessed 101:12	attractions 30:4	41:14 42:7 44:21,23 45:12 46:25 47:6,23,25 50:24
assesses 12:5	attractive 76:1 93:8	51:4,8,19 56:2 58:23 61:11 62:1,3,6 63:14 64:3,15 69:12
assessment 16:21 34:7,12		70:17 73:8 75:6,9 81:19 82:9
82:13 101:10,15 108:5 (7)	audio 30:20	83:5,8 98:18 102:5,14 109:4,4,7,9 110:2 118:3,8,10
assessments 86:15 96:16	augment 34:11	121:11 122:20 123:3,7,8 124:5,12 127:8,18,20
assist 100:20 106:6	august 17:14 18:16 20:10 25:12 35:24 47:18 50:23 54:4	129:11,19,22 130:18 (68)
assistance 53:5 78:13	62:19 67:3 80:23 99:7 (12)	balance 40:13 67:8
association 3:5,9 7:16,17 41:5	available 9:2 33:11 130:23	barbara 2:19 42:25 43:4
50:20 51:3,16 60:24 61:3,6 68:24 69:3 (13)	avenue 2:10,18,21,22 3:8,20	barclays 30:4
association's 41:7	4:5 15:3,10 22:4 34:5,7,21 40:25 41:3 50:16,20 51:3	based 98:25 101:11 112:10
associations 31:21 90:20	54:22,25 55:1,3,13 67:21 68:7 75:2 94:8,15 97:3 99:3 107:23	125:19 (4)
assume 101:20	108:4,11 134:11,22 138:18 (36)	bases 15:15 69:11 108:6

to Entitles	Eligaging in cleaning	
	February 10, 2025	145
basic 109:1,24,24	begun 51:17	61:3,5,6 65:7,10 67:21 68:1,3
basically 23:18 48:23 117:4	behalf 3:17 61:2 85:22	69:4,18,22 70:19 72:4 74:8,17,22 77:21,24 78:1,4
basicany 25.10 +0.25 117.4	89:5,14 100:5 107:1 112:6	79:3 80:16 84:17,18,18
basis 130:4 131:9	119:13 (9)	85:11,20,22 87:14 92:2,8,24
		94:8 95:10 99:3 101:16
basket 7:4,23 51:19 109:24	behind 120:18	102:1,3,20,22,25 103:6 105:14
110:3 111:5 113:2,6 126:8 (9)		106:14 107:24 108:4,11,25
	being 34:24 41:8 44:5 56:24	109:18 110:9 116:14
basketplus 109:23 111:5	60:9 62:9 63:18 66:17 72:5	118:14,18 119:11,14
	78:10 81:1,2 84:8 87:13 95:4	123:21,22,22 132:1,18 133:20
baskets 6:25 51:6 82:10 108:7	100:25 110:9 116:22 117:18	134:11,22 138:18 (104)
109:20 110:5,10 116:13 119:5	119:2 127:18 130:18 (22)	
126:15 127:19 130:19 (12)		bid'er 93:20
50.5	believe 17:14 30:18 80:4,13	
battery 58:5	90:11 120:1 131:9,18 (8)	bid's 75:15 101:1,13,15 (4)
bauer 2:18 40:19,24 41:1,2	believes 59:1 69:18 78:4	bidmanaged 135:23
(5)		8
	belong 17:23	bids 11:24 12:3,3,10,17,20
bayside 4:12 10:8 132:1,20		13:13,20 15:17 17:15,21,24,24
133:11 (5)	beloved 23:7	18:3,4 20:22 21:2 22:24 31:20
		32:24 34:1,9,14 38:8,12,16
bear 87:19 98:6	ben 3:3 57:20,25	39:5,16,25 40:5,9 43:9 45:8
		46:16 50:23 52:14 53:2,2
beautification 4:7 23:14	benches 104:7	54:11,14 55:9 57:5,5,8,11
115:13,20,25 129:4 (6)		61:7,16,25 62:2,6,10,14,21,23
	benefits 45:15 91:3 107:4	63:21,24 65:13 66:6,13
beautiful 32:19 42:21	110:15 (4)	67:2,11,15 70:2,23 71:14,19
	b	72:21 73:24 75:12,13 77:10
beautifying 86:4	bernstein 3:18 91:18,22,25 (4)	78:15 79:6,25 80:5 81:17 84:23 85:2 86:8,11,16,21
because 12:4,21 13:1,11	(4)	87:10,15,18,23 88:18 90:24
14:6,7 42:13 48:1 55:18 80:19	best 72:5,25 80:18 81:1 136:1	92:7,23 93:5 94:24 95:17,22
83:19 93:1 111:8,9,10 112:18	140:14 (6)	97:18 98:11,20,25 99:10
113:19 123:25 (18)	140.14 (0)	100:17,25 101:5,9,17,24
113.17 123.23 (10)	betraval 57:10	102:2,16 103:13 104:12,21
becomes 115:3	betruyur 57.10	105:2 106:7 107:6,14 108:3
	better 45:23,24 58:25	110:24 111:17 120:15 122:13
beds 115:23 116:5	135:11,18,19,19,20 136:22 (9)	123:10,20 127:3,22 130:25
	, , - , - , ()	133:22 135:21 136:23
before 70:13 78:25 95:22	between 15:19 20:9 48:11	137:3,3,8,13,17 (132)
120:1 132:17 133:4 (6)	57:11 58:19 68:8 95:24 96:21	
	103:20 (9)	bids' 56:13 88:13
beg 25:23		
	beyond 52:8 114:18	big 41:16 82:14 106:19
began 59:8 109:20		118:12 (4)
	bid 2:10,14,18,21,22	
begin 9:10 10:6 36:1 49:17	3:5,8,12,13,20 4:5,9,12 10:8	bigbelly 31:6 58:20
(4)	14:21 15:3 19:6,20 20:14 21:6 24:6 26:6,12 27:7 38:22 40:25	bin 92:22 136:21 137:21
beginning 47:18	41:3,4 43:5,17 44:4,6,10 50:16	DIII 72.22 130.21 137.21
Juganning 77.10	54:22,25 55:1,13 58:3 60:24	bins 24:13 56:17,18,20,22,23
	 , _ ² = 5511,15 = 5015 = 0012 T	~

to Entitles	Engaging in Cleaning S	Services
	February 10, 2025	146
59:13,23 63:6 87:2 114:7 117:13,15,17 118:4,7	bridge 58:4	bus 102:10 103:25
136:1,4,6,14 (20)	bring 23:5 38:14 52:24 118:12 120:15 (5)	bushwick 4:6 112:3,6,10,15 113:25 114:20 (7)
bis 41:7	bringing 83:20	busiest 74:1 100:7
bit 80:20 111:21,21,22 (4)		
blair 2:19 43:1,3,4 (4)	broader 88:18	business 2:12,16 3:19,22 4:125 7:15 13:5 15:11 19:3
block 15:15 34:6 39:14 69:11	broadly 115:7	21:22 29:24 33:6,17 39:21 42:19 55:9 58:7 74:20 76:25
108:6 120:8 (6)	bronx 15:12 18:16 100:8	82:20 83:1 86:14 91:20 94:15 100:2 105:6 106:25 120:2,24
blocks 24:4 34:2,5 53:19 104:5,6 123:16 (7)	brooklyn 2:15 29:5,21,23 30:1,5,6 31:10 32:16 55:4,4,6 58:4 68:7 81:15 89:16 94:17	121:25 126:22 132:19 133:17 139:8 (34)
blood 140:17	112:10 (18)	businesses 7:1 15:15 24:3 26:23 39:15 41:17 42:10,14
bloomingdale 92:14	brought 133:4	44:7 55:2 56:1 58:13 65:20
blum 4:9 119:10,12	bruce 2:13 26:5,7,11 (4)	81:13 83:1 100:9 103:5,22 120:16,19 124:3 136:12 (22)
bluntly 104:25,25	budget 15:20 19:13 20:15,19,23 23:6 26:20 27:2	busy 31:2 78:17
board 12:7 17:19 20:2 45:1,19 55:11 75:14 76:5	28:17 35:8,23 55:14,21 66:15 76:12 79:5 92:8 102:1,21,25	buying 71:12
79:15 105:12 107:2 (11)	108:8,10 120:12 123:24 126:6 132:24 133:8 (27)	byproduct 31:2
boards 5:24 96:8		byrne 3:17 89:4,7
boerum 55:5	budgeting 123:25	byrnes 2:11 18:20,23,24 19:1
border 132:22	budgets 13:16 75:16 86:12 96:8,14 (5)	21:19 (6)
bordering 15:13	building 24:8 38:24 73:22	c 2:2 105:5 140:2,2 (4)
boroughs 46:24 48:13 65:21	buildings 100:10 117:5	call 17:13 51:12 83:7 113:23 132:8 138:10,25 (7)
both 23:12 27:24 49:7 54:14	120:17,20 136:8,9 (6)	calling 9:10 10:6
65:16 73:1 89:20 92:11 128:22 136:7 (10)	built 66:8	camelia 2:12 21:20
boulevard 34:3,20	bulkhead 6:13	cameras 16:11
boundaries 92:11	buonviaggio 10:21 134:6,17 138:13 (4)	can 6:7 9:23 15:5 21:7,9
bounded 75:1	burden 49:4,20 57:2 70:6,23	25:8,19 26:8 27:18 28:24 30:16,18,21 31:15 32:24 39:11
break 110:8	76:16 77:9 87:19 90:10 98:7 (10)	42:4,22 47:8 53:9 59:23 60:17 63:14,21 64:10 67:2,16 70:20
breath 74:12	burdens 75:11 86:17	78:9 79:3 84:18 94:2 95:19 98:18 101:13 111:4 124:16
brickandmortar 103:5	burdensome 43:18	134:25 137:13,18 (40)

can't 26:20,25 27:17 28:9 114:15 120:1 124:14 136:11 cbi 112:7.9,14 113:10,12,25 114:19 (7) chat 9:18 40:23 46:7 (8) case 63:25 chief 124:7 canal 75:3 center 4:13 30:5 135:5 chiefs 57:24 chief 124:7 center 4:13 30:5 135:5 choice 63:25 canal 75:3 central 2:17 33:10 36:16 37:3 choice 63:25 64:14 66:11 86:15 93:3 58:7 76:24 123:4 (7) chose 12:17 96:14,15 114:13 (15) centralized 37:17 chose 12:25 capacities 80:22 91:12 centralized 37:17 chose 12:25 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacities 80:22 91:27 certify 140:10,15 citlibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: capacities 80:22 91:2 certify 140:10,15 citlibin 28:14 47:22 78:23 capacities 80:22 91:2 certify 140:10,15 citlibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: capacities 80:22 10 certify 140:10,15 citlibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: careful 22:20 chal		February 10, 2025	147
(8) chief 124:7 canal 75:3 case 63:25 chief 57:24 cannot 13:4 18:16 38:11 center 4:13 30:5 135:5 choice 63:25 cannot 13:4 18:16 38:11 center 4:13 30:5 135:5 choice 63:25 cannot 13:4 18:16 38:11 central 2:17 33:10 36:16 37:3 choice 63:25 d4:14 66:11 86:15 93:3 58:7 76:24 123:4 (7) choice 63:25 cans 13:24 23:19 31:7 34:20 centralized 37:17 chose 12:17 capacities 80:22 91:12 central 2:17 19:18 central 2:25 capacity 13:12 32:21 55:19 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacity 13:12 32:21 55:19 certainy 72:8 107:13 circumstances 122:16 capital 26:1 certification 96:3 cit 69:16 careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 citibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 careful 9:796:9 chailenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 carter 45:14 chailenge 16:8 17:11 59:19 s8:15 11:21 12:8,810 13:13 carter 45:14 chailenge 8:7 51:11 s8:12 96:19 (5) s8:13 23:13 3:13 25 5:16,23 3:23 46:55 66:4:2 75:19 101:14 change 74:4 88:13 92:21 city 3 5:12,21 33:14 39:41 s8:13 13:13 3:13 3:12 57:6,11,13 38:31,12 29:	,	cbi 112:7,9,14 113:10,12,25	
canal 75:3chiefs 57:24cannot 13:4 18:16 38:11 44:3.13 55:18 57:9 61:23 64:14 66:11 86:15 93:3 96:14,15 114:13 (15)central 2:17 33:10 36:16 37:3 58:7 76:24 123:4 (7)choice 63:25 choice 13:25cans 13:24 23:19 31:7 34:20 55:3 41:22 61:23 64:4 79:9,17 			chief 124:7
cannot 13:4 18:16 38:11 44:3,13 55:18 57:9 61:23 64:14 66:11 86:15 93:3 96:14,15 114:13 (15) central 2:17 33:10 36:16 37:3 58:7 76:24 123:4 (7) choking 27:5 centralization 70:18 choking 27:5 choking 27:5 centralization 70:18 chose 12:17 cans 13:24 23:19 31:7 34:20 centralized 37:17 chose 12:25 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 72:8 107:13 circumstances 122:16 capatil 26:1 certification 96:3 cite 69:16 capacities 20:2 certify 140:10,15 citibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) certify 140:10,15 citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (2) careful 9:7 96:9 challenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 carter 38:2 challenge 16:8 17:11 59:19 88:12 96:19 (5) 35:14,22,23 3:16 34:1,15 carte 16:14 change 74:4 88:13 92:21 46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22,23 35:4,21 52:16,23,23,12,22 (4) chaireg 8:7 51:11 58:25 61:5,7,21,32 58:25 61:5,	canal 75:3		chiefs 57:24
64:14 66:11 86:15 93:3 96:14,15 114:13 (15) 58:7 76:24 123:4 (7) choking 27:5 cans 13:24 23:19 31:7 34:20 35:3 41:22 61:23 64:4 79:9,17 101:1,2 102:5 122:22 (14) centralization 70:18 choose 12:17 capacities 80:22 91:12 centralized 37:17 chose 12:25 capacity 13:12 32:21 55:19 56:13 79:18 84:2 91:2 (7) certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacity 13:12 32:21 55:19 56:13 79:18 84:2 91:2 (7) certification 96:3 cite 69:16 capriciously 71:5 certify 140:10,15 citbin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 citbin 28:1 47:22 78:23 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (2) careful 9:7 96:9 chailenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 88:12 96:19 (5) carter 38:2 challenge 16:8 17:11 59:19 88:12 96:19 (5) city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 23:7,16,16 24:23 25:3,625 26:17 31:23 32:18 34:1,15 carter 38:2 challenge 74:4 88:13 92:21 104:24 122:9,9 (6) 46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,1			choice 63:25
cans 13:24 23:19 31:7 34:20 35:3 41:22 61:23 64:4 79:9,17 101:1,2 102:5 122:22 (14) centralized 37:17 ceo 33:9 36:15 chose 12:25 chunk 82:14 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 24:21 119:24 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 circumstances 122:16 capacity 13:12 32:21 55:19 56:13 79:18 84:2 91:2 (7) certification 96:3 cite 69:16 capital 26:1 certify 140:10,15 citibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) certulo 2:17 33:9 36:14,18,21,22 40:18 (7) citibins 28:14 47:22 78:23 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (2) careful 22:20 challenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 8:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13 16:21 20:17 21:1,12 carter 38:2 challenge 16:8 17:11 59:19 88:12 96:19 (5) 23:10,61 24:23 25:3,625 26:17 31:23 32:18 34:1,15 carting 51:2 challengin 29:1 60:7 121:21 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: 44:33,10,13 45:16,23,23 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13 88:12 96:19 (5) 58:25 61:5,7,21 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13 88:12,22 61:7 31:23 32:18 34:1,15 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13 88:25 61:5,7,21 64:25,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:12 78:24 79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 82:6 87:11,16 90:5,8 64:2 67:1,16 90:5,8 64:2 67:1,16 90:5,8 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25 64:2 67:1,16 90:5,8 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25 64:2 67:1,16 90:5,8 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25 64:2 67:1,4,22	64:14 66:11 86:15 93:3		choking 27:5
35:3 41:22 61:23 64:4 79:9,17 101:1,2 102:5 122:22 (14) centralized 37:17 chose 12:25 capacities 80:22 91:12 ceo 33:9 36:15 chunk 82:14 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacity 13:12 32:21 55:19 56:13 79:18 84:2 91:2 (7) certainly 72:8 107:13 circumstances 122:16 capital 26:1 certification 96:3 cite 69:16 capriciously 71:5 certify 140:10,15 citibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) cerullo 2:17 33:9 36:14,18,21,22 40:18 (7) citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (0) careful 22:20 challenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 8:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13 16:21 20:17 21:1,12 careful 9:7 96:9 challenges 16:8 17:11 59:19 88:12 96:19 (5) city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 8:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13 16:21 20:17 21:1,12 carter 38:2 challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: 44:3,3,10,13 45:16;2,32 cate 16:14 change 8:7 51:11 52:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,22 53:4,21 55:16,11,13 53:4,21 55:16,11,13 cate 4:10 125:11,14,17 changing 133:11 89:25,7,23,25 cate 4:10 125:11,14,17 changing 133:11 79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 128:13,13 (6) character 38:23		centralization 70:18	choose 12:17
ceo 33:9 36:15 chunk 82:14 capacities 80:22 91:12 certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacity 13:12 32:21 55:19 certainly 72:8 107:13 circumstances 122:16 capital 26:1 certification 96:3 cite 69:16 capriciously 71:5 certify 140:10,15 citibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) certulo 2:17 33:9 36:14,18,21,22 40:18 (7) citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7.7 carter 45:14 challenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7.7 carter 38:2 challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21 35:10,21 32:18 34:1,15 carting 51:2 challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: 44:3,3,10,13 45:16,23,23 (4) change 74:4 88:13 92:21 104:24 122:9,9 (6) 46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 (4) 52:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,22 53:4,21 55:15 66:4 (10) 52:27,714 78:14 58:25 61:5,7,21 cate 1:17 89:4 (10) 58:25 61:5,7,21 cate 4:10 125:11,14,17 changing 133:11 79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25	35:3 41:22 61:23 64:4 79:9,17	centralized 37:17	chose 12:25
certain 24:21 119:24 churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,1 capacity 13:12 32:21 55:19 certainly 72:8 107:13 circumstances 122:16 capital 26:1 certification 96:3 cite 69:16 capriciously 71:5 certify 140:10,15 citibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) certify 140:10,15 citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7.7 careful 9:7 96:9 challenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7.7 carter 38:2 challenges 16:8 17:11 59:19 23:7,16,16 24:23 25:3,6,25 carting 51:2 challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: (4) change 74:4 88:13 92:21 14:3,3,10,13 45:16,23,23 (4) change 74:4 88:13 92:21 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: (4) 29:7,25 50:48 52:21,22,23 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13 catch 16:14 change 74:4 88:13 92:21 59:7,02 78:24 73:25 (4) 104:24 122:9,9 (6) 59:7,02 78:24 73:25 76:48 52:21,22,23 (51:1,16,0) cate 3:17 89:4 changing 133:11 79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 82:6,15,7,21 (28:1,25:6:19 137:18		ceo 33:9 36:15	chunk 82:14
56:13 79:18 84:2 91:2 (7) certainly 72:8 107:13 circumstances 122:16 capital 26:1 certification 96:3 cite 69:16 capiciously 71:5 certify 140:10,15 citbin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) 36:14,18,21,22 40:18 (7) citbins 28:1 47:22 78:23 careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7.7 careful 45:14 challenges 16:8 17:11 59:19 re:11 121 12:8,810 13:13 carter 38:2 88:12 96:19 (5) 23:7,16,16 24:23 25:3,6,25 carting 51:2 challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: case 45:6 64:2 75:19 101:14 change 74:4 88:13 92:21 46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 (4) 104:24 122:9,9 (6) 49:7,25 50:48 52:21,22,23 catch 16:14 changes 8:7 51:11 58:25 61:5,7,21 cate 4:10 125:11,14,17 changing 133:11 79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 128:13,13 (6) character 38:23 92:5,7,23,25 cause 23:12 56:19 137:18 character 38:23 92:5,7,08:24 99:14,22	-	certain 24:21 119:24	churchflatbush 3:14 81:8,12
capriciously 71:5 certify 140:10,15 citibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83: 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) cerullo 2:17 33:9 36:14,18,21,22 40:18 (7) citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (1) careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (1) carted 45:14 challenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 8:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13 16:21 20:17 21:1,12 carter 38:2 challenges 16:8 17:11 59:19 88:12 96:19 (5) city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 8:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13 16:21 20:17 21:1,12 carter 51:2 challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: 44:3,3,10,13 45:16,23,23 case 45:6 64:2 75:19 101:14 (4) change 74:4 88:13 92:21 104:24 122:9,9 (6) 58:25 61:5,7,21 catch 16:14 changes 8:7 51:11 52:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,22 58:25 61:5,7,21 catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 128:13,13 (6) changing 133:11 79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 82:6 87:11,16 90:5,8 cause 23:12 56:19 137:18 character 38:23 92:5,7,23,25	1 V	certainly 72:8 107:13	circumstances 122:16
care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) cerulo 2:17 33:9 36:14,18,21,22 40:18 (7) 108:1 109:23 121:6 123:15 136:19 (9) careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (9) carefully 9:7 96:9 challenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 8:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13 16:21 20:17 21:1,12 carted 45:14 challenges 16:8 17:11 59:19 88:12 96:19 (5) 16:21 20:17 21:1,12 23:7,16,16 24:23 25:3,6,25 26:17 31:23 32:18 34:1,15 carting 51:2 challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21 (4) 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: 44:3,3,10,13 45:16,23,23 case 45:6 64:2 75:19 101:14 (4) change 74:4 88:13 92:21 104:24 122:9,9 (6) 49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13 58:25 61:5,7,21 64:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14 79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 82:6 87:11,16 90:5,8 92:5,7,23,25 cause 23:12 56:19 137:18 character 38:23 92:5,7,23,25 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25	capital 26:1	certification 96:3	cite 69:16
care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4) cerullo 2:17 33:9 36:14,18,21,22 40:18 (7) 136:19 (9) careful 22:20 chairman 100:5 citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (9) carefully 9:7 96:9 challenge 80:11 108:16 city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7 8:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13 16:21 20:17 21:1,12 carter 38:2 challenges 16:8 17:11 59:19 88:12 96:19 (5) 23:7,16,16 24:23 25:3,6,25 26:17 31:23 32:18 34:1,15 carter 51:2 challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21 35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: 44:3,3,10,13 45:16,23,23 case 45:6 64:2 75:19 101:14 (4) change 74:4 88:13 92:21 104:24 122:9,9 (6) 46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13 catch 16:14 changes 8:7 51:11 52:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,22 64:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 77:12 47:26,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14 catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 changing 133:11 79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 82:6 87:11,16 90:5,8 128:13,13 (6) character 38:23 92:5,7,23,25 cause 23:12 56:19 137:18 character 38:23 92:5,70,98:24 99:14,22	capriciously 71:5	certify 140:10,15	citibin 16:16 35:11 59:7 83:24
carefully 9:7 96:9chairman 100:579:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (carted 45:14challenge 80:11 108:16city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7carter 38:288:12 96:19 (5)16:21 20:17 21:1,12carting 51:2challenging 29:1 60:7 121:2135:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41:case 45:6 64:2 75:19 101:14change 74:4 88:13 92:2146:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22(4)104:24 122:9,9 (6)49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23catch 16:14changes 8:7 51:1158:25 61:5,7,21cate 3:17 89:452:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,2264:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4(10)70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25128:13,13 (6)changing 133:1179:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25cause 23:12 56:19 137:18character 38:2392:5,7,23,25cause 23:12 56:19 137:18character 38:2392:5,7,23,25	care 66:5 115:21 116:7,12 (4)		
carted 45:14challenge 80:11 108:16city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7carter 45:14challenges 16:8 17:11 59:198:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13carter 38:288:12 96:19 (5)16:21 20:17 21:1,12carting 51:2challenging 29:1 60:7 121:2135:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41:case 45:6 64:2 75:19 101:14change 74:4 88:13 92:2146:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22(4)104:24 122:9,9 (6)49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23catch 16:14changes 8:7 51:1158:25 61:5,7,21cate 3:17 89:452:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,2264:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4(10)70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25128:13,13 (6)character 38:2392:5,7,23,25cause 23:12 56:19 137:18character 38:2392:5,7,23,25character 39:295:5,20 98:24 99:14,22	careful 22:20	chairman 100:5	citibins 28:1 47:22 78:23 79:18 121:9,13,17 124:2,14 (9)
carted 45:14challenges 16:8 17:11 59:198:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13carter 38:288:12 96:19 (5)23:7,16,16 24:23 25:3,6,25carting 51:2challenging 29:1 60:7 121:2125:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41:(4)change 74:4 88:13 92:2144:3,3,10,13 45:16,23,23(4)change 74:4 88:13 92:2146:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22(4)104:24 122:9,9 (6)49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23(5)53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13(4)changes 8:7 51:11(5)52:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,22(6)70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25(7)70:2 77:14 78:14(7)changing 133:11(7)79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25128:13,13 (6)character 38:23(7)93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25(7)93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25(7)93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25(7)93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25	carefully 9:7 96:9	challenge 80:11 108:16	city 3 5:12,19,23 6:10 7:7
carter 38:288:12 96:19 (5)23:7,16,16 24:23 25:3,6,25 26:17 31:23 32:18 34:1,15carting 51:2challenging 29:1 60:7 121:2135:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: 44:3,3,10,13 45:16,23,23case 45:6 64:2 75:19 101:14 (4)change 74:4 88:13 92:21 104:24 122:9,9 (6)46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13catch 16:14 cate 3:17 89:4changes 8:7 51:11 52:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,2258:25 61:5,7,21 64:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 128:13,13 (6) cause 23:12 56:19 137:18character 38:23 character 38:2392:5,7,23,25 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25 95:5,20 98:24 99:14,22	carted 45:14	C	8:8,15 11:21 12:8,8,10 13:13
carting 51:2challenging 29:1 60:7 121:2135:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41: 44:3,3,10,13 45:16,23,23 46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13catch 16:14changes 8:7 51:11 52:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,22 (10)58:25 61:5,7,21 64:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 128:13,13 (6)changing 133:11 character 38:2379:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 82:6 87:11,16 90:5,8 92:5,7,23,25cause 23:12 56:19 137:18character 38:23 character sp9:292:5,7,23,25 95:5,20 98:24 99:14,22	carter 38:2	0	23:7,16,16 24:23 25:3,6,25
case 45:6 64:2 75:19 101:14 (4)change 74:4 88:13 92:21 104:24 122:9,9 (6)46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13 58:25 61:5,7,21 64:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 128:13,13 (6)changing 133:11 changing 133:1146:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23 53:4,21 54:15 57:6,11,13 58:25 61:5,7,21 64:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 128:13,13 (6)changing 133:11 character 38:2392:5,7,23,25 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25 95:5,20 98:24 99:14,22	carting 51:2	challenging 29:1 60:7 121:21	35:10,21 38:9,13,14 39:8 41:4
catch 16:14changes 8:7 51:11 52:1,7,10,14,19 54:9 62:12,22 (10)58:25 61:5,7,21 64:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 128:13,13 (6)changing 133:11 character 38:2358:25 61:5,7,21 64:2,5,7,14,15,22 65:15 66:4 70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 128:13,13 (6)changing 133:11 subscript of the state st		0	46:15,21 47:1,13 48:3,12,22 49:7,25 50:4,8 52:21,22,23
cate3:17 89:4(10)70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25 76:19,22 77:14 78:14catie4:10 125:11,14,17changing133:1179:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 82:6 87:11,16 90:5,8128:13,13 (6)character38:2392:5,7,23,25cause23:12 56:19 137:18characteristics99:2	catch 16:14	8	58:25 61:5,7,21
catie 4:10 125:11,14,17 128:13,13 (6)changing 133:1179:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25 82:6 87:11,16 90:5,8 92:5,7,23,25 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25 93:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25 95:5,20 98:24 99:14,22	cate 3:17 89:4		70:2 71:24 72:6,21 73:25
cause 23:12 56:19 137:1893:2,6,7,8,18,24,25 94:3,25characteristics 99:295:5,20 98:24 99:14,22		changing 133:11	79:11,12,13 80:3,4 81:20,25
	cause 23:12 56:19 137:18	character 38:23	
caused 77:1 117:13 100:17,20,20,24 101:24 103:	caused 77:1 117:13	characteristics 99:2	95:5,20 98:24 99:14,22 100:17,20,20,24 101:24 103:13
characterized 127:16 104:5,6 106:21 107:20 110:2	causes 6:21	characterized 127:16	104:5,6 106:21 107:20 110:24 111:17,18,19,23 120:6,7,10,23
		charged 69:4	122:13 124:3,21 126:1,5 127:2

