Minutes of the meeting taken by:

Marie Foley, RMR, CRR Reporter/Notary Public

1	2
2	APPEARANCES:
3	AFFEARANCES.
4	NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING
5	PRESERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT
6	100 Gold Street
7	New York, New York 10038
8	BY: ANDREW WALLACE, Associate General Counsel
9	wallaca@hpd.nyc.gov
10	
11	
12	
13	ANNMARIE SANTIAGO
14	Deputy Commissioner
15	Office of Enforcement and
16	Neighborhood Services
17	
18	JOSHUA CUCCHIARO
19	Associate Commissioner
20	Code Enforcement
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	4
2	stenographer for Magna Legal
3	Services.
4	Welcome to all.
5	First, just some
6	housekeeping.
7	This hearing is being
8	transcribed and recorded. I will
9	try to speak slowly and clearly to
10	accommodate the transcription, and
11	I ask that any speakers please do
12	the same.
13	Second, the purpose of a
14	rules hearing is for the Department
15	to receive and to listen to
16	comments by members of the public
17	on these proposed rule amendments.
18	The Department considers all
19	comments that we receive in
20	reviewing the proposed rule
21	amendments before final
22	publication.
23	This hearing is not;
24	however, a question-and-answer
25	session.

1	7
2	from more than one dwelling unit in
3	such building. For buildings
4	selected to install devices, HPD is
5	required to conduct regular
6	inspections of such buildings to
7	confirm compliance with the
8	installation and maintenance
9	requirements of the devices,
10	provision of a central heating
11	system, and the maintenance of
12	required minimum temperatures. The
13	rationale for this requirement is
14	to provide an enhanced and
15	proactive mode of enforcement to
16	promote compliance with the City's
17	minimum heating requirements in
18	those buildings that have a
19	demonstrated history of
20	noncompliance with these
21	requirements.
22	In 2023, the City Council
23	enacted Local Law 70 of 2023, which
24	amended Section 27-2033.1 to
25	require the selection of the 50

for the rest of the same heat

25

1	10
2	owners to pay a penalty to satisfy
3	violations that were issued
4	pursuant to Administrative Code
5	Section 27-2033.1 but which were
6	not corrected at the time the
7	building was eligible for
8	discharge.
9	With that background, we
10	will now proceed to any member of
11	the public who wishes to provide
12	comments.
13	I see we've been joined by
14	an individual identified as C.S.
15	C.S., would you like to make a
16	comment?
17	We also have a J.D.
18	Do either of you care to
19	make comments?
20	MR. CUCCHIARO: Andrew, I
21	think both C.S. and J.D. are HPD
22	employees.
23	MR. WALLACE: Okay.
24	Welcome. All right.
25	So, at this point, we don't

1	11			
2	have any participants from the			
3	public.			
4	So we will keep the hearing			
5	open until 11:00 a.m., as required,			
6	but I'm going to go on mute and go			
7	off camera.			
8	As I was saying to Marie, I			
9	will be here and watch if anybody			
10	comes on, but if nobody comes on			
11	beforehand, maybe we'll just			
12	reconvene 10 of, 5 of 11:00 to			
13	close the hearing properly.			
14	So, thank you all. And see			
15	you in a little while.			
16	(Whereupon, a recess was			
17	taken at this time.)			
18	MR. WALLACE: Hello,			
19	everyone.			
20	We're back on the record at			
21	the HPD hearing regarding heat			
22	sensor devices.			
23	The time is now 10:58 a.m.			
24	During the time that we were			
25	on recess, so to speak, nobody has			

1	13
2	Mary-Lynne Rifenburgh, thank you
3	very much for your assistance and
4	your guidance.
5	All right.
6	It is now 11:00 a.m.
7	As I said, there do not
8	appear to be any additional
9	commentators, so this will conclude
10	the public hearing on the
11	opportunity to comment regarding
12	Department of Housing Preservation
13	and Developments heat sensor
14	program and Internet capable heat
15	sensor devices.
16	I'd like to thank Marie also
17	for her assistance in joining us
18	this morning.
19	And thank all of you.
20	And this concludes the
21	hearing, and I wish you a very good
22	day.
23	Thank you.
24	(TIME NOTED: 11:00 A.M.)
25	