to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services			
city's 5:24 8:7,10 12:13,23 13:7 15:22 30:2 40:14 43:13,18,25 45:13 47:9 51:7 52:18 58:6 61:10 69:5 85:4 95:8 105:14 107:4 121:10 (24)	February 10, 2025 cleanups 112:13,14,18,22 113:18 114:22 129:25 (7) clear 14:18 22:3 30:23 61:9 70:25 90:23 98:22 103:2,3	148 18:4,7 44:22 51:21 52:2 59:9,14 69:13 71:11,21 89:25 97:19 109:5 126:9 129:20 130:19 (21)	
citywide 44:5 103:18	120:9 (10)	collections 31:5	
civil 8:2	clearing 27:4	collects 36:25 113:12	
claim 74:9	clearly 9:22 37:3 44:2 127:14 (4)	collins 3:14 81:7,9,11 (4)	
claims 86:19	climate 114:3	columbus 92:11	
claire 4:13 135:4	clock 104:13,14	columbusamsterdam 3:19 91:20 92:2	
clarify 6:20 54:1 113:3	close 63:15 139:1,7	combat 33:22	
clarifying 87:17	closing 49:5,19	come 10:18 14:21 23:23 27:6 49:21 51:5 52:14 68:20 84:9	
clarity 87:22 96:20 113:8	cobble 55:5	121:24 (10)	
clean 4:6 10:12,15 13:18 15:25 32:10,18 33:23 34:18 42:21 45:8 53:12 64:14 66:1 67:11 70:24 72:3 73:2 75:8	code 6:10 7:7 8:1,4 (4) codify 122:4	comes 21:6 24:24 53:5 64:9 71:21,22 77:5 116:8 (8) coming 139:11	
78:2 79:21 81:25 82:5 85:5,25 88:11 90:22 92:6 93:3 99:9	cold 23:22	commend 46:19	
100:22 106:23 110:1 112:3,6,22 114:12 116:5,18 120:23 121:5 124:2,21 126:1,11,18 127:2 138:4 (48)	collaborate 40:5 collaborating 32:12 82:19 88:19	comment 11:22 19:5 33:13 40:23 (4)	
cleaned 58:21 cleaner 8:13 13:4 14:23 33:1	collaboration 59:10 95:9 106:17 124:23 (4)	comments 5:14 8:19,21,23,24 9:3,7,9 46:6 68:2 105:20 128:25 139:4,7 (14)	
82:21 92:17 94:3 99:13 107:5 112:19 133:5,5 (12)	collaborative 43:10 colleague 73:16	commercial 5:16 6:11 12:15 22:25 23:4 25:6,10,20 30:3 33:23 34:13 39:14 58:10 77:12	
cleaning 6 5:17 6:21,23 8:8 22:16 25:20 64:22 71:18 114:23 132:12 133:10 (12)	colleagues 28:23 94:21	84:15 93:21 98:2,10 100:8,10 101:11 108:3,19 110:13 112:25 115:22 116:13 118:17	
cleanliness 19:7 45:21 69:16 112:11 114:18 (5)	collect 12:17 24:23 47:8 61:25 98:1 101:4 113:15,19 127:25 (9)	136:8 137:4 (30) commissioner 16:7 59:4	
cleanly 117:19	collected 47:6 51:1 58:17 71:21 108:23 126:12,19 127:9	120:14 125:4 (4) commissioners 122:8	
cleanness 25:3	130:3 (9)	commitment 8:7	
cleanup 113:3,10 128:15,19 129:4,9 130:5,7,17 134:2,15 138:11 (12)	collecting 27:16 51:22 113:22 collection 6:18 7:9,12,22 8:12	committed 64:6 88:19 99:18 107:2 (4)	

to Entities	Engaging in Cleaning S	Services
	February 10, 2025	149
committee 55:7	comprised 92:19	constantly 26:18 41:20 42:4 56:23 117:11 (5)
communities 7:2 34:14 37:5 66:1 84:21 85:7 99:21 114:9	compromise 14:15	constraints 93:14 99:1
131:7 (9)	concern 77:16	construction 60:4
community 3:14 5:24 6:3 15:14 19:8 23:14 26:13 27:18	concerned 19:16 60:12 62:19 75:9 78:10 129:2 133:13 136:5	constructive 86:8
28:20,25 39:15 42:1 54:24 75:22 81:8,12,22 82:21,24	(8)	consultation 95:21
83:14 84:20 90:2 92:9 93:4,11 96:5 112:9,18,21 113:3,17	concerning 8:19 76:24	consulted 86:22
114:2,14 116:4,15,20,24 117:2 118:19 125:19 126:11 128:15,19 129:3,8,25 130:12	concerns 6:4 16:10 71:6 86:7 89:10 94:22 107:9 132:25 133:19 (9)	consulting 47:14
133:2,23 135:23 (50)	conclusion 40:6 104:10	consuming 97:9
community's 115:17	106:24	container 52:1 53:13,20 66:22,25 71:12 73:18 83:24
commuters 45:17	conditions 122:5 conduct 16:11	96:21 97:1 98:23 109:25 (12) containeration 110:14
compactors 58:20 companies 122:25	conduct 16:11	containerization 110:14
company 51:2	conducting 5:10	13:3,10 16:15,18 20:24 21:7 31:18 33:20 35:6 37:12 39:21
compare 24:1,2,6,7 (4)	conflicts 14:16 104:20	40:7 43:8 47:10 49:22 50:12 59:1,5 60:17 62:4,25 65:12
compared 91:5	confusion 63:7 87:20	69:19,24 70:12,16 71:9 73:9 74:8 77:9,15 78:5,8,12 80:24
compelled 94:21	connect 133:20	84:22 87:5 88:8 89:12,22 90:9 91:4,10 94:23 98:15 101:22
complete 128:2 130:9	consequence 37:6	102:6 104:15 108:2,19 111:3 135:12,15,17 136:7,15 (58)
completely 26:19	consequences 39:3 88:18 97:16	containerize 6:6 11:25 31:25 32:8 56:16 67:3 72:7 101:5
complex 63:1 67:7	consider 9:7 14:9 28:22 63:19	109:9 110:2 (10)
complexity 62:15	66:14 72:1 86:20 88:16 90:18 98:13 105:24 106:2 118:6	containerized 59:10 73:11,14 79:1 109:6 135:25 137:11 (7)
compliance 2:3 5:5 31:20 52:15,21,23 56:11 57:2 76:9	130:7 139:3 (15)	containerizes 13:25 73:20,23
86:20,23 87:19 88:17 96:4 98:7 99:7 104:2 106:1 (18)	consideration 99:23 135:22	containerizing 61:12 66:10
compliant 17:16 98:21	considered 51:24 52:7 62:10 63:18 65:14 (5)	70:10 77:11 78:22 102:14 109:7 (7)
complicated 39:4	considering 54:18	containers 8:11 14:8 16:23,23
comply 12:1 13:7 28:10 39:7 48:8 54:13 55:21 63:21 66:17	consistency 98:16	17:3,10 19:22 24:10 32:4,9 35:11,12 37:17 39:7,10,18 44:0 17 47:22 48:1 10 50:25
48:8 54:13 55:21 65:21 66:17 78:11 90:25 102:24 (12)	consolidation 106:4	44:9,17 47:22 48:1,10 50:25 52:4 53:1,6,9 57:17 59:8,25

In Re Public Hearing DSNY Proposed Amendments to Rule Relating to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services February 10, 2025 150 62:16 63:5,9 68:12 71:15,16 **coordinate** 17:8 98:23 76:6 83:18 86:23 87:20 88:7 73:19 82:6 83:6,11,16,21 89:20 96:10 109:15 135:17 84:3,4,23 87:23,25 88:1 89:24 coordinating 88:5 136:3,15 137:9 (16) 96:23 98:21 102:8 106:8,11 couldn't 123:14 108:12,14,15,25 109:13 111:20 **coordination** 22:21 63:16 122:21 129:12 (61) 69:23 104:12 (4) **council** 3:17 16:6 46:21,23 contentious 80:6 coordinator 54:25 48:4,22 49:2,25 50:8 51:15 89:5,15 90:8 118:20 120:6 (15) contents 44:23 copies 5:22 **counsel** 2:4 5:6 **continue** 21:11 28:24 **copy** 9:2 32:17,23 126:17 131:8 (6) **count** 51:23 **cordelia** 3:13 77:19.23 **continued** 3:2 4:2 52:18 60:19 **counter** 120:24 76:4 91:7 (6) core 38:10 75:21 121:1 counteracts 110:18 continues 21:13 corev 3:12 74:16,19 counterproductive 122:12 continuing 35:19 40:5 42:18 corner 22:12 78:9,17 107:18 (4) 79:2,8,16 110:3 (7) countless 98:9 **contract** 34:15 44:2 45:25 **corners** 24:4 41:19 42:1.10.20 **county** 140:6 101:23 103:15 106:9 120:6 (7) 44:22,24 108:7 121:12 (9) couple 68:4 contracted 35:24 **correct** 80:21,22 course 41:7,13 104:19 **contractor** 55:15,17 correlation 103:20 **court** 20 8:16 9:22 **corridor** 28:14,20 56:9,21 **contracts** 76:21 86:12 96:10 108:19 109:21 110:14 116:13 **cover** 29:25 73:24 92:11 111:11 (4) (8) 108:5 111:20 123:20 (6) contractual 100:18 **corridors** 23:4 25:7,20 33:23 coverage 73:19 34:13 35:1 64:5 75:24 84:16 contrary 95:14 98:10 108:3 115:22 (12) covers 34:2 contribution 45:22 covid19 75:25 77:2 corridors' 25:10 **control** 32:1 59:22 68:11 80:8 **cost** 16:17 20:1 31:23 35:7 create 11:23 18:13 23:4 24:24 (4) 43:18 44:11 48:11,14 65:22 67:12 98:19 110:20 controlling 105:16 52:9,25,25 53:3 76:8,16 77:10 113:11 (9) 83:10.12.12 84:4.24 88:9 convenient 127:24 109:16 111:14 121:9 133:16 created 49:16 95:10,11 (25)120:25 124:22 (5) conversation 80:6 creates 67:13 104:20 **costly** 87:21 **conversations** 83:23 91:8 costs 22:22 28:3 76:10,11 creating 8:12 82:24 113:21 **convey** 77:15 86:20,22 96:4,12 102:17 109:8,11 123:20 (12) creative 74:25 cooperation 20:2 60:19 95:17 **could** 24:10,14 28:3 52:22 crew 35:14 58:22 82:8

to Entities	Engaging In Cleaning S	
	February 10, 2025	151
crews 31:4,8 49:11	dan 3:10 72:11	dedicated 31:3 39:23 82:17 87:6 102:1 (5)
cripple 28:19	daniel 3:18 72:16 91:18,24 (4)	dedicates 12:6 36:23
critical 22:23 23:13 38:13,20 96:1 107:13,19 120:22 (8)	dark 66:11	dedicating 85:3
crowded 102:13	data 51:23 108:23	dedication 11:21 126:2
crown 10:12,16 134:3,15 138:11 (5)	datadriven 25:4	deep 72:1 74:12 77:16 94:22 (4)
	date 5:20 20:21	
crucial 40:1	dates 94:1	deeply 62:18 132:23
culprits 16:14		defecation 17:5
	david 3:7 67:19,24 100:6	
cultural 30:6 69:6	134:9,20 138:16 (7)	definitely 80:11 81:23 84:11 137:12 (4)
curb 37:9 53:14 57:13 70:12	day 14:11 23:1 31:8 35:5 42:5	
87:4 102:11 (6)	46:18 53:17 58:23 59:14 62:1	degraded 97:22
curbs 6:24 32:10 53:12 70:24	66:6 69:13 81:24 82:8 103:17 139:12 140:20 (17)	delay 36:11
75:8 79:22 82:5 121:5	157.12 140.20 (17)	uciay 50.11
126:14,18 (10)	days 48:17,17 123:2 126:16	delayed 36:3
	133:9 (5)	·
curbside 32:9 97:4 103:24		delivered 41:8
136:2,24 (5)	dbp 31:3,17	1 120 5
current 17:17 59:25 66:7	de 2:15 29:8 33:5,12,15 (5)	demand 130:5
108:1 130:20 (5)	de 2.13 29.8 35.5,12,15 (5)	demands 12:23 97:5,12,13 (4)
100.1 150.20 (5)	deadline 8:22 54:10 79:19	uchiunus 12.25 97.5,12,15 (1)
currently 35:8 45:9 49:2 51:4 53:7 59:23 77:3 92:1 97:4	80:24 99:7 (5)	demonstrating 71:9
99:4,8,15 108:6 109:2 110:10	deaf 27:21	denied 110:4
112:24 124:11 129:15 (18)		
	deal 78:21 79:2	dense 97:1
customers 41:25	debris 27:5 42:8,12 97:21 (4)	density 38:24
cut 23:13 55:22 68:14 134:11		uchsity 50.24
(4)	decades 104:22	dep 117:25
cuts 126:6	decades' 51:18	department 4 2:5 5:6 6:17
cutting 30:11,13 91:1	december 5:19	7:9,12,21 11:18 12:12,19,21 13:22 14:14,19 15:23 37:10
daily 45:18 58:17 69:6	decision 117:14	41:11 50:11 51:1 52:12 57:25 59:6 60:9,20 87:3 91:14 93:2
92:5,20 93:24 121:19 130:4		97:7 107:15 125:25 126:7
131:9 (9)	decisionmaking 20:11	127:12 135:16 139:3 (34)
dalipi 3:21 99:25 100:3,4 (4)	decisions 66:13 131:6	deployed 92:20
damage 84:11 91:5	decline 77:1	depot 31:11

to Entitles		
deputy 3:21 100:1 125:3	February 10, 2025 difficult 16:13,14 39:2 102:9 104:2 (5)	152 discussions 18:11 88:25 107:15
described 7:5,24	dining 71:24	dismay 33:24
design 4:13 19:22 20:23 135:5,13 (5)	direct 26:12	dismay 33.24 dismayed 119:21
designated 88:3 98:17 106:3 114:1 129:23 (5)	direction 76:5	displacement 26:16
designating 57:15	directly 8:25 31:10 71:16 84:17 106:14 139:10 (6)	disposal 37:4 110:16
desirable 13:19 57:7	director 2:3,12,13,15,20 3:6,7,9,13,14,18,20,21 4:5 5:4	dispose 113:15 115:2 disrespect 24:22
desire 13:11 39:7	15:10 19:21 21:21 26:5 29:9 33:5,16 46:10,13 61:4 65:1,6	disrupted 59:17
desired 25:16	67:20,25 68:23 69:2 77:20,24 81:7 91:19 92:1 94:7,14 100:1	disrupting 127:25
despite 60:9 87:17 96:3 127:11 (4)	107:23 134:10,21 138:17 (43)	disservice 111:22
detailed 39:8	directors 12:7 20:2 45:20 55:12 75:15 76:6 79:16 (7)	district 2:12,16,19 3:9,16,19,22 4:4 7:15 12:5,7
details 90:14 119:7	dirk 2:15 29:8 33:4,14 (4)	13:18 15:11,24 16:1,5,19 18:15 19:3,10 21:23 27:11
determines 12:8	dirtier 19:18 73:7	30:6 33:7,17 43:2,5,12,23 48:6 53:6,18 58:6,8,16 66:24 68:24
detrimental 89:25	dirty 38:5 93:16	69:3,6 71:4 74:21,24 75:9,17,19,25 76:25 77:4,12
devastating 113:24 117:23	disadvantaged 114:2	78:9 80:12,19 85:17 86:13 89:16,18 91:21 94:16 96:9
develop 37:13 70:21 88:20 98:22 99:19 106:20 (6)	disappear 22:14 109:21	99:1 100:2,8 101:14 105:7 106:25 118:18,20 120:5
development 3:6 49:8 60:5	disappointed 95:7	132:19 133:17 (70)
65:1,6 92:9 93:4 (7)	disapproval 97:13	district's 80:15
devise 25:8	disconnect 95:23	districts 13:6 29:25 41:19 42:20 43:17 44:4 46:23 49:2
dhs 17:9	discontinue 97:18	55:10 61:19 65:16 118:15 120:3,25 122:1 126:23 (16)
dialog 86:9	discourage 64:20	diverting 86:25
dicus 2:21 50:15,17,18 (4)	discrete 96:5	dock 6:13 137:5
difference 12:14	discretion 45:1,19 76:7 122:6 (4)	documents 130:21
differences 39:1	discuss 6:4 16:8	doe 11:2,3
different 38:23 51:24,25 53:17 96:6 118:16 133:24 137:2 2 7 8 (11)	discussed 99:4	does 17:23 22:15 27:6 39:1
137:2,2,7,8 (11)	discussion 105:13	45:16 55:17 56:10 63:10 73:21 75:19 81:24 88:14 90:5,9

	1000000000000000000000000000000000000	153
93:22 98:9 99:5 104:10 120:10 129:16 131:16 (21)	February 10, 2025 25:4,15,19 27:14 28:2 31:10 32:13,21 36:11 38:1,17 39:19	eager 51:8
doesn't 32:21 88:13 102:25	40:2,11 42:17 43:7,16 44:1,8,18,22 45:3 47:6,7,14,23	earlier 124:8 134:12
118:10 137:10 (5)	50:7,22 55:17,18 57:9 59:11,12 61:17,24 62:7,8	easier 84:25 110:6 113:14
doing 23:17 24:22 27:16 31:14 32:20 40:10 42:6 46:18	63:16,19 64:7,8,14 67:2,10,16 69:13,25 70:7,11,15 71:8,14,25	easily 64:10
57:9 78:2 93:19 111:13 (12)	78:11 79:9,23 80:13 81:2,24 83:3 84:5,14 85:8 86:3 87:24	east 2:11 18:21 19:1 26:13 58:5 75:2 (6)
dollars 13:16 19:12,14,25 45:10 48:12,19 51:13 86:24	88:5,20 89:9 90:17 91:8 92:3 93:25 94:23 95:13 98:19 99:19	eastern 117:2
96:11 (10) done 49:24 50:9 133:21	101:3,19 103:7,17 105:24 106:5,15,18 107:3 108:15,20,23 109:14,16	echo 68:2 94:19 133:18
136:16 (4)	110:4,6,20,22 111:2,7,12 112:19 113:14 114:13 115:7	economic 49:18 77:1
doors 49:6	116:9 117:14 119:16 120:1,10,23 121:8,19,22	ed 81:11
dot 18:11 23:25 24:14 53:25 59:8 62:16,17 72:22 80:13	123:10 124:21 128:4,22 129:18,22 130:2,7,16 131:11	effect 113:16
87:4 91:8 104:17 121:7 123:9,14 (15)	132:10 133:20 137:1,14,21 138:3 (146)	effective 12:4 71:7 88:9
double 28:3	dsny's 5:15 27:7 31:13 32:10	effectively 60:18 99:21 112:21
down 52:24 83:19 136:11	65:11 69:10 71:20 82:5 89:11 90:3 96:3 111:13 118:23 121:4 (14)	efficiency 32:14 98:16
downtown 2:15 3:4 29:5,20,23 30:1 31:10 32:16	due 21:4 23:21 61:21 71:6	efficient 130:1 136:4
55:6 57:22 58:2,3 (12)	73:13 93:13 102:17 (7)	effort 15:22 43:13 59:2 82:1 87:3 (5)
dozens 127:1	dumbo 3:16 85:16,20	efferte 10,15 12,19 20,15
dr 2:12 21:20	dumped 14:7	efforts 12:15 13:18 32:15 71:8 82:23 87:15 88:8 90:2,21 97:17 105:15 113:25 114:11
draconian 61:14 63:17	dumpers 38:7	119:20 129:1,4 (16)
dramatic 74:4	dumping 14:12 16:1,9,11 17:6 41:21 42:3,13 68:9 78:18	egregiously 45:5
drastic 101:6	93:17 103:23 106:16 110:17 113:24 (15)	eight 16:22
draw 123:8	durable 110:8	either 14:6 28:12 47:20 122:20 (4)
drop 83:14	during 55:24 75:24 98:17	electedofficials 18:12
dropping 129:11,20	e 2:2,2 140:2,2 (4)	eliminate 48:23 122:10
drug 17:6	each 12:4,6 14:21,22 25:9	eliminated 57:2
dsny 5:10,18,21 6:2,2 9:2,6 16:7,11 17:9 18:2,4,6,11 19:15 22:3 23:2,11,25 24:14	31:8 38:22 46:21 73:3 75:15 80:14 84:17 85:9,11 101:10,13 118:15 133:20,23 (19)	elimination 48:25

to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services		
ellis 3:20 94:6,9,13 (4)	February 10, 2025 engaging 6 5:17 112:15	154 estate 58:11
else 122:24 124:16 138:20	enhance 32:13	estimate 19:24 35:6 48:14 76:8 (4)
elsewhere 42:14	enormous 31:1,12	× /
elvers 3:14 81:6,9,11 (4)	enormously 53:24	estimated 48:11 52:8 82:15
email 119:8	enough 61:24 79:18 135:22	estimating 52:9
emailed 8:24	ensure 70:19 71:1 88:25 98:16 104:13,14 114:25 123:9	estrada 3:7 67:19,22,24 68:14,17,21 134:9,20 138:16 (10)
empire 24:13 136:21	(8)	
employees 58:12 92:19	ensuring 23:3 48:15	etcetera 23:15
emptied 61:24 126:14	enthusiastically 119:17	evaluate 137:16
-		evaluating 39:24
empties 13:24	entirely 97:19	even 14:9 16:2 22:23 35:22,23
empty 35:5	entirety 29:25	39:16 57:1 68:11,11 79:2 126:3 (11)
emptying 6:24 34:19	entities 5 5:16 38:6 89:24 137:17 (5)	events 23:14 65:23 82:24
encampments 17:5		83:14 (4)
enclosures 136:19	entity 6:20 7:14,19 14:11 24:7 116:1,4 (7)	eventual 38:1
encourage 42:17 74:11 105:24 106:17 131:7,10 (6)	environment 97:2	eventually 123:5
end 16:4 21:3 22:25 50:13	equally 103:19	ever 78:3
51:17 60:21 138:2 (7)	equipment 28:6 45:12 124:1	everchanging 130:5
endeavor 65:15	equitable 89:2 107:3	every 28:16 46:18 48:4 66:6 69:13 81:24 82:8 110:2 116:6
ended 10:5	equity 111:7	119:17 (10)
ending 83:8 84:10	especially 23:25 100:13 104:4,5 (4)	everybody 11:6 21:25 91:24 128:12 138:7 (5)
ends 78:16 119:4	esq 2:3	everyday 95:19
enforcement 2:4 5:5 39:20	-	
42:3 103:21 106:11,16 114:7 (8)	essential 47:12 59:15 85:23 87:1 92:25 95:1 100:23 (7)	everyone 6:7 15:5 21:11 26:8 40:20 41:1 85:19 89:8 99:19
engage 91:7 128:4	essentially 101:20	100:3 122:24 131:4 139:2,11 (14)
engaged 6:2	establish 18:3 70:25 98:17 106:18 (4)	everyone's 41:13
engagement 54:24 70:1		everything 138:3
137:24	established 18:6	everywhere 116:22

		1.55
exactly 71:19 132:7	February 10, 2025 48:23 101:2,16 (6)	failing 12:1
example 53:11,14 100:25 106:1 136:22 (5)	expenses 48:21,21 86:25 96:13 102:20 (5)	fails 86:20 95:25
exceed 48:18	expensive 20:16 47:17 110:7	failures 108:21
except 6:16 7:7	136:20 (4)	fair 88:21 106:11
exception 70:22	experience 23:5 84:1	falco 4:11 128:10,12,18 (4)
exceptions 98:24	experiences 40:4	falling 56:7
exceptions 98.24	experiencing 14:10 132:8	families 26:23
excessive 24:16	explaining 97:11	far 66:12
	explanation 90:23	fast 61:24
exclude 130:12	explicit 76:5	fault 42:14
execute 56:10	exploring 88:3	fear 17:9
execution 22:22	express 33:24 47:2	feasibility 96:2
executive 2:4,12,13,15,20 3:7,9,13,14,18,20 4:5 5:5 15:10 19:20 21:21 26:5 29:9	expressed 94:20	feasible 24:18 61:13 85:11
33:5,15 46:10,12 61:4 67:20,25 68:23 69:2 77:20,23	extent 61:13	89:2 (4) feature 69:17
81:7 91:19,25 92:1 94:7,14 107:23 134:10,21 138:17 (39)	extenuating 122:15	february 12 5:21 140:20
exert 14:16	extraordinary 49:19	feedback 109:1 119:21
exigent 122:16	extremely 104:2 121:20	feel 25:18 73:9 79:12 94:21
existential 50:2 105:1	f 140:2	(4)
	fabulous 116:10	feels 87:16
existing 23:18 40:3 44:1 76:21 93:13 (5)	face 38:7 44:13,20 60:14	feet 58:10
exists 113:23	97:24 (5) faced 83:4	fellow 65:10
expanding 66:23	faces 107:6 120:8	fernandez 2:13 26:4
expands 115:23	facilitate 70:18	few 9:6 20:7 32:9 68:21 78:6
expect 67:2	facilities 32:2	137:9 (6) fewer 83:18
expected 90:25		
expediated 66:8	fact 27:6 31:25 37:12 73:10 (4)	fields 4:125 105:6,8
expense 16:20 21:5 31:19	failed 108:20	fifth 2:21 50:16,20 51:3 134:11,22 138:18 (7)

to Entities	Engaging In Cleaning S	
0° 1 4 111 17	February 10, 2025	156
fights 111:15	119:24 122:10 127:9 (22)	followed 33:8
figure 22:7 137:13,17	fining 14:10 57:1	following 2:8 3:2 4:2 70:11 130:8 (5)
figures 58:15	finish 10:3,19	food 8:9 104:7
figuring 118:23	first 10:7 19:20 28:4 34:5,6 37:22 79:21,22 83:9 92:3	fooddrink 35:2
fill 31:12 35:3 38:13 87:15 100:23 114:14 (6)	103:11 105:11 121:1,3,13 122:10 128:21 132:4,9 (19)	foot 38:24 77:5
filled 56:2 101:2	firstly 101:9	footage 101:12
filling 130:21	fiscal 17:17,19 20:12 58:17	force 83:14 93:10 97:17
fills 82:8	78:23 102:22 (6)	forced 66:13,17 78:11
m 100.05	fits 38:21 104:3	
film 122:25	five 40:21,21 46:23 48:11,13	forcing 81:17 84:19
filming 123:2	65:21 110:2 126:16 (8)	fordham 3:21 100:1,7 101:25 102:9,22,25 103:4,12,22,24
filter 114:22	fiveandahalf 45:10	(11)
final 54:5 84:9	fivemodule 121:6	fordham's 101:14
finally 22:21 25:2 39:4 76:25 123:18 (5)	fiveunit 121:18	formal 135:8
financed 34:9	flatbush 3:20 81:15 94:7,15 97:3 99:3 (6)	formation 34:17
financial 38:16 49:20 63:23	flaw 120:17	formed 19:6 78:1 79:6 126:10 (4)
70:8 75:10 76:13 78:7,13	120.17	
86:17,21 88:16 90:10 91:2,5 93:14 96:2 99:5,6 106:4 107:9	flawed 19:17	former 16:7 74:23 120:14
(20)	fleet 47:24 48:15	forthcoming 98:14
financially 62:13 64:17 91:10	flexibility 53:22 63:11,20,22 97:10 (5)	forward 18:10 21:10 59:2 67:16 72:4 87:5 88:24 90:7
find 20:18 36:5,5 39:13 40:12 60:7,11 84:17 85:10 107:3	flexible 53:8 80:14	107:4,18 111:4,19 (12)
117:20 123:10,11 133:21 (14)		found 64:8
F 1 25.16 103.9 131.20	flooding 114:21 115:4	f i 124.24 128.22
finding 35:16 102:8 121:20	flow 27:4	foundation 124:24 128:23 129:16 130:16 (4)
fine 30:17 64:20 93:18 120:2 122:13 (5)	fluctuations 67:6	founder 125:18 128:19
fined 34:24 87:18	focus 40:3 71:8 114:23	four 48:11 83:11,16 104:21
fines 12:1 13:23 17:24 18:5	focuses 113:25	109:13 (5)
31:20 35:25 42:12 44:20 45:5 47:18 56:4 76:19 87:9,12,14	folks 41:20 46:17 48:4	fourandahalf 48:18
97:25 98:6 103:6 106:13	10110 11.20 10.17 TU.T	francesca 2:13 26:4,11

to Entities	Engaging in Cleaning S	
frank 22:7	February 10, 2025 further 18:10 27:2 87:22 88:25 102:20 107:15 140:15	157 genuinely 25:23
frankly 20:8 37:20 127:10	(7)	get 64:15 67:4 75:6 79:15,19 118:24 123:5 126:3 (8)
freaked 116:21	future 66:14 105:1 128:6 131:11 (4)	getting 35:20,22 51:7 61:10
fred 2:17 33:8 36:14,22 (4)	fy 20:14 78:24 108:7 109:4	62:11 73:8 117:8 121:11 131:5 (9)
free 33:1 34:23 65:22 82:24 129:10 (5)	(4)	ghost 16:13
friends 23:1	gallon 63:6,9 136:1	give 25:13 28:21 54:11 116:25
front 103:9 122:21,21 124:14	gallons 31:9 88:2	(4)
136:14 (5)	gap 87:15	given 2:8 3:2 4:2 13:1 49:16 58:15 100:13 (7)
frontage 101:11	gaps 31:13 38:13 100:23 114:15 (4)	gives 63:4
frontier 26:14	garage 82:3 125:5 132:15	giving 22:1
frontlines 64:21 fruitful 57:10	garages 14:2	glad 81:25
	garbage 12:16,17,18	go 78:25 82:23 83:18 114:17
frustration 65:11	13:1,7,24,25 14:2,6,8,11 37:4 38:4 43:14 44:21 46:25	(4)
full 16:17 46:25 47:22 73:19 77:10 119:1 129:14 (7)	47:6,23,24 48:1,16 50:25 51:5 61:12 77:6 78:19,20 79:8,12 81:15 101:6 123:1,7 129:19,21	goal 14:2,5 35:9 51:7,10 52:17 54:17 57:12 61:10 63:12,13,17 73:4 77:8 79:10
fully 25:17 38:11 39:23 59:9 78:11 105:14,20 107:2 (8)	(35)	86:3 99:13,17 115:6 120:15 121:9 (21)
fulton 30:3	gardens 114:20,24,25 115:3 117:23 (5)	goals 19:15 36:8,8 37:11
function 55:9 59:21 60:17	garment 2:19 43:1,5,12,23 (5)	40:14 41:13 52:20 64:11 77:14 86:10 99:22 106:21 110:23
107:7 115:1 135:1 138:22 (7)	gather 82:9	112:19 (14)
functional 28:14	gcp 37:6,11,24 38:6 39:5,16	goes 27:4 55:15 101:23 120:13 (4)
fund 11:2,3 35:10 38:2 48:4 106:6 (6)	(6)	going 10:6,11 20:17 25:25
fundamental 113:9	gda 44:15,25	33:25 42:7,8 68:19 105:22 110:25 111:3 117:12,21
funded 101:9	general 131:16	138:25 (14)
funding 20:19 21:1 24:24	generally 75:1	good 5:2 11:6 18:25 21:24,25 26:7 33:20 34:19 41:1 43:3
34:11 35:17,23 55:19 73:13 79:14,15 102:24 104:12	generated 37:2,24 44:24 98:2 (4)	46:11 50:13,17 57:24 60:25 65:4 68:25 72:14 74:18 81:10
123:19 (13)	generates 58:16	85:18 89:8 105:10 117:8 136:12 (25)
funds 52:24 56:10,20 71:15 81:18 87:1 (6)	generation 38:25	got 135:8