1	AND [2] - 1:5, 2:5	comply [1] - 12:16	F 15
	ANDREW [1] - 2:8	conclude [2] - 5:20, 13:9	
4 m 0.2	Andrew [2] - 3:3, 10:20	concludes [1] - 13:20	foo (4) 9:21
1 [1] - 8:3 10 [1] - 11:12	AnnMarie [2] - 3:18, 12:25	conduct [1] - 7:5	fee [1] - 8:21 final [1] - 4:21
100 [2] - 1:13, 2:6	ANNMARIE [1] - 2:13	conducted [1] - 8:22	First [1] - 4:5
10038 [1] - 2:7	answer [1] - 4:24	confirm [2] - 7:7, 8:16	FOLEY [2] - 14:5, 14:20
10:04 [2] - 1:11, 3:13	appear [1] - 13:8	consider [1] - 5:5	Foley [2] - 1:24, 3:25
10:58 [1] - 11:23	assistance [2] - 13:3, 13:17	considers [1] - 4:18	following [1] - 8:15
11:00 [6] - 5:20, 11:5,	Associate [4] - 2:8, 2:19,	context [1] - 6:2	foregoing [1] - 14:10
11:12, 12:18, 13:6, 13:24	3:4, 3:22	contributions [1] - 12:22	forth [1] - 14:9
18 [1] - 6:8	В	corrected [1] - 10:6	four [2] - 6:17, 9:23
10[1]	В	Council [1] - 7:22	10 at [2] 0.11, 0.20
2		Counsel [2] - 2:8, 3:4 criteria [3] - 6:19, 8:20,	G
_	background [1] - 10:9	9:18	
	based [2] - 6:19, 8:19	CRR [3] - 1:24, 14:5, 14:20	
2020 [1] - 6:8	Basis [2] - 5:24, 6:4	Cucchiaro [1] - 3:22	General [2] - 2:8, 3:4
2023 [2] - 7:22, 7:23	beforehand [1] - 11:11	CUCCHIARO [2] - 2:18,	given [1] - 14:11
2024 [3] - 1:10, 3:12, 8:3	beginning [2] - 8:2, 12:11	10:20	Gold [2] - 1:13, 2:6
27-2029 [1] - 6:22	blood [1] - 14:15	10.20	guidance [1] - 13:4
27-2033.1 [5] - 6:7, 7:24,	bringing [1] - 12:23	D	
9:17, 9:20, 10:5	building [6] - 6:16, 7:3,		H
27-2033.1(b)(2 [1] - 8:24	9:11, 9:15, 9:19, 10:7		
28 [2] - 1:10, 3:12	buildings [6] - 6:18, 7:3,	data [1] - 9:9	HEARING [1] - 1:7
	7:6, 7:18, 8:2, 9:6	demonstrated [1] - 7:19	hearing [12] - 3:7, 3:24, 4:7,
3	BY [1] - 2:8	DEPARTMENT [2] - 1:4, 2:4	4:14, 4:23, 5:19, 6:3, 11:4,
		Department [6] - 3:5, 4:14,	11:13, 11:21, 13:10, 13:21
30-day [1] - 9:7	C	4:18, 5:5, 6:9, 13:12	heat [10] - 3:9, 3:10, 6:25,
31st [2] - 8:19, 8:24		Deputy [2] - 2:14, 3:19	8:19, 8:25, 9:8, 9:21, 11:21,
	C.S [3] - 10:14, 10:15,	designated [1] - 9:13	13:13, 13:14
5	10:21	DEVELOPMENT[2] - 1:5,	heating [2] - 7:10, 7:17
	camera [1] - 11:7	2:5	Hello [1] - 11:18