to Entitles	Engaging in cleaning s	
govern 87:4	February 10, 2025 guidelines 53:7,11 98:22 103:2,3 104:11 135:13 (7)	158 98:1 99:3 105:25 108:4,11,23 110:14 114:1 116:1,21
governing 39:9		117:2,13 121:20 128:13
government 122:23	gutters 6:24 guys 83:18 116:10	132:16 133:3,20 135:10,21 (52)
governmental 95:17	half 19:12	haul 62:2
gowanus 31:11	hall 20:17	hauling 83:7
graffiti 133:10	halted 76:6	haven 15:14
grand 2:14,17 26:6,12 33:10 36:15 37:2 (7)	hand 27:24 73:24 135:1	haven't 135:7
grant 32:10 98:19 106:5	138:21 140:20 (5)	he 134:11
108:16,17 (5)	handle 73:15	he's 11:9,10 33:10 36:16 (4)
grateful 50:6 126:1	handled 79:23	hear 15:5 26:8 30:14,16,19,21 89:10 (7)
great 15:8 35:9 36:19 47:13 50:8 73:12 82:3 93:24 118:1	handles 51:4	heard 61:8 63:2 106:12 107:8
128:14 129:17 (11)	hands 133:11	126:21 137:3,19 (7)
greatest 61:13	happen 22:16 42:13 60:13 90:12 111:1 (5)	hearing 7 5:9,11,14,20 8:17 9:4,8,16 50:21 51:15 62:10
greatly 92:7	happening 42:5	138:25 (13)
green 34:5,21	happens 22:15	hearts 27:13
grid 60:3	happy 91:7	heavily 15:17 57:3
ground 67:7	hard 22:2 34:10,22 69:14	heavy 14:11 35:2
group 4:8 106:19 114:3 115:13,20,25 116:12 125:19	81:23 92:5 131:13 137:21 (8)	heights 4:7 10:13,16 55:5 94:17 115:13,19,25 134:3,15
128:19 (9)	harder 115:3 126:4	138:11 (11)
groupmanaged 135:24	hardship 129:6 133:14	hell 3:6,11
groups 85:2 93:11,23 114:14,15 126:25 127:2,5	hardworking 90:19	hell's 65:2,7,9 72:13,18 125:20 (6)
128:15 129:8 130:7,13,15 137:20 (14)	harm 90:1 91:11	hello 29:10,11,12 30:21 43:3
growing 100:21 109:12	harris 2:9 11:12,14,15 15:1 (5)	54:23 67:22 91:24 105:8 128:12 132:2 (11)
guaranteed 87:7,7 106:9	has 10:5 16:1 19:21 28:2,21 32:6 37:4,6 38:22 39:21	help 32:17,17 35:10 49:17 52:13,22 72:2 77:13 79:9
guidance 63:4 66:20	40:7,8,8 48:7 49:16,16 54:5 55:13,18 58:24 59:12,15 63:1	98:20 99:17 106:23 112:22 116:17 118:6 123:20
guideline 53:23	66:12 73:12 74:22 76:4 79:16 80:16 83:6 84:4 92:10 95:7	124:10,21 126:10 137:21 138:4 (21)

	February 10, 2025	159
helped 57:6 73:3	homes 117:6	hurt 114:9
helpful 33:21 60:10	hope 23:21 26:8 50:10 66:23	husband 125:2
helping 120:4 122:13 129:9	139:12 (5)	hydrants 104:6
helps 120:23	horrendous 40:9	hyhk 66:9,21 72:19 73:8,10
her 30:19	horrified 119:22 125:8	(5)
here 11:4 25:2 29:14,14 36:17	host 129:3 131:11	i'd 46:14 68:2 128:21 130:24 131:4 135:6 (6)
57:23 100:4 119:13 127:21 128:25 131:5,19 132:19 133:9 (14)	hosted 112:14 131:20 hosts 97:4	i'll 119:7
here's 52:21,22	hotel 123:4	i'm 10:6 15:9 18:25 19:1 29:14,14,17,19 30:12,14 33:15 41:2,3 43:4,7 46:12 50:18
hereby 140:9	hour 97:5	54:23,24 57:25 61:1,3 67:24 74:18 77:23 92:1 100:4
herein 120:17	hours 18:8 63:14 128:24 137:10 (4)	105:8,12 107:25 111:6 112:5 115:19 119:12,21,22
hereunto 140:19	household 112:25	123:21,21,22 125:7 128:18 129:2,13 133:12 136:5 138:25
hi 26:7 29:19 33:12 36:21 50:17 57:23 74:18 77:22 81:9 94:9 100:3 107:25 112:4 115:15 125:17 (15) higher 97:21 102:3 highly 30:2 37:20 hill 55:5,5 him 124:7 his 124:9 hold 71:2 108:6 109:3 holding 50:21	household 112:23 households 6:11 how 6:5 12:3 25:24 33:25 35:12 52:3,13,21,22 56:16 64:9 67:2 80:17 90:24 100:14,14 104:20 118:15,24 129:19 135:16,22 (22) however 20:4 22:13 33:24 37:19 51:10 73:13 78:24 86:5 89:22 95:6 102:12 112:20 (12) hs 74:22 hub 15:12 74:25 hudson 3:6,10,12 65:2,6,9	 i've 16:15 91:25 119:25 125:2 137:3 (5) idea 20:15 66:10 74:8 84:9 119:25 (5) identify 34:10 identifying 71:11 ignores 85:5 illegal 16:1,8,11 17:6 38:7 68:9 78:18 103:18,23 106:16 110:17 113:17,23 (13)
holiday 23:15	72:13,17 74:17,20 (10)	illegally 119:1
holidays 55:24 122:18	huge 22:1 81:16 118:21,22 132:10 (5)	immediately 121:16
home 22:16 30:7 58:9 100:9,9	humans 119:2	imminent 28:18
(5) homeless 17:5	hundreds 19:24,24 86:23	impact 34:1 37:4 43:9 47:11 85:6 86:21 88:17 114:17 128:6 132:23 (10)
homelessness 49:14	hunt 11:1,7 hurdle 39:4	impacted 97:12 126:24

impacts 90:18 113:24 impede 49:22	February 10, 2025 42:19 55:10 74:20 85:16 91:20 94:15 100:2 105:7 106:25 120:3,25 122:1 126:23 132:19	160 individuals 2:8 3:2 4:2 78:18 87:18 (5)
impeue 19.22	133:17 (30)	induce 91:6
implement 20:24 27:25 35:18 39:2 51:14 52:9,14,19 53:3 54:7,12,15 71:25 79:14 80:20	inadequate 27:24 63:7 69:21	inefficiency 87:20
83:3 (16)	inadequately 61:20	infestation 105:16
implementation 18:13 19:18 20:21 25:16 36:2 62:20 71:7	inappropriate 76:19 122:12	inflation 102:18
74:7 94:1 107:10 (10)	incarceration 49:14	inflexible 61:15
implemented 75:22 81:1,3 122:3 126:6 (5)	include 75:20 97:17 106:8 116:19 122:17 123:19 (6)	informal 124:12
		information 130:22
implementing 16:17 32:8 36:6 39:24 51:11 78:7 95:22 (7)	included 90:15 114:5 includes 61:22 87:9 126:25	informed 103:6
(7)	127:15 (4)	infrastructure 104:8
implies 27:14	127.13 (4)	
	including 17:4 28:4 30:1	initially 108:17
implore 40:11	61:18 73:25 85:24 99:19	
F	119:19 (8)	initiative 4:6 47:10 79:12
importance 45:21 77:8 88:10		95:13 112:3,6 119:18 121:5 (8)
89:18 (4)	incomplete 54:16	
	-	initiatives 8:10 39:25
important 33:18 52:20	inconsistent 39:22	
54:8,17 65:25 74:12 77:8 (7)		innovative 21:13
	increase 8:11 35:13 96:16	
importantly 96:15		inordinate 68:9
	increased 97:20	
impose 11:25 38:16 45:5	102.10	input 17:19 70:2
	increases 102:19	
imposed 86:18	increasing 77:3 133:16	install 47:21 48:10 121:16
imposes 124:17	increasing 77.5 155.10	installation 28:5
imposes 124.17	incredibly 33:18	Instanation 20.5
imposing 84:13 87:14	increasing 55.10	installed 39:12 121:5
FB	independence 49:18	
impossible 27:25 28:11 56:14	•	instances 103:10
59:20 62:14 102:7 123:11 (7)	independent 55:10 75:13	
	86:11 96:7 (4)	instead 27:20 39:25 71:6
improper 110:16		84:13 85:9 105:21 (6)
	indicate 46:7	
improperly 41:22		instruct 24:15
	indicating 9:17,19 23:20	
improve 25:12 45:1 65:16	24:12 135:3 (5)	insufficient 54:6
95:19 112:11 (5)	indiscernible 109:25 110:6,12	insulting 37:21 64:12
improvement 2:12,16	inuiscer indie 109.23 110.0,12	msunng 57.21 04.12
3:16,19,22 4:4 7:15 13:6 15:11	individual 24:3 75:15 80:15	insurance 102:18
19:3 21:14,22 29:24 33:6,17	98:5 (4)	
,	× /	

	February 10, 2025	161
intend 45:5	72:11,16 73:10 74:16,25	jerry 43:1
intenu +3.5	76:18,23,25 77:2,9,19,22 78:10	Jerry 43.1
intended 43:21 87:12	79:1,20 80:3,11,25	jim 46:12
Intended (5.21 67.12	81:6,10,15,16 82:2,13,17 83:16	Jim 10.12
intending 11:4	84:5,14,22 85:5,14,19 87:13	job 11:19 27:16 49:15 64:14
intenting 11.1	89:4 91:18,24 92:8,18	85:4 93:20 120:4 122:14
intent 95:14	93:15,18,22 94:6,13 95:13	131:17 132:11 (10)
	96:6 97:23 98:2 99:25	19111/ 192111 (10)
interagency 69:22	100:4,7,11 101:6,7,15,19,19	jobs 49:12 126:3
moorageney of the	102:1,3,8 103:12,24 104:24,25	J000 0 1 1 1 1 1 1 0 10
interest 90:16 102:21	105:5 108:1 109:23	join 105:13
	110:3,9,11,25 111:3,10,14	J -
interested 5:25 140:18	112:1,4,9 113:8 115:7,21	journey 49:18
	116:22,25 117:22,23	G
interface 130:15	118:16,17,18,18,20,22 119:10	juggling 26:19
	120:1,9,11 123:1,23,23	
intersecting 70:3	125:11,17 127:9 128:10,18	julia 20 140:8
e	130:3 131:9,13,15,25 133:6,19	•
into 45:24 52:15 74:24 75:16	134:24 136:1,3 137:12 140:13	july 66:25
82:23 90:5 91:2 117:12 (8)	(218)	
		junkie 125:7
introduce 64:19	island 61:4 132:21	
		jurisdiction 70:3
investigations 16:12	issue 38:20 76:19 132:6	
		just 16:25 20:6 22:1,9 23:1
investment 51:12	issued 39:8	27:23 30:17,20 40:19 41:6
		46:5,14 77:24 105:23 109:1
investments 37:7	issues 13:5 17:4,8 28:7 56:19	111:21 114:18 116:7 125:15
	67:6 70:12 82:18 86:9 88:24	132:5,20 133:7,15 135:25
involved 131:5	96:1,25 104:16,18 105:17	137:9 138:2,6 (27)
	110:21 (16)	• • • 114.2
involves 39:6		justice 114:3
······	issuing 17:24	L-L-1- 2.15 95.14 10
involving 104:18	iterative 74:5	kalvis 3:15 85:14,19
ironically 73:6	lierative 74:5	keep 13:18 27:17 33:22 34:22
Ironically 75.0	its 6:1 9:5 12:5 38:22 40:11	64:13 72:2 75:25 85:25 90:22
is 5:3,10,14 6:19 8:16,22	44:11 49:5 58:25 66:7 71:8	106:23 114:11 116:4,18
11:3,7,15 12:14,18 14:3,5,9	73:20 75:21 93:3,7 95:5	120:23 124:2,21 126:11,18
15:2,9 17:14,25 18:14,20 19:2	113:25 114:14 120:4 122:13	138:4 (19)
21:20 22:13,20,20,23 23:10,17	128:22 (20)	130.7 (17)
24:18,19 25:9 26:4,11 27:20	120.22 (20)	keeping 15:24 32:18,18 79:10
28:6 29:4 30:7 31:2	itself 38:11 63:3	81:18,25 85:4 92:5 100:22
33:4,14,18,20,25 34:7 35:8		126:1 (10)
36:10,14,22 37:19,22,23	jackson 4:7 115:13,19,25 (4)	12011 (10)
38:7,17,18,20 39:2 40:19 41:8	Juc (1)	key 64:4 69:16 75:23
44:1 45:6,18,25 46:9,12 48:20	james 2:20 3:20 46:9 94:6,13	-0
50:1,6,15,18 52:13 54:4,6,21	(5)	kindly 112:7
57:9,12,20 58:3,6,9,22 59:1		-
60:2,23 61:1 62:8,20 63:12	jeffrey 3:9 68:22 69:1	kitchen 3:6,11 65:2,7,9
64:12,25 65:5,24 66:5,8		72:13,18 125:20 (8)
67:10,19,24 68:10,22	jeopardize 107:6	
69:1,19,23,25 70:5,13 71:4		know 24:11,12 41:15,20 42:3

	February 10, 2025	162
46:20 60:2,10 93:1 105:15 111:16 117:5 119:4 128:25	latest 79:25	legislation 95:15
(14)	laudable 19:15	legislative 96:17
knowing 23:8	laudatory 36:8,9	legislatively 75:17
known 15:12 72:19	launched 39:20	lend 41:6
knows 40:20	laura 3:5 60:23 61:1	lengthy 86:16 87:3
kudos 22:5	lauren 3:14 81:6,10	less 50:5 54:4 110:8 111:12
kunz 3:12 74:16,18,19 (4)	law 66:7	136:24 (5)
labor 45:11 109:7,11,16	laws 65:13	let 22:1 35:24 105:11,19 (4)
135:18 (5)	layla 2:22 54:21,23	let's 57:14 110:23
laborious 96:17	lc 4:8 115:14,21	lettera 22:7 124:7
lack 12:2 27:21 43:21 64:8 66:12 95:21 103:2,3 (8)	lead 19:17 21:13 54:11 59:18	level 24:21 38:15 59:14 119:24 (4)
lacks 69:22 87:22 96:20 114:6	80:25 87:20 115:4 (7)	levels 32:13
(4)	leader 108:25 127:15	lids 7:13 127:7
landlords 117:3,6 118:24	leaders 122:8 127:11	lies 120:17
lane 53:13,18 102:10 103:25 (4)	leading 97:19	life 16:9 17:4 37:5 83:2
lanes 32:4 53:13,14,15 (4)	learn 52:13	84:2,11 95:19 97:22 (8)
language 95:14 120:9 122:17	learned 47:15 53:21 80:16	lifeline 49:17
127:14 130:11 (5)	learning 40:4	lift 110:7
large 24:7,13 83:5 87:25 96:22 98:14 114:4 116:11	least 25:11 130:21	lights 23:15 55:24
117:1,12 123:21 129:24 133:1 (13)	leave 90:13	liguori 2:3 5:2,3 10:11,15,18,24 11:1,7,11 14:25
larger 62:2,23	leaving 44:21 102:11	15:7 18:18 21:18 26:3 29:3,8,11,13,15,18 30:18,22
	led 60:5	33:3 36:13,19 40:17 42:24 46:4 50:14 54:20 57:19 60:22
largest 58:7	lefrancois 3:9 68:22,25 69:1	64:24 67:18 68:14,17,19 72:10
last 16:4 20:15 50:10 52:11 79:24 121:15 138:10 (7)	(4)	74:15 77:18 81:5 85:13 89:3 91:17 94:5 99:24 105:4 107:21
lastly 80:16	left 63:15 87:15 95:7 101:3 103:8 122:6 127:18,23 130:18	110:12 111:25 115:11 119:9 125:10,14 128:9 131:23
late 36:3	(9)	134:1,5,9,14,17,20,24 135:4 138:9,13,16,20,24 (70)
later 67:1 126:16 135:9	legion 4:10 125:12,18 126:9 127:1 (5)	like 20:16 23:1,19,19 30:4 34:14 36:7 38:6 45:8

	Engaging in creaning 5	163
46:6,14,17 47:5 68:2 77:24 79:13 81:17 93:5,11,19,23	February 10, 2025 loading 137:4	lower 53:3 60:2 69:8 109:15 111:9 (5)
105:22 113:10 114:10,15 119:25 122:19 126:25 128:21 130:24 131:4,10,17 133:18	local 7:1 62:16,17 92:9 93:4 98:11 114:11 116:9 (8)	lpc 91:8
135:6 139:5,6 (37)	localelected 5:23 89:17	lure 76:2
likely 36:4 39:2 79:3	located 39:16	m 20 140:8
likes 74:8	location 7:5,24 60:8 66:22 67:4 73:18,21,23 127:23	mack 4:5 107:22,25,25 110:13 (5)
limit 9:25 63:14 96:24	129:23 (10)	made 16:13 32:7 37:6 60:6
limitations 88:14 110:16	locations 14:12 31:5 32:9 35:15 39:11,13,17 44:16 52:5	68:3 84:25 105:21 135:18 (8)
limited 55:19 80:8 91:12 103:25 104:18 (5)	59:24 60:12 71:12 80:9,17,22 109:3 121:20 123:11,12 (19)	madelynn 2:3 5:3 21:25 128:24 131:21 138:2 (6)
lincoln 4:9 119:11,14	logistically 56:14	madison 2:18 40:25 41:3
line 56:7 101:16 120:15	long 49:24 51:18 58:24 61:4 95:3 132:21 (6)	magic 22:15,15,17,19 (4)
liners 92:22 101:1	longer 81:3 91:15	mailed 5:22
lines 136:13	5	maintain 56:11 98:21 108:14
list 10:20 46:8 70:15 75:21 (4)	longstanding 38:8 50:7 99:8	127:6 (4)
listed 40:22	longterm 91:9	maintained 117:18
listen 26:9	look 18:10 21:10 41:24 88:24 90:7 93:24 107:17 (7)	maintaining 69:5 88:11 99:9 106:7,10 115:2 (6)
literally 23:19	looked 135:16	maintains 114:19
litter 4:10 6:25 7:4,23 27:5 34:23 44:25 50:24 51:6,19	looking 85:1	maintenance 28:5 83:13 96:13
82:10 89:19 97:20 108:6	looks 72:4 133:12	
109:20,24 110:3,10 111:5 113:1,5,12 115:7 116:12 119:5 125:12,18 126:8,9,13,15,20	loose 126:13	major 20:6 56:19 77:4 93:6 104:16 120:17 (6)
127:1,8,18 129:12 130:19 137:21 (38)	lose 49:11 60:6	majority 13:13 34:14 90:10
little 31:22 55:25 66:19 80:20	losers 41:16	make 9:2 22:14 23:15 25:5,25 32:25 35:17 41:24 42:20 50:1
97:9 123:12 (6)	loss 123:25	52:25 57:7 59:19 66:13 80:12,21 82:21 90:21
livable 8:13	lot 80:16 106:12 111:13 116:8,15,17 117:3,20 118:5	93:7,22,23 94:2 105:23 113:17 117:14 136:11 137:24,24 (28)
live 26:24 57:7	122:7 132:16 136:10,23 (13)	makes 13:3
living 25:1 28:15 71:24	lots 118:14 123:8	making 14:22 45:23 71:24
lmi 26:13	love 84:14 116:7,9 118:23 (4)	80:5 92:16 102:6 103:13

to Entitles	Engaging in Cleaning S	ervices
	February 10, 2025	164
104:1,1 111:12 113:14 118:25 133:11 (13)	138:13 (5)	measures 64:19
mall 30:3	mark 2:21 50:15,18	meatpacking 3:9 68:23 69:2 71:4 72:4 (5)
maltezos 3:6 64:25 65:4,5 (4)	marketing 82:25	mechanism 35:9
manage 31:4 58:25 74:25	marriage 140:17	mechanisms 25:15 106:5
78:15 114:13 (5)	married 125:3	media 5:24
managed 104:24 106:14	marta 4:7 115:12	medium 53:1 123:22
management 3:9 68:24 69:3 70:19 106:3 114:8 125:4 (7)	martin 2:20 46:10,11,12 (4)	mediumsized 62:5
manager 3:3 57:21 58:1	materials 7:11 39:10 51:14	meet 12:22 19:7 106:20
manages 29:24 102:4	matter 91:14 107:13 140:12,18 (4)	133:14 (4)
managing 58:22 101:21	matthew 2:18 40:19,24 41:2	meeting 52:12 53:21 131:3
mandate 11:24 13:5 20:17	(4)	meetings 45:3 74:6 131:11
22:10,13 23:10 24:18 28:18 56:13 62:9 94:23 95:6,23	maxedout 26:20	melrose 15:13
96:10 99:4,15 102:7 103:1 124:18 (19)	may 6:5 7:2 8:17,24 9:17 20:15 24:21 42:11,13 44:11	member 3:17 16:6 89:5,15 105:12 107:1 (6)
mandates 14:17,21 36:7	46:7 49:5 53:22 56:5 64:2 73:6,18 94:19 97:13 113:4 123:24 129:24 130:22 136:21	members 6:3 68:3 82:20
mandatory 108:2	138:21 139:7,9 (27)	men 11:18 41:10 46:15 49:10,13 50:3 125:24 (7)
manhattan 19:2 43:6 60:2 78:15 92:14 125:21 129:5 (7)	maybe 30:19,19 137:3	mention 63:8
manhattan's 69:8 74:23	mayor's 18:12	mentioned 73:16 83:6 84:5
manner 21:8 54:3	mccall 2:15 29:8 33:4,12,15 (5)	105:25 132:6,25 (6)
manual 6:22	me 15:6 17:1 22:1 24:5,6,7	merchant 90:20
manufacturing 20:8	26:8 30:11,14,21 72:20,24 92:4 105:11,19 108:24,24	merchants 7:16 34:24 118:2
many 10:2 36:7 52:3 61:7	119:25 132:3 (19)	merit 40:7
62:14,21 63:24 72:21 81:16 86:16 93:10 104:4,5	mean 7:15 24:1,4,11,12 55:23 83:17 122:7 136:17 (9)	met 16:15 108:24
110:14,15,15 126:21 129:7,19 132:9 136:14 137:7,8 (23)	meaning 49:10	metrostor 16:16 35:11 83:25 136:20 (4)
mapping 44:16 51:23	means 10:4 26:18 79:7	meyer 29:5,20
marginally 28:14	meantime 32:6	microsoft 14 131:13,14 132:6 (4)
mario 10:21,24 134:5,17	meanwhile 28:1	× /

	February 10, 2025	165
middle 17:17 20:12,19	moderate 130:2	moved 20:22 62:24
midtown 2:11 18:21 19:2 43:6 65:8 (5)	modified 98:4	moves 31:17
miflin 4:13 135:3,4,6 (4)	modules 109:2 121:18	moving 62:4,8 111:4
might 21:3 30:19 52:5 60:11	momandpops 26:22	ms 5:2 10:11,15,18,24 11:1,7,11 14:25 15:7 18:18
97:17 (5)	moment 23:17	21:18,24 26:3,7 29:3,8,10,11,1 2,13,14,15,15,17,18,19
migration 114:5	monetary 11:25 13:8 66:18	30:12,18,21,22,24 33:3 36:13,19 40:17 42:24 43:3
mikelsteins 3:15 85:15,18,20 (4)	money 22:22 23:6 35:7,21,23 74:10 82:14 85:3 117:8 118:25 129:3 (11)	46:4 50:14 54:20,23 57:19 60:22,25 64:24 65:4 67:18 68:14,17,19 72:10 74:15
miles 81:15	monica 4:9 119:10	77:18,22 81:5,9 85:13 89:3,7 91:17 94:5 99:24 105:4,8
million 13:16 19:9,11,13 45:10 46:25 48:12,19 58:10,14 (10)	monitor 108:20 109:18	107:21,25 110:12,13 111:25 115:11,15 119:9,12 125:10,14,15 128:9,12 131:23
minimal 13:15	months 20:7 54:4,6 67:1,4 73:17 (6)	125.10,14,15 128.9,12 151.25 134:1,5,9,14,17,20,24 135:3,4,6 138:9,13,16,20,24 (95)
minimize 86:19 88:6	more 8:13,13 13:22 14:6 16:2,13 19:9 25:5,11 39:22	mta 122:25 123:3
minimizes 96:4	50:4,10 53:4,8 63:20 65:23	
minimum 20:25 83:17 102:19 106:9 (4)	68:13 77:5,5 79:4,15 80:14 81:14 90:13,14 92:17 93:8 95:11 99:13 100:15 101:25 104:21 115:4,7 121:19 129:14	much 11:11,14 14:25 18:18 21:16,18 23:20 26:3,9 29:2,3 31:14 33:3 36:13 42:23 46:4 50:14 54:20 60:22 64:24 65:23
minutes 10:1 68:21	131:11,18 133:21 134:14 136:3,17 (42)	68:13 72:10 77:18 81:5 84:25 85:12 89:3,7,9 91:17 94:5
misguided 113:8	moreover 87:2	99:24 105:4 107:17,21 111:8,25 115:3,16 116:3
missed 122:17	morning 5:2,9 9:11 11:6	119:6,9,12 128:9 131:23 133:25 134:1 135:7 138:1,9
missing 110:10 132:4	18:25 21:24,25 26:7 41:1 43:4 46:11 50:17 57:24 60:25 65:4	(51)
mission 56:8 100:19	69:1 72:14 74:18 81:10 85:19 89:8,13 94:10 105:10 106:13	multiple 75:18 83:23 129:21
missions 121:2	116:6 (26)	municipal 37:1,23 44:1
mistake 50:1	morris 2:12 21:22 22:3	must 13:7 31:16 70:11 77:15 97:7 115:9 122:16 123:9 (8)
mistakenly 66:4	most 15:16 20:9,22 26:15 30:2 36:3 39:4 49:1 62:5 65:24	mute 6:7
misunderstanding 113:9	114:10 127:23 (12)	my 5:3 11:15 15:9 16:5 21:15
mitigated 89:21	mott 15:14	26:11 28:23 33:14 46:11 50:17 60:21,25 65:4 67:24 69:1
mitigation 43:15	move 10:11 35:14 67:16 68:20 77:13 87:5 111:19	72:16 73:16 77:22 78:1 79:15 80:11,16 85:19 91:24
model 95:10	123:12 (8)	94:13,19,20 100:3 110:11

to Entities	Engaging In Cleaning S	ervices
	February 10, 2025	166
112:4 119:7 123:23 125:2,17 128:18 129:2,6 135:8	needs 12:5,9 18:14 19:7 25:10 40:13 53:4 67:8 72:6 90:6	nine 136:8
140:14,20 (40)	107:20 113:7 137:14 (13)	no 10:10,14,17,23,25 11:9 19:20 20:15 22:17 25:5 29:7
myer 2:15	negative 85:6 90:18	31:23 35:9,12 42:2,14 50:1
29:10,12,14,16,17,19	Regative 05.0 90.10	52:25 53:15,18 55:24,24
	nogotively 12:0	63:4,24 66:18 68:16,18 74:9
30:12,21,24 (10)	negatively 43:9	
2.2		78:13 84:24 124:13 125:13
n 2:2	neighborhood 7:16 14:23	134:4,8,13,16,19,23
	30:7 31:21 43:24 45:2,15	138:12,15,19,23 140:17 (43)
name 5:3 9:19,21 11:15 15:9	69:17 75:24 76:3 82:22 84:12	
26:11 33:14 46:11 50:18 61:1	90:20 92:14,17 108:16 112:12	noah 4:12 10:7,9 131:25 (4)
65:5 67:24 69:1 72:16 77:22	114:4,6 116:2,16 117:22	
85:19 91:24 94:13 100:4 112:4 125:17 128:18 (22)	118:14 123:23 125:20 (25)	nobody 22:11
	neighborhoods 8:14 15:13	noho 3:13 77:21,24 78:2,4 (5)
narrow 60:3	32:25 40:14 55:4 65:19 66:3	
	93:1 95:3 100:22 106:23	nonbid 43:19
nassau 140:6	114:16 129:9 (13)	
		noncompliance 87:12
nate 4:6 112:1,2,4 115:16	neighbors 26:22	
116:3,22 (7)		none 138:24
110.5,22 (7)	neither 34:9	
nation 21:12	neuner 54.9	nongovernmental 7:17
	never 78:20 109:21	nongover innentai 7.17
nature 119:23	Hevel 70.20109.21	nonprofit 47:16 48:9 75:13
Mature 119.25	neverending 27:4	76:16 90:6 92:9 120:21 124:19
navigable 6:14	neverenuing 27.1	128:22 135:10 (10)
	new 3 5:22 6:9 7:6 8:8,14	120.22 155.10 (10)
near 14:8 113:13	21:5,12 25:6 38:3 41:4 43:15	nonprofits 55:11 86:11
lical 14.8 115.15	46:13 49:6 57:7,11,16 59:24	90:11,19 91:11 96:7 127:22 (7)
n_{00} m 27.2 29.2 15		90.11,19 91.11 90.7 127.22 (7)
nearly 27:3 28:3,15	60:7,11 64:7,22 66:7 69:5,20 71:22 77:3 83:11 86:17 89:1	
58:9,12,22 59:20 94:25 (8)		nonstandard 44:12
4 41 24	92:5,7,23,25 93:5,7,10 94:2,24	50.00.00.14
neaten 41:24	95:19 99:14 100:17 102:7,17	nor 59:23 88:14
	104:23 111:18 113:21 114:2	
neatly 22:17 118:8,9	126:5 128:17 129:2 140:4,9	normal 14:7 18:8
50 0 104 11 114 00	(53)	
necessary 70:9 104:11 114:20		north 3:20 34:3 75:2 94:7,14
122:2 (4)	news 103:16	97:3 99:3 134:6,18 138:14 (10)
		10.22
need 13:11 16:10 20:1,11	next 9:6 12:13 15:2 17:18	northshore 10:22
23:23 24:5 27:14 35:17 48:9	18:20 21:20 26:4 29:4 33:4	
52:17 53:8,25 56:6,24 64:16	36:14 40:19,21,21 42:25 46:9	notary 140:8
68:12 73:18 80:13 83:11 84:16	47:6 50:15 51:19 54:21 57:20	
87:6 104:12 107:5 109:12	60:23 64:25 67:19 68:20,22	note 80:10 83:22
111:19 117:14 121:19	72:11 74:16 77:19 81:6 85:14	
137:10,15 (29)	89:4 91:18 94:6 99:25 105:5	noted 18:25 139:13
	107:22 112:1 115:12 119:10	
needed 52:4,8 62:25 81:21	125:11 128:10 129:12 131:25	notforprofit 116:1,19
84:7 (5)	134:2 (44)	
		nothing 22:15 27:11
needn't 137:5	nicely 64:2	

to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services		
	February 10, 2025	167
notice 9:14	official 89:17	operation 52:2 92:10 99:5
notification 79:23 80:1,5	officials 5:23 82:19	operational 6:4 25:15 52:7 59:19 60:14 70:6 75:10 76:11
notify 129:18	often 13:14 14:5 16:24 17:3 35:4 56:25 66:3 125:23 130:1	95:24 96:19 98:25 99:6 102:17 (13)
notion 113:7	132:13 (10)	
november 51:16 59:7	oh 29:15,15 110:11	operationalize 62:21 64:10
now 20:9 23:8 62:8 79:2 85:1	oldest 15:16	operationally 64:18
101:20 116:2 121:17 122:19 131:3 136:21 (11)	omb 119:25	operations 3:3,10,15 17:8 37:7 50:19 57:21 58:1 62:13
nowhere 113:20	once 25:22 110:8	66:15 69:22 72:12,17 85:16 132:12 (15)
number 35:13 61:11 102:15 103:20 114:19 122:5 136:5 (7)	one 13:16 14:5 15:16 16:22 23:10 25:11 33:21 34:8 41:16	opportunism 43:20
numerous 101:7	46:24 47:16 60:6 66:22,25 67:4 73:17,21,23 76:15 78:14 94:24 100:25 104:3 118:16	opportunity 19:4 21:17 29:22 33:13 46:2 85:21 94:11 132:3 (8)
nyc 3:5 60:24 61:2,17 65:10 86:14 87:4 139:9 (8)	119:19 123:12 127:15 130:9 133:5,5,8,14 134:14 136:7 (34)	(8) oppose 61:14
nycrules@dsnynycgov 8:25 139:8	oneandahalf 81:14	opposed 35:16 108:2
	ones 137:9	opposition 47:3 128:16
nypd 17:9 72:22	ones 137:9 onesize 38:21	<pre>opposition 47:3 128:16 opt 44:11</pre>
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19		
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5	 onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 	opt 44:11
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15	 onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15 obligation 100:18	<pre>onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 123:13 126:12 132:23 (17)</pre>	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9 optimistic 25:7
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15 obligation 100:18 obstruct 39:14	 onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 123:13 126:12 132:23 (17) onstreet 70:17 83:6 96:23 	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9 optimistic 25:7 optimizing 32:14 option 28:2 111:5 options 47:20 52:1 83:5,9
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15 obligation 100:18	<pre>onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 123:13 126:12 132:23 (17)</pre>	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9 optimistic 25:7 optimizing 32:14 option 28:2 111:5
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15 obligation 100:18 obstruct 39:14	 onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 123:13 126:12 132:23 (17) onstreet 70:17 83:6 96:23 	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9 optimistic 25:7 optimizing 32:14 option 28:2 111:5 options 47:20 52:1 83:5,9
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15 obligation 100:18 obstruct 39:14 occupy 32:3 off 51:8 54:14 61:11 62:12	onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 123:13 126:12 132:23 (17) onstreet 70:17 83:6 96:23 onto 10:12 open 55:24 opening 125:6	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9 optimistic 25:7 optimizing 32:14 option 28:2 111:5 options 47:20 52:1 83:5,9 106:2 137:2 (6)
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15 obligation 100:18 obstruct 39:14 occupy 32:3 off 51:8 54:14 61:11 62:12 64:16 73:8 75:6 79:11 81:19 105:9 112:17 121:12 134:11	onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 123:13 126:12 132:23 (17) onstreet 70:17 83:6 96:23 onto 10:12 open 55:24 opening 125:6 operate 59:9 114:16	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9 optimistic 25:7 optimizing 32:14 option 28:2 111:5 options 47:20 52:1 83:5,9 106:2 137:2 (6) oral 8:18 order 9:12 48:8 104:13,13 127:8 (5) organization 7:18 15:20
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15 obligation 100:18 obstruct 39:14 occupy 32:3 off 51:8 54:14 61:11 62:12 64:16 73:8 75:6 79:11 81:19 105:9 112:17 121:12 134:11 (13)	onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 123:13 126:12 132:23 (17) onstreet 70:17 83:6 96:23 onto 10:12 open 55:24 opening 125:6 operate 59:9 114:16 operated 104:21	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9 optimistic 25:7 optimizing 32:14 option 28:2 111:5 options 47:20 52:1 83:5,9 106:2 137:2 (6) oral 8:18 order 9:12 48:8 104:13,13 127:8 (5) organization 7:18 15:20 28:19 36:23 50:2 56:5,9,15 86:7 94:16 95:1 97:15 112:9
nypd 17:9 72:22 object 44:19 objecting 71:5 objects 44:15 obligation 100:18 obstruct 39:14 occupy 32:3 off 51:8 54:14 61:11 62:12 64:16 73:8 75:6 79:11 81:19 105:9 112:17 121:12 134:11 (13) offense 76:15	onesize 38:21 ongoing 83:13 only 16:12 17:21 20:5,16 28:1 34:7 56:19 60:17 88:1 96:23 102:12 103:17 106:13 110:5 123:13 126:12 132:23 (17) onstreet 70:17 83:6 96:23 onto 10:12 open 55:24 opening 125:6 operate 59:9 114:16	opt 44:11 optimally 25:9 optimistic 25:7 optimizing 32:14 option 28:2 111:5 options 47:20 52:1 83:5,9 106:2 137:2 (6) oral 8:18 order 9:12 48:8 104:13,13 127:8 (5) organization 7:18 15:20 28:19 36:23 50:2 56:5,9,15