5 44.40	capable [3] - 3:10, 6:14,	Development [2] - 3:6, 6:10	hereby [1] - 14:7
5 [1] - 11:12	13:14	Developments [1] - 13:13	hereinbefore [1] - 14:9
50 [3] - 6:11, 6:18, 7:25	care [1] - 10:18	device [4] - 6:15, 9:4, 9:10	history [1] - 7:19
7	central [1] - 7:10	devices [6] - 3:11, 7:4, 7:9,	housekeeping [1] - 4:6
<i>I</i>	certify [2] - 14:7, 14:13	8:17, 11:22, 13:15	HOUSING [2] - 1:4, 2:4
	choice [1] - 9:2	discharge [1] - 10:8	Housing [3] - 3:5, 6:9,
70 [2] - 7:23, 8:9	CITY [2] - 1:3, 2:4	discharged [1] - 9:19	13:12
	City [2] - 3:5, 7:22	duly [1] - 14:9 during [1] - 9:7	HPD [13] - 3:6, 3:16, 3:19,
Α	City's [1] - 7:16	During [1] - 11:24	6:11, 6:25, 7:4, 8:5, 8:17,
	citywide [1] - 9:13	dwelling [3] - 6:15, 7:2, 9:4	8:20, 9:7, 9:11, 10:21, 11:21
A M (4) 12:24	class [1] - 6:11	dwellings [1] - 6:12	HPD's [3] - 3:9, 3:22, 8:15
A.M [1] - 13:24 a.m [6] - 1:11, 3:13, 5:20,	clearly [1] - 4:9	3.10.1.1.90[1] 0.12	
11:5, 11:23, 13:6	close [1] - 11:13	E	1
accommodate [1] - 4:10	Code [7] - 2:20, 3:23, 6:6,	<u> </u>	
acknowledge [1] - 4:10	6:23, 8:23, 9:17, 10:4		identified [1] - 10:14
•	colleagues [2] - 3:16, 12:20	e-mail [4] - 5:15, 5:17, 12:8,	include [1] - 6:20
action [1] - 14:14	collected [1] - 9:9	12:9	includes [1] - 9:9
added [1] - 6:7 additional [1] - 13:8	comment [4] - 5:12, 10:16,	either [1] - 10:18	individual [1] - 10:14
Administrative [5] - 6:6,	12:3, 13:11	eligible [1] - 10:7	input [1] - 12:21
6:23, 8:23, 9:16, 10:4	commentators [1] - 13:9	employees [1] - 10:22	inspection [2] - 8:4, 8:22
allow [3] - 8:17, 8:20, 9:2	comments [8] - 4:16, 4:19,	enacted [1] - 7:23	inspections [4] - 7:6, 8:5,
amended [3] - 7:24, 8:4,	5:6, 5:15, 10:12, 10:19, 12:8,	end [3] - 5:10, 9:21, 12:13	8:16, 8:18
8:20	12:13	enforcement [1] - 7:15	install [2] - 6:13, 7:4
amendments [8] - 3:8,	Commissioner [4] - 2:14,	Enforcement [4] - 2:15,	installation [1] - 7:8
4:17, 4:21, 5:3, 8:10, 8:14,	2:19, 3:19, 3:23	2:20, 3:20, 3:23	installed [3] - 8:17, 9:5,
	complaints [1] - 6:25	enhanced [1] - 7:14	9:10
0.24 12.24			
9:24, 12:24 Amendments [1] - 5:25	compliance [2] - 7:7, 7:16	entered [1] - 12:2	interested [1] - 14:16

proceed [1] - 10:10 Internet [3] - 3:10, 6:13, mode [1] - 7:15 requirement [1] - 7:13 16 13:14 program [2] - 3:9, 13:14 monitoring [1] - 8:21 requirements [6] - 7:9, issued [2] - 6:23, 10:3 prominent [1] - 9:14 7:17, 7:21, 9:16, 9:20, 12:17 month [1] - 8:6 requires [1] - 6:8 morning [2] - 3:2, 13:18 promote [1] - 7:16 MR [4] - 3:2, 10:20, 10:23, rest [1] - 8:25 promulgation [1] - 12:23 11:18 proper [1] - 6:2 reviewing [1] - 4:20 multiple [1] - 6:12 properly [1] - 11:13 Rifenburgh [1] - 13:2 **J.D** [2] - 10:17, 10:21 mute [1] - 11:6 property [1] - 9:25 **RMR** [3] - 1:24, 14:5, 14:20 January [2] - 8:19, 8:24 room [1] - 9:3 **Proposed** [2] - 5:25, 6:5 joined [3] - 3:18, 3:21, Ν PROPOSED [1] - 1:7 Rule [1] - 5:25 10:13 proposed [7] - 3:8, 4:17, rule [8] - 3:8, 4:17, 4:20, joining [2] - 12:20, 13:17 5:3, 5:9, 8:14, 9:24, 12:23 4:20, 5:3, 8:11, 8:14, 9:24 Josh [1] - 12:25 need [1] - 6:20 rule-making [1] - 5:9 **protocols** [1] - 8:5 Joshua [1] - 3:22 Neighborhood [2] - 2:16, provide [6] - 6:2, 7:14, **RULES** [1] - 1:7 JOSHUA [1] - 2:18 8:14, 9:17, 9:25, 10:11 Rules [1] - 6:5 July [1] - 8:3 nevertheless [1] - 12:10 **provision** [1] - 7:10 rules [3] - 4:14, 8:12, 12:8 **NEW** [2] - 1:3, 2:4 **PUBLIC** [1] - 1:7 rules.cityofnewyork.us [1] **New** [6] - 1:14, 2:7, 3:5, K **Public** [2] - 1:25, 14:6 14.7 **public** [6] - 3:7, 4:16, 5:19, rules@hpd.nyc.gov [1] nobody [3] - 11:10, 11:25, 10:11, 11:3, 13:10 5:16 keep [2] - 11:4, 12:18 publication [1] - 4:22 noncompliance [1] - 7:20 S **Purpose** [2] - 5:24, 6:5 **Notary** [1] - 14:6 **purpose** [1] - 4:13 NOTED [1] - 13:24 pursuant [2] - 8:22, 10:4 notifies [1] - 9:15 **SANTIAGO**[1] - 2:13 languages [1] - 9:13 **number** [2] - 6:21, 8:10 **Santiago** [1] - 3:19 law [1] - 8:13 O satisfy [1] - 10:2 Law [3] - 6:8, 7:23, 8:9 season [4] - 8:19, 9:2, 9:8, 0 least [2] - 8:6, 8:7 9:22 Legal [1] - 4:2 question-and-answer [1] -Second [1] - 4:13 4:24 limited [1] - 6:20 occur [1] - 8:6 questions [2] - 5:2, 5:15 **Section** [7] - 6:6, 6:22, listen [1] - 4:15 **OF** [3] - 1:3, 1:4, 2:4 7:24, 8:23, 9:17, 9:20, 10:5 living [1] - 9:3 Office [1] - 2:15 R see [2] - 10:13, 11:14 Local [3] - 6:7, 7:23, 8:9 **ON** [1] - 1:7 select [1] - 6:11 location [1] - 9:14 **one** [2] - 7:2, 12:3 selected [7] - 6:16, 6:19, Lynne [1] - 13:2 open [4] - 5:9, 11:5, 12:13, rather [2] - 8:3, 8:7 7:4, 9:6, 9:11, 9:14, 9:18 12:18 rationale [1] - 7:13 **selection** [1] - 7:25 М **opportunity** [1] - 13:11 read [1] - 5:23 sensor [5] - 3:9, 3:10, option [1] - 9:25 receive [4] - 4:15, 4:19, 5:7, 11:22, 13:13, 13:15 **outcome** [1] - 14:16 12:7 Services [3] - 2:16, 3:21, Magna [1] - 4:2 owner [1] - 6:12 received [1] - 6:25 mail [4] - 5:15, 5:17, 12:8, owners [2] - 9:5, 10:2 recess [2] - 11:16, 11:25 session [1] - 4:25 reconvene [1] - 11:12 maintenance [2] - 7:8, 7:11 set [2] - 8:21, 14:9 Ρ record [5] - 5:8, 11:20, mandate [1] - 9:5 sign [1] - 9:12 March [2] - 1:10, 3:12 12:5, 12:12, 14:11 signed [1] - 12:6 recorded [2] - 3:25, 4:8 MARIE [2] - 14:5, 14:20 **slowly** [1] - 4:9 participants [2] - 3:15, 11:2 reflected [1] - 8:11 Marie [4] - 1:24, 3:25, 11:8, speakers [1] - 4:11 particular [1] - 9:21 regarding [2] - 11:21, 13:11 Specifically [1] - 8:13 parties [1] - 14:14 regular [1] - 7:5 marriage [1] - 14:15 State [1] - 14:6 **pay** [1] - 10:2 related [1] - 14:14 Mary [1] - 13:2 **Statement** [2] - 5:24, 6:4 penalty [1] - 10:2 relating [1] - 3:8 Mary-Lynne [1] - 13:2 stenographer [1] - 4:2 period [2] - 6:17, 9:8 remain [2] - 5:9, 12:12 matter [1] - 14:16 still [1] - 5:11 point [1] - 10:25 report [1] - 9:7 meeting [5] - 1:23, 12:2, Street [2] - 1:13, 2:6 post [1] - 9:12 12:4, 12:7, 12:12 **Reporter** [1] - 14:5 **subdivision** [1] - 6:22 preceding [1] - 6:24 Reporter/Notary [1] - 1:25 member [1] - 10:10 **submit** [3] - 5:4, 5:12, 9:6 PRESERVATION[2] - 1:5, reporting [1] - 6:14 members [1] - 4:16 **suspend** [1] - 8:18 require [3] - 7:25, 8:15, minimum [2] - 7:12, 7:17 **sworn** [1] - 14:9 Preservation [3] - 3:6, 6:10, minute [1] - 12:15 system [1] - 7:11 13:12 required [5] - 6:13, 7:5, Minutes [1] - 1:23 **proactive** [2] - 7:15, 8:18 7:12, 9:23, 11:5 minutes [1] - 5:22