		1.00
organizations 18:9 21:2 57:4	February 10, 2025 82:7,13,16,20,23,25 83:18	168 overburdening 106:22
64:17,21 75:14 93:5,19 98:6	84:12,20,20 85:4,6,22	overburdening 100.22
106:22 113:4,10,18 116:20	86:4,7,10 89:10 90:2,4,10,22	overcome 39:5 49:13
120:21 124:19,25 127:21	92:8,10,16,18 93:12 94:22	Overcome 39.5 19.15
128:7 (19)	95:2 96:8,9,13,16 97:1,14 98:6	overfilling 118:7
	99:20 100:11,18,21 101:16	
organize 65:22 112:18 113:18	102:12 103:15 107:7 108:7,10	overflow 41:23 79:9 118:11
126:10,17 (5)	110:4,25 111:3,7,18 112:12	
	114:16,22 115:17,20,21	overflowing 38:4 42:8 61:23
organized 112:13	116:1,4,9,11,13,14,16,17,24	64:4 93:16 97:20 126:14,16 (8)
	117:1,13 118:3,13,19,19	
organizing 128:14	119:21 120:5,6,12 121:1,9,9,13	overpopulation 89:20
	123:24 124:2,3,3,14,24	
original 95:15	126:1,11,18 127:13 128:6,14	overseen 74:22
	133:7,16 136:2 138:4 (231)	
ostensibly 113:2	00 00 114 10 15	oversimplifying 24:20
	ours 93:23 114:10,15	
other 6:14 7:5,17,23,24 12:15 14:5 16:9 20:3 21:2 23:13	ourselves 23:10 65:14 80:2	overwhelming 93:14
28:1,16 35:15,19 39:5,16	95:4 (4)	own 22:16 27:7,15 38:22
55:23 67:9 68:4 71:2 73:3.24	95:4 (4)	44:11 81:18 93:3 114:14 129:3
74:3 83:7 86:8 87:1 88:20	out 7:11,21 8:5 22:8 30:11,13	(9)
90:24 102:2,19 104:8 105:17	34:15 40:8 54:10 56:7 63:15	
117:21 118:14 120:3,16	68:4,10,15 74:3 79:23 84:9	owned 6:16
127:1,4 129:7 130:6 135:23	90:13 109:4 115:16	owned one
137:8,17 (44)	116:12,18,21 118:6,9,23	owners 22:25 41:18 44:7
	119:18 123:7 124:11 130:1,21	79:24 80:7 124:4 (6)
others 6:21 72:23 132:10	132:9,14 133:21 134:24	
	136:18 137:13,17 (38)	p 2:2,2
otherwise 21:3 28:8 44:9		
	outcome 140:18	packedin 117:4
our 11:17 13:1,2 14:2,8,12,13		
15:17,19,20 16:2,19,21	outlaw 112:21	paid 82:6
17:17,18 18:7 19:6,8,12		
20:2,14,14 22:6,12	outlined 86:12 96:9	paloma 2:15 29:9 33:5,12,15
23:1,6,16,18 24:15 25:20	28.10.127.10	(5)
26:21,22 27:11,11,13,15,18 28:3,13,16,19,19,20,24,25 31:2	outrageous 38:19 127:10	pandemic 75:25
32:14,18 33:22	outset 61:9	pandenne 75.25
34:7,11,13,15,17,18,22,24	outset 01.9	parades 122:18
35:1,2,8,13,19 36:14 37:5,22	outside 18:5,7 103:14	
39:7,12,15 40:13 41:6,19,23	Utilitie 10.5,7 105.11	paralyzed 23:8
42:20 43:10,14 44:2 45:1,23	over 15:15,15 16:20 35:7	parady zea zero
46:15 47:2,9,13,20 48:22	36:24 46:22 48:12 50:9 51:4	paramount 30:5
49:11 50:2,6,13 51:5 52:1	55:2 56:8 58:11,13,18,18	•
53:17 55:17,20,23	59:22 61:16,25 65:11 69:10,14	park 2:12 3:7 21:22 22:3
56:1,1,5,7,9,9,14 57:3,13	76:9 78:5 80:8,20 81:3,18	67:20,25 68:6 94:16 123:4
58:21,21 59:9,16 62:12	83:12 100:9 105:22 108:7	134:10,21 138:17 (12)
65:10,11,16,18,25 66:3 68:10	109:2 111:16 112:15,16 116:2	
69:971:23,2472:2,7	123:2 126:19 133:7 (39)	parking 32:4 53:15,16,18
75:9,19,19,25 76:5,12,24		123:14 (5)
77:11,15 78:8,17,25 79:5	overall 15:19 19:19 79:10	
80:18 81:22,25		parks 72:23 75:1

		1.00
part 47:9 65:25 72:5 81:20 82:4 95:18 99:11 100:18	February 10, 2025 patricia 3:6 64:25 65:5	169 period 10:5 20:9 81:3
118:18 (9)	pay 35:4 36:9 44:8,13 111:7 (5)	periods 70:18 88:4 98:17
participate 70:24	paying 111:8	permanent 17:10 47:21
participated 75:7	pdc 91:9	permissible 39:11
particular 116:24	pedestrian 23:5 77:2 79:8	permitting 70:8
particularly 15:23 64:12 76:24 97:24 102:9 126:2,7 (7)	pedestrians 136:11	persen 3:13 77:20,22,23 (4)
parties 5:25 140:16	pedro 2:10 15:2,9	person 10:7 15:2 18:20 46:9 60:23 (5)
partner 72:21 95:4 99:9 109:17 (4)	penalize 57:8	personalized 133:22
partnered 38:12	penalized 32:20	persons 9:14
partners 14:14 32:24 40:15	penalizes 124:18	perspective 132:24
46:20 48:22 57:6 61:17 62:11 64:13 65:11,15 67:16 70:7	penalizing 39:25 40:9 70:13 85:2 (4)	phase 74:6
72:2 76:20 81:17 85:10 90:24 120:3 122:2 (20)	penalties 8:2 13:8 38:16	phenomenal 132:11
partnership 2:11,15,17	44:14 76:13 87:21 98:8 129:11 (8)	physical 65:17
14:13,20 18:22 19:2 25:24 29:6,21,23 32:6 33:10 36:16	penalty 40:15 57:1 77:10	pick 13:6 123:5 129:22
37:3 38:9 42:19 43:22 49:16,25 50:7 51:9 52:18	people 10:2,19 18:15 22:3	pickup 37:10 38:1 42:4 59:13 62:7 63:15 84:15 88:6 93:6
53:25 59:6 60:19 64:6 66:9 73:6 95:8,12 119:16 120:22 (33)	71:22 83:7 111:8 115:17 131:2,19 138:4 (11)	109:15 110:25 116:10 124:13 (13)
partnerships 100:16	per 51:5 78:23 102:5 120:5 (4)	pickups 122:18
parts 74:1 78:8 114:4	percent 14:1,4,5 15:19 16:20	pier 6:13
parttime 92:19	69:15 79:4 82:13,16 101:25 108:10 120:12 123:22 (13)	pile 114:17
passed 48:22	percentage 102:3	piled 123:1
passing 45:18	perform 6:21 31:16	piles 121:11 123:3
passman 2:22 54:21,23,24 (4)	performed 100:19	pilot 59:4 66:22 71:10 74:6,9 79:22 82:5 108:18 121:4
past 78:6	performs 6:20	137:15 (10)
path 107:4	perhaps 133:19	pilot's 108:20
pathway 99:6	peril 55:9	pioneered 12:24 13:9
r man maj 2200	Port Corr	pitkin 4:5 107:23 108:4,11

	February 10, 2025	170
110:9 (5)	ploy 43:20	pounds 112:17 126:19
pits 104:6	plus 69:6 82:15 83:12 109:12 (4)	power 14:16 19:21
place 6:13 7:2 19:22 24:15,16,25 26:24 44:23 50:24	pm 9:1 139:13	powerful 26:15
56:22 57:7 93:8 103:11 113:4 117:22 121:1 124:12 129:15	point 24:15 34:5,21 60:6	practical 99:20 106:20
(18)	66:17 68:4 132:9 135:2 (8)	practicality 88:17
placed 7:11 8:5 59:23 127:20 (4)	points 108:24	practically 132:20
placement 6:11 80:10 88:5	police 123:6,14	practice 51:18 127:17
97:1 98:23 104:1 112:25 122:20 (8)	policies 89:12 91:4 106:11	predominantly 27:12
places 70:5 113:13 117:16,21	policy 13:4 26:17 28:10 40:8 47:3,9,15 48:8 49:5 50:1	prejudicial 43:16
123:3 (5)	70:8,21 71:25 75:6 100:12 101:6 132:23 (17)	premier 69:5
placing 7:20 47:5 51:18 80:21 (4)	policymaking 95:24	prepares 36:25 37:25
plan 17:18 37:14 54:7,12 67:6	pollutants 114:22 115:5	preparing 51:17
75:17,19 120:5 121:24 138:6 (10)	poorly 24:19	present 8:16,18 131:19
planned 129:25	popular 30:4	presented 28:23
planning 3:3,6,15 22:20	populations 57:13	presently 28:10
50:19 57:21 65:1,5 74:5 85:15 93:18 (11)	port 10:21 134:6,18 138:14	president 2:11,18 3:10 4:9 11:15 18:21 19:1,20 29:20
plans 35:19 86:13 96:9 101:14 (4)	(4) position 100:11	33:9 36:15 40:24 41:2 43:4 50:19 72:12,17 74:19 119:11 (19)
plant 65:21	positive 23:4 59:1 69:16,19	presidentceo 2:17
plants 115:23	(4)	presidents 122:19
plastic 22:11 25:6,21	possibility 63:24	pressure 54:14
-	possible 23:20 25:5 60:11 81:2 83:4 90:21 (6)	pressures 26:15,21
plates 16:13		•
platform 131:12	possibly 85:1	pretends 27:19
plazas 6:23	post 139:10	prevent 34:24 79:9 115:7
please 6:7 9:20 25:11 28:22 45:6 54:10 (6)	potential 45:7 52:5 53:20 98:7 (4)	preventing 38:3
pleased 105:12 119:13 121:13 124:4 (4)	potentially 42:9 86:25 133:1,16 (4)	previous 68:3 pride 50:8
1 - T (T)	155.1,10 (7)	Price 50.0

to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services		
	February 10, 2025	171
prided 95:3	106:6 109:19 110:19 121:4,14 123:19 131:13 (35)	prosperous 92:18
primarily 107:7		protect 98:5
· ·	programmatic 65:17	•
primary 83:24 101:20 117:22	programs 21:4 23:13 40:3	protections 28:6
principle 22:11 78:5	55:25 74:6 83:2 92:15 (7)	proven 97:8
printing 74:24	prohibit 53:12	proves 21:12
priorities 26:19	prohibiting 47:4	provide 17:11,21 24:5,9 38:11 40:1 44:11 46:21 47:12
private 12:16 37:17,23 38:2 39:17 51:2 58:11 120:20,22	prohibition 7:19	52:24 53:4 63:11 70:15 71:19 76:20 85:23 87:10 92:15
124:19 (10)	prohibitive 83:10	98:5,24 100:24,25 104:11 110:21,22 (25)
privately 6:15 38:2 44:8	prohibits 6:10 112:24	provided 44:9 45:19 59:12
privatelyfunded 22:24	project 19:25 20:6,16	75:21 84:23 (5)
probably 36:4	projections 76:13	provider 49:10
problem 79:20 81:16 90:4 99:11 107:19 118:13,22 (7)	projects 60:5	providers 46:17 47:5
<i>JJ.</i> 11 107.17 110.13,22 (7)	promotion 92.25	maridag 15.21 42.24 55.16
problematic 36:10 37:20	promotion 82:25	provides 15:21 43:24 55:16
11	proper 89:21 109:14	providing 17:25 23:2 28:12
problems 27:12 60:15		31:22 38:17 44:14 61:18 70:7
procedure 5:13 23:24	properly 20:23 21:9 41:21 59:21 60:18 78:19 115:1 (7)	79:13 81:21 88:9 95:1 97:25 101:17 112:5 124:20 (16)
proceedings 5:1 140:11,13	properties 81:14 119:1	ps 125:2
process 20:11 23:24 38:22	property 22:25 37:18 41:18	public 7 5:8,15,15 6:12,23,25
54:1 60:10 65:12 66:12 70:25	44:7 79:24 80:7 82:20 101:11	7:4,23 12:18 13:7 14:1
72:5 74:5 86:16 96:18 97:9	117:10 124:4 (10)	17:23,25 21:14 23:2 24:6
108:21 (14)	117.10 124.4 (10)	27:5,17 31:22 37:2,15,24
106.21 (14)	proposal 35:12 44:20 116:21	45:12 47:7 50:24 51:6,19,20
procure 71:15	132:22 (4)	52:6 53:10 56:3 59:5 65:22,23
procure 71.15	132.22 (4)	
	=	67:9,11,13 69:12,15 73:11 75:6 77:6,11 78:9 81:19 82:9
procurement 28:8 70:20,21	proposals 128:6	85:24 87:13 93:20,21 97:18,25
productive 52:11	proposed 5 6:1 7:10 8:21	98:3 101:21 103:25
_	11:23 19:5 31:18 33:14 37:19	104:7,8,9,18,19 111:16,18
products 70:16 71:13	41:17 43:15 44:17 47:3,15 50:22 52:15 56:15 61:14	113:1,5,13 120:11,22 121:11 126:15 127:18 129:11,12
profoundly 95:7	63:3,10 69:25 85:8 86:5 88:12	130:19 131:16 133:1 140:8
protounury 75.7	89:11,23 90:3 91:3 94:22	(77)
program 20:25 21:7,10 28:16	103:1 112:8,20 113:2,16 115:9	$(\prime\prime)$
39:21 49:8 53:12 59:20 65:25	128:3 130:10 (37)	publicly 6:15 44:24
	120.3 130.10 (37)	Publicly 0.13 44.24
66:18,23 70:4,13,25 71:17 74:0 13 75:8 76:4 70:14 20	\mathbf{n}	nubliannivata 42.22 100.16
74:9,13 75:8 76:4 79:14,20	prospect 94:17	publicprivate 43:22 100:16
80:3,12,18,25 82:5 98:14,20		

to Entities	Engaging In Cleaning S	ervices
	February 10, 2025	172
published 5:18,25 8:22	quickly 13:10 21:8 35:3 46:14 64:10 66:13 (6)	realized 125:15
pukos 33:11 36:17	quinn 124:8	really 26:14 27:13,15,23 28:2,9,21,25 36:10 41:16
pull 27:15 79:16	quite 60:7 63:1 104:25,25 (4)	42:16 82:1,3 89:12 111:15 119:21 123:16 124:6,9 128:14
punish 120:2 122:11	r 2:2 140:2	135:15 136:9,18 137:20,20,22 138:2 (27)
punishable 45:24	rafael 16:6	realm 53:10 104:9
punishes 124:18	rain 114:19,24 115:3 117:22	realtime 130:17
punishing 67:10	(4)	reason 7:24 59:18 120:24
punitive 14:17 47:18 60:14 64:19 70:5 97:23 98:8 101:7 119:22 121:23 (10)	raise 26:20,25 135:1 138:21 (4)	reasonably 117:19
purchase 35:10 47:21,24 48:9	raises 86:6	reasoning 120:18
53:1 56:20 98:20 109:22 127:6 (9)	ramifications 66:15	reasons 37:21 101:8
purchasing 48:14 106:7,10	ranging 51:25	receive 5:14 47:18
purpose 5:13 6:19 43:22	rat 43:15 57:13 88:6 89:19 97:21 105:16 114:5 (7)	received 9:3 27:9 103:6
127:16 (4)	rate 61:24	receives 9:8,9 139:4
purposes 7:1,14	rather 99:11 127:23 130:20	receiving 18:5 103:23
push 31:19 54:10	rats 8:6 27:12 33:22 61:12	recent 95:6 103:16
put 16:2 50:12 75:11,12 79:22 85:8 90:9 104:9 109:4 113:20	63:13 123:8 (6)	recently 32:11 39:20 135:14
117:8,19 118:3 119:7 123:15 133:13 136:1 137:13 (18)	reach 86:23	receptacles 7:13 38:4 44:12,13 45:14 47:7 51:20
puts 22:17 55:8 129:6	readily 39:17	69:11 93:16 113:14 127:7 (11)
putting 28:11 40:20 118:7,9	reading 89:14	reckless 100:14
(4)	ready 77:13 135:8	recognize 31:15 89:18 96:1 99:10 125:23 (5)
quality 16:9 17:4 37:5 83:2 84:11 97:22 (6)	real 58:10 63:23 84:2 110:21 (4)	recognizes 121:25
quarter 102:6	realistic 17:15 88:21	recommend 18:2 81:2 88:3
quarters 30:3	realistically 63:21	recommendations 105:23
queens 4:11 33:17 34:3,20 128:10,20 129:5 132:14,20	realities 67:8 94:20 107:6	recommending 122:4
133:12 (10)	reality 25:5 95:25 96:6 108:18 (4)	reconsider 40:11 42:17 111:4
quick 35:4		record 5:19 8:17 9:23 140:13

CO ENCICIES ENGAGING IN CLEANING SERVICES		
(4)	February 10, 2025 related 71:7 140:16	173 reported 140:11
recovering 76:25	relating 5 5:15,16 6:17 7:9 (5)	reporter 20 8:16 9:22
recyclables 58:19	relation 107:8 126:8	reporting 96:7 117:24
recycling 7:3,21 19:10 88:4 (4)	relationship 43:11 57:10 72:25	reports 103:16
redevelopment 26:16	released 135:12,14	represent 15:14,18 80:7
redo 30:20	reliable 132:13	representatives 106:19 126:22 131:1
reduce 37:8 43:13 44:3 63:12 70:22 75:8 114:21 115:8 (8)	relining 61:22	represents 16:20 55:1 61:6 89:16 (4)
reduced 44:5	rely 84:21 113:8 114:10 124:15 (4)	request 67:15 90:17 110:4 112:7 121:22 (5)
reducing 8:9 61:11	remain 37:9 62:18 64:6 70:17 88:19 98:18 99:18 (7)	requests 117:20
references 88:1 96:22	remains 107:2	require 13:21 20:18 44:6
refining 40:3	remarks 21:15	47:16 50:23 96:11 102:15,23 109:16 127:5 (10)
refuse 6:12 7:3,20 113:1 (4)	remember 22:23	required 84:22
regarded 49:9	remote 5:10	requirement 31:24 45:24
regarding 6:5 43:7,8		76:23 89:23 (4)
regina 2:15 29:5,15,19 30:10 (5)	remotely 13 removal 47:23 86:5 118:1	requirements 5:12 54:13 78:12 89:1 97:6 102:18 133:15
regular 127:25	remove 13:2 37:15 45:6 46:24	(7)
regularly 17:7 60:3 114:23	47:25 53:19 84:19 113:11 117:15 (9)	requires 7:10 17:19
regulated 6:3 96:5	removed 19:9 45:13	requiring 101:5
regulation 24:19 25:17	removes 95:15	rescind 14:20 121:23
regulations 39:8 53:16,19	removing 41:14 112:16	reset 67:15
91:6 97:4 (5)	rents 8:9	residential 57:16 73:22 88:8 98:15 117:9,11 118:21,22
regulatory 2:3 5:4		120:16,20 123:23 (11)
reimbursed 121:8	reopen 106:5	residents 30:8 58:12 69:7
reiterate 37:22	replace 12:11 61:25 120:10	86:1 93:9 111:17,22 114:10 119:3 (9)
rejected 115:9	replaced 56:25 109:22 110:9	resolve 14:15 90:4
rejection 128:2 130:9	report 17:7 55:11 75:14 135:15 (4)	resources 12:6 13:12 16:3

to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services		
	February 10, 2025	174
39:23 61:21 66:19 78:7 102:23 114:8 116:16 (10)	revisit 93:25	routes 48:17 128:1 130:4
	revolution 69:20	rule 5 5:15,18,22 6:1,19
respect 11:17 43:21 72:1		7:10,14 8:19,21 19:5 25:12
138:3 (4)	reynolds 4:6 112:1,2,4,5 (5)	27:19 31:18 33:14 37:19
		38:21,25 40:9 41:17 54:5
respectfully 84:3 90:17	richmond 10:22 134:6,18	61:14 63:3,10,18,20 64:12
121:22	138:14 (4)	69:21 70:1,5,13 71:5 72:7 73:5
121.22	150.11(1)	75:11 76:9 77:16 83:3
respondents 69:15	ridiculous 14:9	84:10,13 85:9 86:6,18,19
respondents 09.15	Fuiculous 14.9	
1. 12.7		87:9,22 88:1,13 91:1 93:15
responding 43:7	right 123:3 131:9	96:4,20 98:4 100:11,12
		104:3,10,20,23 112:8,20
response 10:10,14,17,23,25	rigid 7:12 38:25 50:25 53:8	113:2,16 114:9 115:9 123:18
29:7 68:16,18 125:13	127:6 (5)	124:17 126:24 127:12,16
134:4,8,13,16,19,23		128:3,17 129:5 130:10 (74)
138:12,15,19,23 (19)	ripping 78:19	
		rulemaking 42:18
responsibilities 49:21 100:21	rising 102:17	
•	0	rules 6:17 7:8 11:23 12:2,13
responsibility 12:19 44:16	risk 13:8	13:19 14:17 17:16 43:8,15
48:2,3 101:21 102:22 106:15	H BK 13.0	45:7 50:22 52:16 56:15 93:10
(7)	river 58:6	94:1 119:23 120:18,24 121:23
(7)	river 58.0	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
11 29.19 102.14	1 2 21 100 1 7 102 0	122:3,15,23 123:9 136:7 139:9
responsible 38:18 103:14	road 3:21 100:1,7 102:9	(26)
119:2	103:22,24 (6)	
		ruling 27:10
responsive 18:14 80:14	rob 2:11 18:20,25	
		run 120:24
rest 44:10 82:23	robust 60:18	
		runs 31:25 102:10
restaurant 35:1 73:20	rock 133:8	
		rush 20:10 74:10 97:5 135:25
restricted 103:12	rolled 40:8 119:18	(4)
restrictions 73:14	rolledout 100:14	rushed 54:16
result 13:20 42:11 49:5 50:4	rolliebins 17:13	ryan 33:11 36:17
56:5 69:14 73:7 93:15 (8)		iyun 55.11 50.17
50.5 09.14 75.7 95.15 (0)	rolling 74:3	s 2:2 3:6,11
resulting 20:10 48:25 130:18	Toning 74.5	\$ 2.2 5.0,11
resulting 20.10 48.23 130.18	rollout 20:5 80:18 98:15	safe 13:19
notoil 20.15 120.10	1011011 20.3 00.10 98.13	Salt 13.17
retail 39:15 120:19	ma a game 14 24 C	aafan 02:17
	roosevelt 34:6	safer 92:17
rethink 74:12 121:23	100 6	6 4 92 2 104 10
	rose 100:6	safety 83:2 104:18
revealed 48:7		
	rothrock 3:5 60:23,25 61:1	said 41:15 73:1 77:25 110:4
reveals 95:23	(4)	116:22 120:15 132:17 (7)
review 71:1	roughly 58:3	salamanca 16:6
revised 130:14	round 79:21 132:4	same 13:14 73:2 112:19
		1

to Entities	Engaging In Cleaning S	Services
	February 10, 2025	175
sanction 45:7	scope 103:14	81:13 94:13 99:20 (7)
sanitation 4 2:5 5:7 11:19	scorse 3:10 72:11,14,16 (4)	served 61:20
12:12,20,22 13:21,22		
14:2,14,19 15:18,21,24 17:22	scrapped 100:13	serves 26:13
19:14 21:4 28:3 32:15,23	Scrupped 100110	
34:16 35:14 36:25 37:10 38:14	scupp 43:1	service 23:3,3 28:13,24 31:16
40:2 41:11 43:25 45:11		32:13 39:19 44:1 45:18 47:4
46:16,22 47:13 48:5,24	second 23:11 58:7 105:9	48:16 49:6 59:13,14 81:20
49:1,9,11,24 50:11 51:1,9		83:8 84:10 97:19,25 (19)
52:12 55:15 56:6 57:24 58:22	secondly 103:4	
60:20 61:19 62:3 64:1 65:24	•	serviced 118:19 127:3
69:9 72:22 73:1,17 74:7,11	section 6:9 7:6,25 8:3	
75:20,23 78:3 79:7	40:23,23 112:24 113:7 115:6	services 6 5:17 6:22 12:10,22
82:12,18,19 85:23 86:6 87:11	(9)	13:21 15:17,22 31:13,22
88:12 89:1 90:1 92:18,24		38:10,14,17 40:2 43:25 44:4
93:2,13 99:22 101:16,18	sector 58:11	46:22 47:13 48:6 49:1
102:2,21 106:21 107:16 108:9		55:16,23 56:6 61:18 64:1
109:14 111:11 119:18	secured 32:11	71:18 75:16,21,23 76:21 81:22
120:4,7,13,14 122:8 125:5,7,25		83:15,24 84:20 85:24 86:14
126:7 127:4,24 128:23 129:16	see 22:11 24:11 42:7,8 84:14	87:1,11 89:25 92:15,25 93:13
130:16 132:15 135:17,20 (103)	99:5 117:11 122:25 136:9 (9)	95:2,13 96:8 99:16 100:20,24
		101:18 102:2 120:8,11 121:19
sank 27:13	seeing 138:24	124:20 127:4 (55)
saturday 22:5 116:6	seek 86:8 119:21	servicing 69:10 110:5
savage 4:10 125:11,15,17 (4)	seeks 90:3 113:3	serving 94:16
Suvage 1.10 120.11,10,17 (1)	Seens 70.0 110.0	
saw 124:7	seems 103:2,3	set 16:22 62:6 140:20
say 9:20 19:13 22:9 24:21	seen 119:25	setout 18:3,6 57:15 78:19 (4)
25:24 105:11,13 132:16 133:7	Seen 119.25	
137:4 (10)	send 130:1	setting 69:12 80:23
		0
saying 105:19 125:22	sending 135:9	seven 48:17
sbs 18:11 70:22 96:10 108:15	senior 3:3,12 57:21 58:1	several 37:21 53:19 82:4
120:7 123:10 (6)	74:17,19 (6)	83:4,25 96:1 103:4 105:23
		123:15 (9)
scarce 61:21	sense 93:22	
		severe 126:6
schedule 59:17 109:15 110:23	sent 16:25	
		severely 49:22
scheduled 5:20 35:25	sentiments 94:20	
		shall 7:14 8:1
schedules 18:4,7 88:6 129:21	separately 41:9	
(4)		shamefully 104:3
	september 35:25	
schlitzer 4:7 115:12,15	50 10	share 41:10,13 50:8 51:7
school 24:8	serious 59:18	52:17 61:10 63:13 94:11 99:13
SCHOOL 24.0	serve 34:13 49:3 50:3 68:6	(9)
	SELVE 34.13 49.3 JUIS 08:0	

		17/
shared 14:22 28:2 44:17 52:20 54:17 86:10 95:16 (7)	February 10, 2025 102:11,13 121:12 124:5 126:13,18 136:6 (16)	situation 28:11
she 33:8 77:24	sign 123:13	situations 122:5 129:13 137:7
sheroff 4:12 10:7 131:25 132:2 (4)	signature 140:23	six 34:5 54:4,6 59:7,25 67:1,3 73:17 92:19 109:13 121:18 133:9 (12)
shift 101:7	signed 9:12	sizable 58:15
shifting 26:17	signedup 10:2	size 39:9 52:4 92:8 104:3 (4)
shines 2:16 33:6,16 34:2 (4)	significant 32:7 37:7 51:12 58:16 70:6 76:11,15 78:16 86:6 90:4 96:12,25 102:23 (13)	sized 53:2
shop 57:8 103:9	significantly 47:11 91:1 93:12	slack 93:6
shopping 23:5 71:23	104:23 (4)	slap 38:7
shore 134:7,18 138:14	signup 9:15	slash 28:15
short 12:2 70:17 78:13,20 (4)	silent 122:15	slim 91:4
shortsighted 69:23	similar 17:11 37:14 85:2 98:11 (4)	slip 6:14
<pre>should 18:4 19:13 21:1 32:19 39:23 40:10 48:21 52:24 71:8,14 72:1 79:13 80:4 81:20 84:23,24 87:23 100:12 122:6,23,25 123:18,19 135:24 137:1,22,23 (27) shouldered 97:11 shout 132:13</pre>	simple 100:12 simply 28:9 37:25 38:17 56:9 84:6 96:15 105:19 (7) since 8:21 10:1 19:8 27:11 34:17 38:12 51:15 59:12 74:22 78:3,24 79:11 80:3 86:14 92:10 94:18 103:11 108:12 135:12 (19)	<pre>slipshot 21:8 slope 94:17 slowly 9:21 78:22 smacks 43:20 small 21:1 26:23 53:1 56:1 62:5 65:20 81:13 83:1 86:14 117:12 123:21 130:2 132:18</pre>
shoutout 22:2 82:2	sincerely 130:24	(13)
show 12:2 123:24	single 116:6 119:17	smaller 13:20 21:2 34:1
showing 24:20	site 32:1,12 52:6 60:6 121:6	smallest 34:8 78:15 132:18
shows 69:21	(5)	smart 25:4
sic 66:8 110:14	sited 53:9 59:7 79:19	smarter 25:19,19
side 55:3 69:8 83:22 117:2 (4)	sites 53:20 54:2	snow 122:19 132:12
 sidewalk 6:12 8:6 42:12 62:6 66:5 67:14 101:3 103:7 136:10 (9) sidewalks 6:23 32:3 34:22 37:16 42:9 43:14 66:2 93:3,17 	siting 39:6 44:18 53:5,7,12 56:18 59:24 62:16 73:13 80:8,10 84:24 87:2,8 96:25 97:6 104:16 132:25 (18) sitting 104:1 123:7 128:24	so 9:17,22 11:7 13:12 25:22 26:8 27:9,18 28:9,22,24 29:2 32:24 40:20 42:5,16,23 45:15 46:7 47:7 54:2 56:1 57:1 63:1,20 66:12 67:15 85:12 89:7,9 94:1 100:3 105:19

106:24 107:12,17 110:15 111:11 114:14 115:15 116:15,19,21 117:11 118:10 119:6 123:15 128:18 131:23 133:25 135:7 137:1 138:1,1 139:7 (55)	February 10, 2025 south 15:12 18:15 34:3 58:4 75:3 (5) space 17:12 52:6 67:9 73:11 103:25 104:19 111:16 136:2,4,10,25 (11)	119:11,14 (13) sro 117:5 ss 140:5
<pre>solar 31:6 sole 101:15 solution 84:17 85:10 88:9,22 90:8,24 99:12 110:21 133:22 136:22 (10) solutions 27:20,21 32:25 40:13 47:17 51:25 53:3</pre>	<pre>spaces 111:18 speak 9:11,20,21 36:14 72:20 131:22 (6) speaker 11:3,9 16:25 30:10,13,16 68:20 (7) speakers 40:21,22</pre>	<pre>stacking 23:18 staff 13:15 24:16 46:15 49:11 51:14,17 57:25 66:21 70:19 82:16,17 87:6 89:9 110:7 111:8,12 124:9 (17) staffhours 36:24 staffing 48:15 66:16 67:5</pre>
54:12,15 88:15 91:9 99:20 106:3,20 137:15 (15) solves 27:10	speaking 107:1 128:13 131:8 speaks 95:11	staging 31:5 stakeholder 137:23
some 24:15 26:15 30:1 36:5 53:22 62:2 63:7 73:11 83:14 90:13 97:17 102:15 103:8,10 105:25 117:15 118:1,9 136:22 137:2,3,8,14 (23)	<pre>special 132:13 specialty 115:20 specific 87:14</pre>	stakeholders 20:3 37:13 62:17,18 88:20 90:6 97:12 128:5 (8) standard 44:8 70:20
somebody 22:17,18 someone 14:7 46:5 someplace 22:19	<pre>specifically 11:22 19:7 65:18 97:2 118:13 130:12 (6) specify 56:16 specifying 96:24</pre>	standards 38:15 standing 53:16,18 123:13 stands 65:10 99:8
something 24:2 28:21 131:15 137:12 138:7 (5)	spend 19:11 45:9 79:4 81:17 82:11 109:10 (6)	star 133:8 starkly 96:6
sometimes 41:21,22 84:5 soon 62:20 sorry 6:2 17:2 29:17 92:12 102:5 105:9 125:16 (7)	<pre>spent 78:6 108:8 109:6 speros 20 140:8 spirit 95:16 124:23 marks 116:2</pre>	start 11:17 22:1 36:5 51:22 105:19 125:22 (6) started 51:22 52:3 117:24 starting 32:7 50:23 115:16
sort 27:14,20 sorts 124:1 sound 119:24 source 101:15	<pre>spoke 116:3 spoken 118:15 128:5 130:25 spots 59:24 spring 121:15</pre>	<pre>startup 76:10 86:24 96:12 state 35:21 86:2 114:3 140:4,9 (5) stated 17:22 44:2</pre>
sources 8:9	square 2:9 3:12 4:9 11:13,16 13:3,9 58:10 74:17,20 101:12	statement 8:18 9:24 10:1 60:21 (4)

	February 10, 2025	178
statistics 90:14	street 2:14 4:125 6:12 12:20 14:3 26:6,12 27:6 31:7,9	stuffing 119:1
stay 31:1	34:4,4,15,18 41:14 44:21,24 47:25 51:8 58:5,21 60:3 61:11	suarez 2:10 15:3,4,5,8,9 17:2 18:19 (8)
stayed 126:15	62:12 64:3,16 68:8,12 73:9 75:3,4,7 79:11 81:19 83:19	subject 8:1
step 12:13 59:2 69:19	92:13,13 97:20 98:18 103:9,12,18 104:6,7 105:6	subjected 56:3
stepping 40:1	106:24 112:17 114:18 115:22 116:14 117:13 118:4 125:5	submission 8:23
steps 107:10	137:5 (54)	submit 8:18 139:6
stewardship 95:16 98:11	streetbed 34:23	submitted 90:15 91:14
still 17:18 62:20 78:24 83:17 87:19 98:6 103:1,3 125:7	streetplus 34:17 133:9	subsequent 108:21
133:6 139:5,6 (12)	streets 6:24 8:8,14 13:24 19:11,18,23 22:12 31:2 32:19	subsidy 106:6
stolen 56:24	38:5 45:9 47:1 50:5 55:3,25 57:14 71:23 72:2 73:2,7 75:1	substantial 102:15
stone's 132:21	78:17 85:5,25 86:4 88:11 90:22 92:21 99:9 107:5	substantive 71:6 95:21
stop 28:12 56:6	112:20,23 113:13 114:11,24 115:8 116:5 (38)	successes 108:22
stopped 40:10	streetscape 66:16 69:20 80:15	successful 35:20,22 59:16
stopping 127:17	streetscapes 135:19	such 6:22 7:11 8:24 16:16
storage 8:12 17:12 32:2	strenuously 44:19	17:24 30:3 72:22 78:12 82:2 86:17 106:9 110:16 127:15
store 37:16 47:22 127:6	stretch 68:7	131:12 140:13 (15)
storefront 58:13 136:12	stretched 13:17	sufficient 23:21 25:13 54:11
storefronts 136:13	strides 32:7	suggesting 136:18
storing 83:5	strong 47:3 57:5	suggestion 138:6
stormwater 114:21	strongest 38:3	suggests 87:24
strain 16:2 56:12 102:20 104:9 (4)	strongly 37:11 106:17	suitable 39:13 41:25
strained 96:14	structural 27:13	summer 23:23
strategy 18:13 25:8	structured 99:15	sunday 22:5
strawman 27:23	struggle 86:16	sunnyside 2:16 33:6,16 34:2 (4)
streamline 54:2	students 30:8	sunset 3:7 67:20,25 68:6
streams 34:11 35:18	stuff 79:23 136:3	134:10,21 138:17 (7)
		superintendent 22:6 124:8

to Entities Engaging In Cleaning Services		
	February 10, 2025	179
supplement 12:10 55:16 82:1 116:17 120:7,9 (6)	sustainability 112:12	taxpayers' 23:6 24:23
supplemental 15:18,21 17:22	sustainable 88:21 99:14	team 34:18 69:9 92:18 110:1 130:1 (5)
31:16 32:15 46:16,22 47:4,12 48:5 49:9,23 61:19 63:25	swath 117:1	teams 14 25:15 131:13,20
65:24 71:18,20 75:20,23 76:20 78:3 79:6 82:8,12 87:10	swaths 73:25	132:7 (5)
95:2,12 100:19 101:18 102:1 124:20 127:4 (32)	sweep 92:21	technology 37:8
supplementary 28:13 43:24	sweepers 58:21	telling 117:3,7
supplementing 38:10	sweeping 6:22 34:19 69:11 133:10 (4)	tells 22:14
supplements 27:7 69:9	sweeps 13:23 37:25 44:25	tenants 77:4 117:4,7
supplies 108:14 124:1	sync 121:10	tens 19:23 45:16 51:13 96:11 (4)
supply 78:20 129:3	system 124:12 129:15,24 130:14,20 (5)	tepelus 2:12 21:21,24
supplying 45:11	t 140:2,2	term 106:9
support 13:4 15:22 24:23 25:2,17 36:5 38:3 41:6 55:25	tackling 88:11 89:19	terms 105:15
63:23 64:16 65:20 70:9 71:14,16 75:5 77:7 82:3 83:1	tailored 65:18	terrific 41:12
106:4 118:2,23 124:6 (23)	take 20:9 54:14 56:8 74:11	test 108:18
supported 119:17	81:18,21 90:5 116:7 118:2 136:24 (10)	testify 9:13,15,16,18 10:3 11:4 29:4,22 33:4 42:25
supporting 7:1 71:10	taken 107:11	46:3,6,9 47:2 85:21 92:4 119:13 132:3 134:25 135:7
supportive 28:16	takes 22:18 66:4 67:3,4 75:18	138:8,21 (22)
supports 31:17 37:11 43:12 66:9 73:8 105:14 124:24 (7)	115:21 136:9 (7)	testifying 11:8,10 61:2 100:5 139:2 (5)
supposed 27:22 35:13 56:17	taking 26:9 89:9 116:12 118:8 133:6 (5)	testimony 2:8 3:2 4:2 10:4
80:1 (4) sure 42:20 80:21 133:11	talking 115:17	21:16 41:8 54:19 90:16 91:15 94:11,19 112:5 116:25 119:7 135:8 (15)
surrounded 118:20	target 43:17	text 55:8,21
surrounding 114:24	task 27:24 60:1 97:11	than 14:7 19:9 54:4 79:4
survey 69:15	tasked 101:17 125:25	81:14 84:25 95:11 100:15 101:25 104:21 111:12 130:20
suspend 93:12	tax 101:10	136:4 (13)
suspended 121:15	taxes 123:16	thank 5:8 6:8 11:11,14 14:24,25 18:17,18,24 19:4
Sespended 121110	taxing 123:24	21:16,18 25:22 26:2,3,8 29:2,3