York [6] - 1:14, 2:7, 3:5, Т temperature [1] - 6:14 temperatures [1] - 7:12 tenant [1] - 9:2 tenants [1] - 9:15 testimony [2] - 14:8, 14:11 **Third** [1] - 5:8 three [1] - 5:21 **TIME** [1] - 13:24 Today [1] - 3:12 today [4] - 3:17, 5:10, 12:14, 12:20 transcribed [1] - 4:8 transcript [1] - 14:10 transcription [1] - 4:10 true [1] - 14:10 **try** [1] - 4:9 twice [1] - 8:6 **two** [3] - 6:24, 8:3, 8:7 U under [1] - 9:18 unit [3] - 6:16, 7:2, 9:4 **up** [1] - 12:6 ٧ violations [2] - 6:21, 10:3 W wallaca@hpd.nyc.gov [2] -2:9, 5:18 **WALLACE** [4] - 2:8, 3:2, 10:23, 11:18 Wallace [1] - 3:3 watch [1] - 11:9 weeks [1] - 8:8 welcome [1] - 3:14 Welcome [2] - 4:4, 10:24 wish [1] - 13:21 wishes [3] - 5:21, 10:11, 12:3 witness(es [1] - 14:8 witness(es) [1] - 14:12 writing [1] - 5:4 written [1] - 5:12 Υ year [2] - 6:8, 8:2 **years** [4] - 6:17, 6:24, 8:4, YORK [2] - 1:3, 2:4