to Entitles	Engaging in Cleaning s	
	February 10, 2025	180
30:25 33:2,3,12	52:9,14,15,19,19,25 54:8,13	thriving 74:24
36:12,13,18,20,21 40:16,17	56:18 58:15 62:12,21 72:24	
42:23,24 46:2,4 50:13,14,21	84:3 86:9 87:2,11 88:24 91:3,5	through 9:3 14:17 16:13
54:18,20 57:18,19 60:22	93:10 94:1 97:12,13 117:6	32:10 45:18 67:5 86:4,13
64:23,24 67:17,18,22 68:25	118:24 119:23 120:18,23	89:21 97:7 101:9 104:17
72:9,10,14,19 74:14,15	121:23 127:5 129:13,22	112:13 121:4 128:24 (15)
77:17,18 81:4,5,9	133:15 136:19 137:19 (63)	
85:12,13,18,20 88:23 89:3,7,8		throughout 42:5 44:10 65:21
91:13,16,17,22 92:3 94:4,5,9	they're 27:23 56:22 101:3	66:24 93:5 100:17 112:15
99:23,24 105:3,4 107:17,20,21	111:12 124:9,13 136:21 (7)	129:1 (8)
111:24,25 115:10,11,15 116:9		
119:6,9,12 125:1,9,10	thing 73:2	throw 132:21
128:8,9,21 130:25	8	
131:4,21,21,23 132:2,5,10	things 68:5 83:20 116:18	throws 67:13
133:25 134:1 135:7 138:1,9	••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••	
139:2,11 (111)	think 33:19 41:15 52:3 66:4	tickets 103:17,23
	80:23 111:7,21 122:11 124:15	
thankless 11:19 125:23	132:11 135:21 136:14	tiedup 64:3
Hankiess 11.17 125.25	137:1,11,22 (15)	iccup 04.5
thanks 22:2 41:10 66:1	157.1,11,22 (15)	tiera 4:5 107:22,25
115:16 128:13 (5)	third 2:10 15:3,10 27:3 55:14	ucia 1.5 107.22,25
115.10 120.15 (5)	76:14 109:5 133:7,7 (9)	tightfitting 7:13 127:7
their 6:4 11:20 13:17,18 21:3	70.14 109.5 155.7,7 (9)	ugntifting 7.15 127.7
31:11 40:15 41:12 48:6	thirdly 103:24	time 9:17 10:5 14:4 20:9
49:12,17 53:6 64:11 76:6	uni ury 105.24	25:13 26:9 37:8,15 39:22
79:10 81:18 91:2 92:4 93:19	those 9:10 12:9 40:4 62:2,6	51:14 54:7,12 66:14 67:5
97:13,18 103:9 115:23	63:8 86:18 107:8 109:7 110:21	74:10 78:6,13 79:22 80:19,20
117:3,7,9,10 118:3 119:1,3,20	112:22 117:15,17,17 118:7	81:3 82:16 85:4 88:4 89:10
126:2,3 127:8,25 129:9,10	122:22 (16)	90:16 94:10 97:8 110:11 119:6
	122.22 (10)	
131:6 136:11,13 (40)	4h	121:8 126:12 129:10 130:23
4 11.20 12.11 25.4.5	though 22:24 110:13	134:14 137:19,19 138:1,8
them 11:20 12:11 35:4,5		139:13 (40)
36:10 37:16 39:19 41:24 44:14	thoughtfully 21:9	
46:19 47:8,25 49:16,17 52:6		timeframe 26:25
100:22 105:22 109:5 111:20	thousands 19:25 45:16 51:13	4
115:23 118:3 122:22 123:6	86:24 96:11 (5)	timeline 17:15 19:17 33:25
130:17 137:15,16,18,23 138:5		66:8 (4)
(29)	threat 50:2 105:1 127:9	
		timelines 87:8
themselves 6:8	threatening 120:2 129:10	
		timely 54:3
there's 35:9 42:2 62:15	threatens 31:20 73:5 99:16	
63:7,8,23 78:20 102:10 103:19		times 2:9 11:13,16 13:3,9
123:2 124:13 129:15	three 10:1 19:9 29:24 59:13	18:3,6 29:1 53:17 57:16 59:13
136:14,17 137:7 (15)	82:6 92:20 109:3 123:2 130:14	63:14 83:18 84:15 (14)
	(9)	
therefore 42:16 90:1		timing 76:23
	threeminute 10:4	
these 8:6 10:19 11:23 12:2,12		tisch 16:7 59:4
13:19 14:20 16:14,23	threeperson 82:7,17	
17:2,7,16 24:9 26:21 28:25		today 5:20 8:16,22 9:1,4,8
31:8 35:18 39:1,6,24 41:22	thrive 27:18 66:1	11:5 26:10 47:2 50:22 58:9
46:17 48:1,20,21 49:13 51:11		61:2,8 63:2,18 72:20 89:10

	February 10, 2025	181
94:12 98:12 128:5 130:25	transports 14:1	truly 27:25 28:21 29:21 31:13
131:5,19 135:9 139:3,8 (26)	-	50:6 (5)
together 9:4 14:15 22:8,18 25:8 57:14 94:2 95:18 110:23 128:15 (10)	trash 4:11 19:10 22:14,18 23:9,18 24:6,17 27:17 31:6,9,25 32:4,8 34:20,25 35:2,15 37:8,15 41:21 47:21	trump 123:4 trusted 61:17 95:4 109:17
tom 2:9 11:12,15	50:4 51:20 56:2,3,8,16 58:18,20,20 59:5,9 60:16	122:1 (4)
tons 58:18,19 118:25,25 (4)	61:23 62:1,11 64:4 66:5,10 67:6,11,12,12 69:13,18 70:19 71:20,21 72:7 73:11,15,21	try 41:23 82:21 133:21 trying 22:7 26:24 76:2 116:4
too 53:7 57:3 62:20 129:14 133:18 (5)	77:11 78:16,17,25 79:3,10 81:19 82:9 85:25 86:5 87:13,24 88:4 92:21	124:9 137:1 (6) turn 45:22
took 73:16	93:16,20,21,21 97:18 98:1,3 101:1,22 102:4,5,14 103:7,8,14	twice 35:5
top 31:1	104:24 105:16 106:2 112:17	. 10.11.21.2.20.0.47.17
topdown 95:25	113:4,11,19,21,22 114:7,16,23 115:8 116:8,9,23 117:9,9,12,21,25	two 19:11 31:3 39:8 47:17 54:11 78:23 83:9,23 121:6,9,13,19 128:24 129:18
topic 33:19 51:16	118:3,4,9,10,22 119:3 120:11 121:11 128:11,20 129:14	130:11,21 (16)
total 121:18	130:3 (115)	twowheel 136:6
totally 68:10 121:10,15	travel 53:13,15	type 20:6 24:9
tourists 45:17	treasurer 41:4	types 38:23 63:4 87:23 96:21 (4)
toward 31:17 81:24	treating 38:6	ultimate 63:12
towards 45:23 49:18 62:4,24 77:14 (5)	tree 4:8 115:14,21 116:5 (4)	ultimately 38:18 49:4
traffic 23:22 30:2 38:24 77:2,5 97:5 (6)	trees 65:22 115:22,24 116:7 (4)	unable 48:20
trafficked 15:17 30:2	tremendous 74:1 133:12	unaffected 43:19
transcript 9:5 140:13	tricks 31:3	unaffordable 23:12
transformation 74:23	tried 123:12	uncertainty 88:2
transformational 54:8	triplefamily 117:5	unclear 39:18
transit 123:6	troubling 69:25 95:23 97:24 103:19 (4)	unconscionable 45:25
transition 70:9 71:10	truck 129:21	under 13:16 76:4 82:5 102:6 108:15 127:9 (6)
transparency 106:18	trucks 31:4 47:8,24 48:2,16	undergoes 60:4
transport 23:9 31:8	(5)	undermine 43:10 99:16 121:1
transportation 97:8	true 14:14 86:21 109:17 140:13 (4)	undermines 100:15 124:23

	February 10, 2025	182
underserved 114:9	unless 44:4 79:15	135:1 136:2 138:21 139:9 (12)
understand 9:23 67:7 75:5 88:10 110:25 119:4 (6)	unmuted 125:16	used 53:13,14 106:13 123:13 131:2 (5)
understanding 12:3 25:23	unsanitary 43:14	useful 53:24
64:9 69:21 84:2 (5)	unsightly 43:13	user 108:1
understands 37:3 45:20	unsuccessful 37:14	users 66:3
understates 84:6	until 25:12 121:15 139:7	uses 108:25
undertake 31:11	unusually 14:10	using 53:15 57:16 84:1
undertaking 44:15 74:2 96:17	unwanted 17:3	108:11 129:2 136:21 (6)
undue 70:6 129:6 133:13	up 8:8 9:12 10:3,12,16 13:6 14:22 21:20 27:17 34:19 35:3	usually 131:15
unfair 77:9 85:5	40:19 41:24 42:25 44:25 50:15 58:21 64:22 67:11,19 69:12,12	valuation 101:12
unfairly 43:17 97:14	71:2 74:16 77:19 78:2,16,19 79:7 80:23 83:18 88:1 107:22 110:11 114:17 115:12 118:12	value 14:13 values 45:21
unfortunately 42:11 62:8 73:5 121:14 (4)	110.11 114.17 113.12 118.12 119:5,10 121:24 123:1,6 125:11 128:10 129:22	values 43.21 valuing 14:19
unfunded 11:24 28:18 36:7	131:8,25 133:4,6,10 136:24 (51)	variety 51:24
62:9 124:17 (5)	updated 130:11	various 65:16
uniformed 125:24 138:3	upfront 86:2	vary 92:7 101:13
unilateral 20:4	upon 6:12	vast 13:13 73:24
unilaterally 19:21	urban 97:2	vending 103:18
unintended 39:3 97:16	urge 28:22 32:23 36:10 40:2	vendor 111:10
unique 38:22	50:11 55:7 85:8 93:25 98:12,12 (10)	vendors 16:16 103:9,21 104:8
uniquely 12:4	us 14:10 20:1,18 22:8,14	(4)
unit 136:8	23:12 24:1,2 25:13 28:2,11 34:12 35:7,18 36:4 40:12	venue 35:2
united 128:16	59:15 60:5 67:10 81:16 82:3,7 83:10,10,14,16 84:7,19,24	vermin 8:6
units 31:6 121:6	85:10 90:21 93:11,19 95:7 101:19 109:17,18 110:22	version 79:25,25
university 30:8	112:22 116:21 118:2 121:8,24 124:10 127:15 129:17 131:22 132:23 (48)	versus 80:5
unjust 87:16 unknown 11:3,9 16:25 30:10,13,16 (6)	use 8:11 17:6 55:20 56:17 87:23 89:24 118:4 122:22	very 11:11,14 14:25 18:18 21:16,18 26:3 29:3 33:3 34:19 35:1,3,20 36:13 46:4 49:8 50:14 52:11 54:20 56:25

60:9,22 64:20,24 66:19 72:10 77:18 81:5 82:14 89:3 91:17 94:5 99:16,24 101:23 105:4 106:22 107:21 111:25 118:16 119:9,12 124:4,24 127:14 128:9 132:13 133:2 134:1 136:20 138:9 (51) vetted 97:7 via 13 viable 71:9 vibrant 8:13 23:16	February 10, 2025 voluntary 45:22 volunteer 112:13 125:19 126:25 127:21 129:8 130:6,12,15 (8) volunteers 112:16 116:17 126:10,17 (4) voted 79:16 vp 3:12,15 74:17 85:15 (4) wage 102:19	183 136:15 (5) we'd 83:4 105:22 116:8 118:23 (4) we'll 68:20 we're 19:16 25:1 26:18 27:15 33:19 34:8 35:12,16,22 42:6,6,7 56:17 69:4 78:10 81:25 84:25 128:16 135:10 (19) we've 19:8 51:23 73:3 78:2,22 83:22 137:18 (7)
	wages 111:9	weather 23:22
vice 3:10 50:18 72:12,16 74:19 (5)	walking 71:23	
vicinity 7:4,22 113:5	walkthrough 16:5	website 6:1 9:5 139:9
·	5	week 48:17 52:11 133:10
viewing 9:5	want 11:16,20,22 19:4 22:9 24:1,5 30:20 32:17 33:23 41:6	weekly 130:4
views 12:12	42:16 45:8 61:9 68:4 73:2 86:2 92:3 111:9 118:12 125:22	weeks 9:6 129:18,18 130:21
village 4:12 10:8 132:1	133:6 (22)	(4)
vincent 22:6	wanted 116:25 132:9	weigh 57:3
violates 124:22	wants 22:11 64:15	weight 27:15
violating 7:19	warehouses 62:3	welcome 5:3 44:18 77:3 107:14 (4)
violation 46:1 76:14	wasn't 125:16	welcoming 76:1
violations 8:2	waste 4:13 5:16 6:6 8:5,11	C
virginia 4:125 105:5	17:23,25 20:24 21:6 31:1 37:1,23,24 38:25 44:12 45:12,13 47:7 51:19 58:16,25	well 34:6,9 49:8 86:7 87:4 105:17 107:9 122:24 (8)
vision 14:22	69:10 70:10 71:11 78:9 87:14	went 125:6
visiting 122:18	98:2 106:3,14 114:8,13 115:2 125:4 135:5,11,13,24 136:23 137:21 (39)	west 58:5 65:8 69:8 75:3,4 92:12,13 123:4 (8)
visitors 58:14 69:7 71:23 76:3 86:1 93:9 (6)	waterways 6:14	wharf 6:13
vocal 133:2	way 20:5 21:13 27:10 35:16	what 17:12 23:17 24:12 63:4
voice 94:21	40:7 42:2 81:1 104:24 111:3,10,12 115:1 129:17 133:19,24 135:18 136:3,11,24	78:10 80:17 84:6,13,25 90:11 101:18 105:25 111:19 113:10 116:3 117:4 120:9 123:1,1
volume 13:1 67:7	138:5 140:17 (21)	131:1,8 132:7,16 136:17 137:18 (25)

to Entitles	Engaging in cleaning s	
	February 10, 2025	184
what's 74:10 84:8 136:18	whom 61:7	wonderful 22:4 24:10,25,25
		139:12 (5)
whatnot 117:6	why 63:8,13 116:25 124:22	
C 11	(4)	work 12:3 14:15,21 18:2
whatsoever 63:11		24:22 27:8 31:12 32:20,24
	widely 101:13	34:10,12,16,16,22 35:17,19
wheeliebins 27:22 87:25		40:10,12 41:12,23 42:6,18
96:22	will 8:17 9:2,6,10 10:18 13:19	43:18 46:18,19 49:24 50:9,13
	19:17,25 20:8 23:9,21,23	51:9 53:2 55:17 57:8,9,14
when 9:20 20:14 21:6 27:9	28:19 33:8,21 35:23 39:3	59:16 60:4 64:18 66:6 67:5,10
35:25 53:5 64:9 73:20,22 80:7	42:10 43:9 46:8 47:10,15,20	69:10,14 71:20 80:12,17 81:24
101:2 103:7 104:4,5 108:12	49:11,22 50:4 56:2 63:5,6,24	85:9 92:5 93:23 94:2 99:18
109:20 110:25 121:15 123:1,5	64:19 70:3 72:7 75:11,11	104:17 107:18 110:23 111:13
124:13,13 126:3,5 130:4 (25)	80:13,24 81:21 83:19 87:2,18 89:14,25 90:1,13,25 93:10,15	121:24 125:23 129:7,7,17,24
where 24:25 42:4 52:5 53:9		137:14,16,18,25 (65)
59:22 80:22 114:10 117:17 (8)	102:14 103:13 104:12,17,23 106:18 109:16 114:17 118:2	workable 88:15
39:22 80:22 114:10 117:17 (8)	122:9 129:19 132:23	workable 88:15
whereof 140:19	133:13,23 135:8 139:3 (64)	worked 37:12 64:13 92:23
whereor 140.19	155.15,25 155.8 159.5 (04)	111:11 124:11 (5)
whether 6:15 39:18	willfully 27:21	111.11 124.11 (3)
whether 0.15 59.18	winnuny 27.21	worker 133:14
which 9:12 11:23 16:12 17:19	williamsburg 26:14	WOIKEI 155.1 4
19:2 21:3 23:10 24:13	winamsburg 20.14	workers 69:7 76:2 86:1 98:5
26:12,20 27:3,10 41:8 45:20	winter 126:3	123:17 127:24 128:22 129:22
53:23 55:15 56:17 61:23 62:16		130:2 135:20 (10)
63:6,13 64:19 72:24 79:7	wise 32:10	130.2 133.20 (10)
82:2,6,7,12 83:13 84:20 86:23		workforce 49:7
87:10,19 89:20 92:8,20 97:3	wish 9:11,18	
98:18 101:13,23 106:12,25	Wabaa 2011,10	working 22:2 25:3 28:15
108:9 109:23 110:17 111:16	wishes 71:25 134:25 138:20	44:18 66:21 84:16 90:7 106:19
114:1 115:4,21 116:25		107:3 114:3 117:25 137:20,22
117:2,23 121:18 123:16	wishing 9:15,16	(13)
129:13 131:15 136:20 (57)		
	withdraw 112:8	works 21:11 112:10 123:9
whichever 79:18		138:7 (4)
	within 7:3,22 9:6 26:25 90:2	
while 9:14 12:11 31:17 35:19	107:20 113:5 127:12 140:9,12	world 26:1
40:6 43:19 62:1,10 66:9 69:18	(10)	
75:5 77:7 86:9,19 87:24 94:19		worst 117:15
96:23 98:4 99:21 110:6 117:17	withinentitled 140:12	
118:17 119:20 129:24 (24)		would 14:20 16:18 17:10
	without 26:21 36:9 40:15	20:1,5,18,22 23:12 31:19 35:7
whitaker 132:14	63:17,22 66:14 70:1,7 84:19	36:4 39:19 41:17 44:20 46:6
	86:15 90:23 91:1 96:16 106:21	48:2,9,18,23 50:23 52:8 53:23
who 9:11 11:19 13:6 31:21	115:1 127:25 131:17 (17)	54:14 55:22,23 56:13,18 57:3
45:17 46:15 48:4 49:11 55:16		59:18,19 60:14 62:13 64:3
66:6 85:3 87:4 89:15 91:11	witness 140:19	68:12 73:1 74:4 79:3
98:10 103:10 108:25 117:3,7		83:11,12,13,17,17 84:7,9,10,14
118:2,24 122:22 128:5	women 11:18 41:11 46:15	85:6 90:11 102:22 103:10
129:8,16 132:5 133:9 (27)	49:10,13 50:3 125:24 (7)	107:10 109:10,12 110:1 111:2
		112:21 113:16,19,24 114:9,17
wholly 63:6 76:18	won't 87:18	115:4 116:6 123:20 126:23

	February 10, 2025	185
127:13,20 131:10,18 133:18 136:24 139:5,6 (73)	you're 30:10,13 42:8	2008 34:18
wouldn't 63:16	you've 61:7 63:2	2009 74:22
writing 103:17	your 9:19,20,24,25 10:3 22:16 23:11 25:14 30:20 88:23 89:13	2017 135:14
written 8:19,20,23 9:3,9	99:23 107:12 116:20 119:6 (15)	2020 126:5
21:16 24:19 31:19 66:19 75:16 90:15 91:15 98:19 126:24	zero 4:13 14:3 135:5,13 (4)	2022 59:3 108:12 121:3
128:3 129:6 130:10 139:6 (18)	zone 114:5	2023 59:7 109:20
wrongly 101:19 103:22	zones 106:4	2024 5:19 109:10 112:14
x 2,8	zoom 131:12	2025 12 5:21 17:14 20:14 50:24 140:20 (6)
yards 3:6,11 65:2,7,9 72:13,18 (7)	211 17:8	2026 20:22 25:12 36:3
yeah 15:7 29:13 112:2 135:6 (4)	230 48:10	3600 112:16
(4) vear 16:4 17:17,19 19:12,14	247 18:8 32:5 101:6	10000 61:25
20:13,20 25:11 28:4 36:3 45:10 46:21,25 48:5,18 51:5	250 112:15	12000 102:4,5,14
54:11 58:17 72:23 76:15 78:24 82:12 123:25 (23)	300 15:15 55:2 100:9	13000 126:19
years 37:13 49:6 50:10 61:16	311 117:20	16120 112:24 113:7 115:6
62:25 73:4,12 75:18 78:1,6 82:4 84:1 92:24 95:11 100:15	324 58:18	20000 16:19
116:2 125:3 126:16 (18)	352 48:17	22000 31:9
yen 10:12,15 134:2,15 138:10 (5)	365 101:6	35000 30:8
yes 15:5 26:11 29:17 30:22,22	400 69:12	39000 109:4
43:3 67:22 81:10 91:22 132:17 (10)	550 31:8	40000 51:4
yet 17:18 54:5	600 58:22	50000 35:7 69:6
york 3 5:23 6:9 7:6 8:8,15	1000 58:18	65000 30:7
21:12 25:6 41:4 46:13 49:7 57:7,11 64:7,22 69:5,20 71:22	1100 58:13	67000 58:12
92:5,7,23,25 93:6,7 94:3,24 95:19 99:14 100:17 111:18	1202 139:13	80000 36:24
114:2 126:5 140:4,9 (34)	1986 94:18	85000 30:9
york's 38:3	1987 92:10	200000 37:1
yorker 129:2	2002 19:6	230000 58:11

250000 27.2	February 10, 2025	186
350000 27:3		
360000 34:7		